

ISSN: 2689-5072

# British Journal of Management and Marketing Studies

Volume 2, Issue 2, 2019 and  
Volume 2, Issue 3, 2019



Published by:



**African - British Journals**

[www.abjournals.org](http://www.abjournals.org)

[editor@abjournals.org](mailto:editor@abjournals.org)

**Brief Description**

Publication Name: **British Journal of Management and Marketing Studies**

Acronym: **BJMMS**

Starting Year: **2018**

International Standard Serial Number (ISSN): **2689-5072**

Publisher: **African - British Journals**

Publication frequency: **Monthly**

Journal Type: **Open Access**

Mode of Publication: **Online**

**Indexing/Abstracting/Coverage:**

- OCLC WorldCat
- Google Scholar
- Web of Science
- Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ)
- Open Academic Journals Index
- Directory of Research Journals Indexing (DRJI)
- Library of Congress, USA

**Focus & Scope**

British Journal of Management and Marketing Studies (BJMMS) is an international peer-reviewed journal published by the African – British Journals. The scopes of the Research Journal include, but not limited to Critical Management Studies (CMS), Management, Organisation Development, Business Intelligence, Financial Economics, Government Ownership, Social Security, Conflict Resolution, Constraint Management Cost, Program Management, Project Management, Quality Management, Skills Management, Direct Marketing, Consumer Behaviour, Marketing Research, Marketing Strategy, Product Development & Management, Relationship Marketing and other related topics.

**Editorial Office**

**USA:** 11923 NE Sumner St, STE 821031, Portland, Oregon, 97250, USA.

**Nigeria:** 1 Adekunle Owobi Close, Off Oladele Kadiri Close, Ogba-Ikeja, Lagos, 100218, Nigeria.

**Email:** info@abjournals.org

**Website:** <https://abjournals.org>

**Professor Aliyu Shugaba**

Vice Chancellor University of Maiduguri,  
Maiduguri-Nigeria

**Professor Mikayel Melkumyan**

President, Armenian Association for  
Earthquake Engineering, Yerevan,  
Armenia

**Professor Jacinta A. Opara**

Professor and Director, Centre for Health  
and Environmental Studies, University of  
Maiduguri, P. M.B 1069, Maiduguri-  
Nigeria

**Rev. Fr. Prof. Anthony Chiegboka**

Department of Religion and Human  
Relations, Faculty of Arts, Nnamdi  
Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra  
State, Nigeria

**Professor Tai Oluwagbemi**

Faculty of Agriculture, Department of  
Forestry and Wildlife, Kogi State  
University, Anyigba, Kogi, Nigeria

**Professor R. C. Gupta**

Consultant, RNB Global University,  
Bikaner India & Former Vice Chancellor,  
Radha Govind University, India & Former  
Pro Vice Chancellor, Nagaland Central  
University India & Visiting Prof/Scientist,  
Louis Pasteur University, France & The  
University of Arizona, USA

**Prof. Dr. Alireza Heidari**

Full Distinguished Professor and  
Academic Tenure of Chemistry & Director  
of the BioSpectroscopy Core Research  
Laboratory at Faculty of Chemistry,  
California South University (CSU), Irvine,  
California, USA & President of the  
American International Standards Institute  
(AISI) Irvine, California, USA California  
South University (CSU), Irvine,  
California, USA

**Professor Saliu Olushola Jamiu**

Department of Agricultural Economics &  
Extension, Faculty of Agriculture, Kogi  
State University, Nigeria

**Professor Elena G. Popkova**

President of the Institute of Scientific  
Communications & Professor at  
Plekhanov Russian University of  
Economics, Moscow, Russia

**Professor Peter Siyan**

Department of Economics, Faculty of  
Social Science, University of Abuja, FCT  
Abuja, Nigeria

**Dr. Surajit Ghatak**

Professor & Head, Department of  
Anatomy, All India Institute of Medical  
Sciences, Jodhpur, Rajasthan, India

**Professor, Mohamad Shehada Abu Yaman**

Dean of Business School, Talal Abu-Ghazaleh University College, Amman, Jordan

**Professor Stănilă Andreea**

Department of Food Science and Technology, University of Agricultural Sciences and Veterinary Medicine (USAMV), Cluj-Napoca, Romania

**Associate Professor V. Claire B. Salvedia**

Animal Science Department, College of Agriculture, Mindanao State University, Main Campus, Marawi City, Philippines

**Assit. Prof. (Dr.) Abd El-Aleem Saad Soliman Desoky**

Professor Assistant of Agricultural Zoology, Plant Protection Department, Faculty of Agriculture, Sohag University, New Sohag City, Sohag, Egypt

**Associate Professor (Dr.) Egbulonu Kelechukwu Godslove**

Department of Economics, Faculty of Social Sciences, Imo State University, Owerri, Imo, Nigeria

**Associate Professor (Dr.) Kofo A. Aderogba**

Associate Professor of Adult Environmental Education, Tai Solarin University of Education, Ijebu Ode, Ogun State, Nigeria

**Associate Professor (Dr.) Muhammad Akram**

Department of Eastern Medicine, Directorate of Medical Sciences, Faculty of Science and Technology, Government College University Faisalabad-Pakistan

**Ass. Professor Ayalew Abate Bishaw**

Debre Markos University Law School, Ethiopia

**Assistant Professor (Dr.) SK Manirul Haque**

Department of Chemical Engineering & Process Technology, Jubail Industrial College, Royal Commission of Jubail, Saudi Arabia

**Dr. Vishnu Narayan Mishra**

Associate Professor & Head, Department of Mathematics, Indira Gandhi National Tribal University, Lalpur, Amarkantak, Madhya Pradesh 484 887, India

**Dr. Sabah Lotfy Mohamed El-Sayed**

Assistant Professor, Department of Obstetrics & Gynecology Nursing, Faculty of Nursing, Zagazig University, Egypt

**Dr. Akintokunbo Odunayo Oluwarotimi**

Department of Management, Faculty of Management Sciences, Rivers State University, Port Harcourt, Rivers, Nigeria

**Dr. Mariam E. Fawy**

Associate Professor, Water Pollution Research Department, Environmental Research Division, National Research Centre, Cairo, Egypt

**Dr. Frans Salesman**

Institute of Health, Sciences Citra Husada Mandiri Kupang, Kupang, East Nusa Tenggara-Indonesia

**Dr. Michael A. Ikon**

Associate Professor, Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management Sciences, Nnamdi Azikiwe University

**Dr. Ofelia E. Hernando**

De Los Santos Medical Center, Quezon City, Philippines

**Rev. Fr. Dr. Dominic Obielosi**

Department of Religion & Human Relations, Faculty of Arts, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra State, Nigeria

**Dr. Faga Asom**

Department of Library and Information Science, Faculty of Education, Federal University, Lafia, Nasarawa State, Nigeria

**Rev. Dr. (Mrs) Foluke Bosede Ola**

Department of Education, Nigerian Baptist Convention, Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria

**Engr. Dr. Ihom A. P.**

Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, University of Uyo, Akwa Ibom State-Nigeria

**Dr. Innocent Ejimofor Agu**

Faculty of English and Literary Studies, Federal University Wukari, Taraba State, Nigeria

**Dr. Iwu Irenus Chinonye**

Department of Chemistry, School of Physical Sciences, Federal University of Technology Owerri, Imo State, Nigeria



**Dr. Andabai Priye Werigbelegha**

Department of Banking and Finance,  
Faculty of Management Sciences, Niger  
Delta University, Bayelsa State, Nigeria

**Dr. Roberto C. Sombillo**

Holy Angel University- Graduate School  
of Nursing, Delos Santos Medical Center,  
Manila, Philippines

**Dr. Khuram Syed Khuram Shahzad**

English Department, Iqra Post Graduate  
College, Sadiqabad, Punjab, Pakistan

**Dr. Arvind Prasad Dwivedi**

Department of Chemistry Govt. Sanjay  
Gandhi Smrati, Auto. P. G. College, Sidhi  
(M.P.) India

**Dr. K. Kalaichandran**

Lecturer cum Senior Occupational  
Therapist, Rajah Muthiah Medical College  
& Hospital (RMMCH), Annamalai  
University, Tamil Nadu, India

**Dr. Bishnu Prasad Bhattarai**

Faculty of Management, Tribhuvan  
University, Nepal

**Dr. Babalola Yisau Abiodun**

Department of Business Education,  
Federal College of Education (Special),  
Oyo State, Nigeria

**Dr. Peter Boahin**

Curriculum Development & Assessment,  
National Board for Professional and  
Technician Examinations (NABPTEx),  
Accra, Ghana

**Dr. Stanley Mgbemena**

Department of Religion and Human  
Relations, Faculty of Arts, Nnamdi  
Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra  
State, Nigeria

**Dr. Uche Nnyagu**

Department of English Languages, Nwafor  
Orizu College of Education, Nsugbe,  
Anambra State, Nigeria

**Dr. Kanayo Nwadiakor**

Department of Religion and Human  
Relations, Faculty of Arts, Nnamdi  
Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra  
State, Nigeria

**Dr. Nwankwo Chike Henry**

Department of Statistics, Faculty of  
Physical Sciences, Nnamdi Azikiwe  
University, Awka, Anambra State, Nigeria

**Dr. Eke Gift O.**

Bursary Department and Department of Accountancy, Faculty of Management Sciences, Rivers State University, Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria

**Dr. Septimi Kitta**

School of Education, Department of Educational Psychology and Curriculum Studies, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

**Dr. Omona-a Hamilton Horsfall**

Faculty of Business Administration, Department of Marketing, University of Uyo, Akwa Ibom, Nigeria

**Dr. Abdul Karim Suhag**

Department of Education, Sindh Madressatul Islam University, Sindh Pakistan

**Dr. Ethelmary .O. Dim**

Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management Science, Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University (former Anambra State University), Igbariam, Anambra State, Nigeria

**Dr. Paulo Manuel L. Macapagal**

Program Chair, School of Psychology, Arellano University, Manila, Philippines

**Dr. Bosede Olanike Awoyemi**

Consultant in the Macroeconomic and Governance Division, United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA), Addis Abba, Ethiopia & Senior Lecturer, Department of Economics, Afe Babalola University Ado-Ekiti, Ekiti State, Nigeria

**Charles S. Herrman**

Independent Scholar, Austin, USA

**Dr. Sani Isah Abba**

Researcher, Faculty of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Near East University, Northern Cyprus

**Dr. Mukasa Eldard Ssebbaale**

Faculty of Business and Management, Cavendish University Uganda, Kampala, Central, Uganda

**Dr. Mahmoud Mobaraki**

Department of Linguistics, Faculty of Humanities, Jahrom University, Jahrom, Fars Province, Iran

**Ibrahim Yerima**

Department of Biological Sciences, Faculty of Science, University of Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

**Sheila Buxani – Callao**

Nursing Service Department, De Los Santos Medical Center, 201 E. Rodriguez Sr. Blvd., Quezon City, 1112 Philippines

**Waheed Shahzad**

English Department, Swedish College of Engineering and Technology, Rahim Yar Khan, Punjab, Pakistan

**Ochogba Chukwumela Obulor**

Department of Vocational and Technology Education, Faculty of Education, Rivers State University, Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria

**Barr. Chigozie Ifeoma Nwagbara**

Faculty of Law, Nigeria Police Academy, Wudil, Kano State, Nigeria

**Agwuma Brightwell Ngozi**

Department of Science Education, Faculty of Education, Rivers State University, Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria

**Samuel Nti-Adarkwah**

Department of Education (HOD), Offinso College of Education, Offinso-Ashanti, Ghana

**Ms. Elizabeth Jumba Mukutu**

Department of Literature, University of Nairobi, Kenya

**Faruquzzaman Akan**

Faculty of Languages and Translation, King Khalid University, Abha, Asir, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

**Mark Angello C. Ganon**

Nursing Service Department and Infection Control Committee, De Los Santos Medical Center, Quezon City, Philippines

**Lucy Anning**

School of Business Administration, Zhongnan University of Economics and Law, Wuhan City, Hubei Province, P.R. China

**Wordu Chiduhiegem C. R.**

Department of Industrial Technical Education, Faculty of Vocational and Technical Education, Ignatius Ajuru University of Education, Port Harcourt; Rivers State, Nigeria

**William Kwabena Nantwi**

Department of Art Education, Offinso College of Education, Offinso-Ashanti, Ghana



# Table of Contents

www.abjournals.org

---

## Volume 2, Issue 2, 2019

### **Intellectual Capital (IC) and Competitive Advantage in selected Pharmaceutical Firms in South-East Nigeria**

*Dr. Ikon Michael A., U. O. Ochumba.* 1-12

### **Change Management and Organizational Innovation in Selected Manufacturing Firms in Awka, Anambra State, Nigeria**

*Dr. Ikon Michael A., Dr. Onwuchekwa Faith C., Ezeaku C.U.* 13-29

### **Impact of Innovativeness on Organization Agility of Food and Beverage Firms in Rivers State, Nigeria**

*Felix M.O., Hamilton D.I.* 30-40

### **The Impact of the Seeds Already Implanted by “Talal Abu-Ghazaleh Organization” on the Organization’s Performance**

*Prof. Mohamad Shehada, Dr. Muntaha Bani Hani.* 41-52

### **Effect of Employee Training on Performance of Selected Multinational Corporations in Nigeria**

*Dr. Dim Ethelmary, Emeakayi Hope Chizoba, Arua Nneka Maria.* 53-71

---

## Volume 2, Issue 3, 2019

### **Management Succession and Organizational Goal Attainment of Selected Private Hospitals in Anambra State**

*Dr. Ethelmary Dim, Rev. Sis Eugenia Ofordeme.* 1-12

### **Using the DART Model of Value Co-Creation to Predict Customer Loyalty in Pension Fund Administration in Nigeria**

*Ojiaku Obinna Christian, Nwatu Basil Chibuike, Aghara Vincent Nnamdi.* 13-26



## INTELLECTUAL CAPITAL (IC) AND COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE IN SELECTED PHARMACEUTICAL FIRMS IN SOUTH-EAST NIGERIA

**Dr. Ikon Michael A. and U. O. Ochumba**

Department of Business Administration, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka Nigeria.

**ABSTRACT:** *Intellectual capital is a key human resource contributor to any organization's survival if properly harnessed. The broad objective of the study was to ascertain the extent of relationship that exists between Intellectual Capital (IC) and Competitive Advantage in selected pharmaceutical Firms in South-East Nigeria. The study adopted a survey research design. Population of the study was 1120 employees and sample size 295 employees derived by using Taro Yamane's formula. Pearson's Product Moment Correlation coefficient was used in data analysis. Findings indicated that employee competence had a significant positive relationship with organizational learning capability in the selected Pharmaceutical Firms in South-East Nigeria (cal.  $r = 0.793 > \text{crit. } r = 0.138$ ). The study concluded that intellectual capital plays a major role and significantly impacts on competitive advantage of the studied firms, and recommended to the management of the studied firms to focus on the competence level of prospective employees while recruiting as this would make them fit into the organization and job seamlessly and increase their learning capability.*

**KEYWORDS:** Competitive Advantage, Employee Competence, Intellectual Capital (IC), Organizational Learning, Human Resources

## INTRODUCTION

### Background of the Study

The global and national business environment has over the past few years been more concerned with the intangible assets of human resources and information and communication technology. Ekwe (2013) captures it thus: "the global economy has for the past few decades witnessed gradual transition from industry based environment which has a focus on physical assets such as factories, plants, machines and equipment to a high technology, information and innovation based environment, which focuses on the expertise, talents, creativity, skills, dedication and experience of people in the organization's intellectual capital base".

Human resource as an intangible asset has continued to play sterling roles in organizations continued existence. Iswati & Anshori (2007) opine that human being has become the central attention in the twentieth century. In the last few decades, the prominence of human resource has increased tremendously specifically in the developed countries. This is because the world at large has experienced a drastic change in the form of emerging wealthy business and nations (Arenas & Lavandors 2008). Both companies and government have shifted their focus from tangible assets to intellectual capital for sustainable competitive advantage of business and nation (Sarmadi, 2013).

---

## **Statement of the Problem**

Observation from the studied pharmaceutical firms showed that the firms seem to be laying more emphasis and placing more importance on their production equipment, on its recency, digitalization and production capacity. They seem not to care much about the competencies of the operational staff in terms of their skills, experience and knowledge in handling the machines and in their ability to learn new things and to unlearn old and outdated skills. This seem to affect the organizational learning capability (OLC) and organizational innovative capability (OIC) as the operatives and other lower level staff appear to be finding it difficult to learn and develop new skills, acquire new knowledge and experience.

## **Objective of the Study**

The broad objective of the study was to ascertain the extent of relationship that exists between intellectual capital (IC) and competitive advantage in selected pharmaceutical firms in south-east Nigeria. The specific objective is:

To examine the extent of relationship that exists between employee competence and organizational learning capability (OLC) in the selected pharmaceutical firms in South-East Nigeria.

## **Research Question**

What is the extent of relationship that exists between employee competence and organizational learning capability (OLC) in the selected pharmaceutical firms in south-east Nigeria?

## **Hypothesis**

**H<sub>0</sub>:** Employee competence has no significant relationship with organizational learning capability (OLC) in the selected pharmaceutical firms in South-East, Nigeria.

## **Scope of the Study**

The study focuses on studying the relationship that exists between Intellectual Capital (IC) and Competitive advantage in AC drugs Limited, Enugu, Enugu state, Juhel Nigeria Limited Enugu, Enugu state, Pestow Laboratory Nigeria Limited, Aba, Abia State, Guaze Pharmacy and Laboratory, Enulfite, Anambra and Rico Pharmaceutical.

## **Limitations of the Study**

The lukewarm attitude of the respondents to collect and respond to questions on the questionnaire proved a major stumbling block as it delayed the speedy completion of the work. Persuasion and provision of relevant documents convinced the respondents that the work was purely for academic purpose and that their identity would not be disclosed.

---

## **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**

### **Intellectual Capital (IC)**

Intellectual Capital (IC) as a term has over the years gathered momentum in terms of being studied and talked about, but it has not yet been able to have a generally acceptable definition as many authors, scholars and researchers have defined it differently. Engstrom, Westnes and Westnes (2003) state that various studies have made attempt at providing one acceptable definition for IC but have not yet succeeded and as such there is no generally agreed definition. Review of related literature has proved that despite similar composition of knowledge and its contribution, there is no one consistent definition of IC (Ahanger 2011, Bontis, Keow & Richardson, 2000). While there are plenty of generic definitions of IC, there is so far no generally accepted definition or classification (Maaloul & Z'eghal 2010, OECD 2006). These earlier promoters describe IC as 'profit derived from knowledge' while Roos, Dragonetti & Edvison (1997) view it as the totality of knowledge translated into trademark, processes and also brands.

### **Competitive Advantage**

Competitive advantage has over the years been used as a yardstick for measuring performance of organizations. It can also be used to predict how long a firm will last in a business environment. Porter (1995) states that competitive advantage is the extent to which a company is able to have a dominant position superior to its competitor by creating and maintaining value for its customers. It includes capabilities that allow company to distinct itself from its competitors (Tracey & Lim 1999).

### **Organizational Learning Capability (OLC)**

OLC is defined as the organizational and managerial characteristics or factors that facilitate the organizational learning process or allow an organization to learn (Chiva, Alegre & Lapidra 2007). Jones (2000) states that organizational learning is a managerial procedure of development of new ideas that improves capabilities of employees in order to boost organizational competitive advantage. It is the process of retaining of employees in order to boost organizational competitive advantage. In the process of retaining vital knowledge within an organization, management should not only rely on talent retention strategy, but translation of knowledge into organizational change and learning, thereby leading to sustainable competitive advantage (Fam, Mitchell, Abey Suriya & Meek, 2013). Gorelick (2005) posits that organizational learning is the ability of an organization as a whole to detect errors and correct them as well as change in knowledge and values of the organization so that new skills for problem-solving and new capacity for jobs can be created.

### **Intellectual Capital and Firm Competitiveness**

Organizations competitive edge can be obtained through its resources or processes to achieve its mission and vision as opined by Amit and Schoemaker (1993) who state that a firm's competitive capability is "its capacity to deploy resources, usually in combination, using organizational processes" to achieve a strategic objective. In extant literature it has been established that such capabilities are critical to the pursuit of competitive advantage (Teece, Pisano & Shuen 1997). An organizational capability in establishing competitive advantage

emanates from the intellectual strength of its human resources as expressed by Amit and Schoemaker (1993).

### **Theoretical Framework**

This work was anchored on the Resource-based view (RBV) credited to Penrose (1959) and further developed by other scholars including Wenerfelt (1984) and Barney (1991) which later resulted in Resource-Based Theory (RBT). This theory is an important framework through which firm's competitive advantage and performance is explained and predicted using firm's imitable resources (Barney, Ketchen & Wright, 2011, Vorhies & Morgan 2005). This theory was largely to diffuse the dominance of the competitive forces' analysis of firm strategy (Bontis 2002). The central point of the RBV is that resources help to create advantage competitively.

### **Empirical Review**

Ekwe (2013) carried out a study on the effect of Intellectual Capital on employee's productivity of banks in developing economies: The Nigeria Experience. The study used the value-added Intellectual Coefficient (VAIC) model to investigate the effect of the Intellectual Capital indices (i.e. Human Capital Efficiency, Structural Capital Efficiency and the Capital Employed Efficiency) on the employee productivity on banks in Nigeria. Data were collected from the annual reports of six banks and analysis method was adopted to test the hypothesis. SPSS version 17.0 was used for the analysis. The study revealed that there was a significant positive relationship between competent of VAIC and employee productivity of the banks in Nigeria (VIAC coefficient = 1.186,  $R^2 = 0.806$ ,  $R^2 t = 0.49$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). The study concluded that indeed intellectual capital has positive and significant effect on employee productivity of banks in Nigeria.

Olunifesi and Bontis (2012) studied telecommunications companies in Nigeria using intellectual capital as a strategic resource for creating competitive advantage. A previously published research instrument was administered and survey data were collected from 320 managers in 29 telecommunications companies. Hypotheses related to the relationship of human, structural and customer capital and its influence on business performance were tested. Results indicated that Nigerian telecommunications companies have mostly emphasized the use of customer relationship management to boost their business performance.

## **METHODOLOGY**

### **Research design**

Survey research design was adopted by this study. This method allowed the opinions of respondents to be sampled through questionnaire instrument.

### **Area of study**

The area of this study was conducted in the South East region of Nigeria which is made up of five states of Abia, Anambra, Ebonyi, Enugu and Imo state.

### Population of the study

The population of the study consists of the employees of the studied companies. The companies have a total staff of one thousand one hundred and twenty (1120) employees. The distribution is given in the table below:

**Table 1: Population Distribution**

S/N	State	Organization	Population
1	Enugu	AC Drugs Limited	105
2	Enugu	Juhel Nigeria Limited	357
3	Abia	Petsow Laboratory Nigeria Limited	270
4	Anambra	Gauza Pharmacy and Laboratory	101
5	Anambra	Rico Pharmaceutical and Industry Ltd	287
<b>Total</b>			<b>1120</b>

*Source: Human Resource Department of the firms.*

### Sample Size and Sampling Technique

The population of the study was pruned down (sample) using Taro Yamane's statistical formula. The formula is given below:

$$n = \frac{N}{1+(Ne)^2}$$

Where: n= sample size. N = population size (1120). e= error limit (0.05)

$$n = \frac{1120}{1+ 1120(0.05)^2}$$

$$n = 295$$

To share copies of questionnaire in proportion commensurate to the population of the firms, Bowley's formula was used. The formula and calculation are given below:

$$nh = \frac{nNk}{N}$$

Where: n = total sample size. Nh= number of items in each stratum in the population. N= population size.



**AC Drugs Limited:** 28. Juhel Nigeia Limited: 94. Petsow Laboratory Nigeria Limited: 71. Guaze Pharmacy and laboratory: 27. Rico Pharmaceutical and industry Ltd: 75.

### Source of Data

Data for the study were sourced through both primary and secondary source. The primary source used was questionnaire instrument while the secondary source used was journal articles and materials, text books and internet sources.

### Description of Data Collection Instrument

Questionnaire instrument was used in the study. The instrument was coded in a five point Likert scale format. The code used is as follows: Strongly Agree(5), Agree (4), Undecided (3), Disagree (2) and Strongly Disagree (1). A sample of the questionnaire is attached in Appendix.

### Procedure for Data Collection

The appropriate copies of questionnaire were distributed by the researchers to the respondents to ensure those targeted got them. The collection was also handled by the researchers as this method ensured that all or most of the copies given out were collected.

### Validity of Instrument

The instrument was subjected to face and content validity by relevant authorities and experts. Validators from Education Foundation Department of Nnamdi Azikiwe University were consulted to ensure that the questionnaire items are in tandem with the research variables and are enough to capture and measure the variables appropriately.

### Reliability of the Instrument

To test the consistency level of the instrument, the questionnaire was subjected to Cronbach Alpha technique. The benchmark for acceptance is put at 0.7. that is, any reliability coefficient from 0.7 and above should be accepted as being reliable. The result obtained from the test is shown in the table below:

**Table 2: Reliability statistics**

Cronbach's Alpha	No of Items
.903	10

*Source: Field Survey, 2017*

*Computation: SPSS ver. 20*

From the result obtained above (.903), the questionnaire was certified reliable and consistent enough for eliciting data for the research.

### Method of Data Analysis

The data collection was analysed using Pearson's Product Moment Correlation Coefficient. This is occasioned by the fact that the study seeks to identify the extent of relationship that

exist between the dependent and independent variables of the study and correlation analysis is well suited for this. A 5% level significance was used.

### Decision Rule

The level of significance used is 0.05, this guided the decision to be made, if the p-value obtained is less than .05, the alternate hypothesis should be accepted, if not, the null hypothesis will be accepted.

**Table 3: Correlation Interpretation**

Value of Coefficient	Relation Between Variables
0.7-1.00	Very strong Correlation
0.50-0.69	Sustantial Correlation
0.30-0.49	Moderate Correlation
0.10-0.29	Low Correlation
0.01-0.09	Negligible Correlation

Source: Alwadael (2010) Employee's perception of, and satisfaction with, performan appraisal. "International Journa of Service Industry management". 14(2), 17-33.

### Data Analysis

**Table 4: Questionnaire distribution analysis**

S/N	Organization	Questionnaire Distributed	Questionnaire Returned	Questionnaire Analyzed
1	AC Drugs Limited	28	25(89%)	25(89%)
2	Juhel Nigeria Limited	94	87(92%)	83(88%)
3	Petsow Laboratory Nigeria Ltd	71	60(85%)	57(80%)
4	Guaze Pharmacy & Laboratory	27	23(85%)	23(85%)
5	Rico Pharmaceutical and Industry Ltd	75	72(96%)	70(93%)
	<b>Total</b>	<b>295(100%)</b>	<b>267(91%)</b>	<b>258(87%)</b>

Source: Field Survey, 2017

### Research Question Analysis

Research question one:

**What is the extent of relationship that exists between employee competence and Organizational Learning Capability (OLC) in the selected Pharmaceutical firms in South-East Nigeria?**

**Table 5: range of scores for employee competence**

Range of Scores	N	Percentage	Remark
5-14	210	81.4	Poor score on employee competence
15-25	48	18.6	Good scores on employees cometenace
<b>Total</b>	<b>258</b>	<b>100(%)</b>	

*Source: Field Survey, 2017*

Table 5 shows the range of scores for employee competence, from the table, it revealed that 210 respondents (81.4%) scored poor on the construct while 48 respondents (18.6) had a good score on the construct.

**Table 6: Range of scores for organizational learning capability**

Range of Scores	N	Percentage	Remark
5-14	37	14.3	Poor scores on organizational learning capability
15-25	221	85.7	Good scores on organizational learning capability
<b>Total</b>	<b>258</b>	<b>100(%)</b>	

*Source: Field survey, 2017*

Table 6 depicts the range of scores for Organizational Learning Capability (OLC). The table indicated that 37 respondents (14.3%) scored poor on the OLC while 221 respondent (85.7) had a good score on the OLC. Correlation analysis for employee competence and Organizational Leaning Capability (OLC)

**Table 7: Correlation Analysis for Hypothesis One**

Correlations

	EMPCOM	OLC
Pearson Correlation		.793***
EMPCOM sig. (2-tailed)		.000
N	258	258
Pearson Correlation	.793***	1
OLC Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
N	258	258

*\*\* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed)*

*Source: questionnaire responses from field survey, 2017*

### Keys:

EMPCOM: Employee Competence

OLC: Organizational Learning Capability



Table 7 shows the correlation analysis carried out on employee competence and OLC in the selected Pharmaceutical firms in south-east Nigeria. The correlation coefficient obtained was .793 indicating a strong positive relationship.

### Test of Hypothesis

**H<sub>0</sub>:** Employee competence has no significant relationship with Organizational Learning Capability in the selected Pharmaceutical firms in South-East Nigeria.

**Table 8: Significance Test of Hypothesis**

N	Cal. r	DF	Crit. R.	Remark
258	0.793	256	0.138	Significance

*Source: Field Survey, 2017*

Table 8 shows the test of significance for hypothesis. It showed that at .05 level of significance and at 256 degrees of freedom, that the critical  $r$  is .138. Given that the calculated  $r$  .793 is greater than the critical  $r$  (cal.  $R$ ,  $.793 > \text{crit. } r$ , .138). The research hypothesis is therefore accepted and it is stated that employee competence has a significant relationship with Organizational Learning Capability in the selected Pharmaceutical Firms in South-East Nigeria.

### SUMMARY OF FINDING

Test of hypothesis showed that employee competence has a strong significant positive relationship with OLC in the selected pharmaceutical firms in South-East Nigeria with a correlation of .793 (cal.  $r$ ,  $.793 > \text{crit. } r$ , .138). This result supports prior studies of Moghadan, Zabihi, Kargaran and Hakimzadeh (2013) who examined the relationship between intellectual capital and organizational learning capability (OLC) and the results from the study showed that human capital and structural capital which employee competence is part of have a significant relationship with organizational learning capability.

### CONCLUSION

In conclusion, going by the findings, the study makes bold to say that intellectual capital plays a major role and significantly impacts on competitive advantage of the studied firms. This buttresses the point that intellectual capital positively and significantly relates to competitive advantage in the studied firms.

### RECOMMENDATION/ADVOCACY

Management of the studied firms should focus on the competence level of prospective employees while recruiting and to also from time to time engage the employees in training,

workshop, job rotation and knowledge sharing exercise as these would increase the Organizations' Learning Capability and help carve out a competitive niche for the firms.

## REFERENCES

- Ahangar, R. G. (2011). The Relationship between Intellectual Capitals and Financial Management: An Empirical Investigation in an Iranian company. *African Journal of Business Management*, 5(1), 88-95.
- Alwadael, S.A (2010). Employee's Perception of, and Satisfaction with Performance Appraisal. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 14(2), 17-33.
- Amit, R. & Shoemaker, P.J.H (1993). Strategic Assets and Organizational Rent. *Strategic Management Journal*, 14 (1), 647-659.
- Arenas, T & Lavanderos, L (2008). Intellectual Capital: Object or Process? *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 9(1), 77-85.
- Bassey, J.B. (1991). Firm Resources and Sustained Competitive Advantage. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99-120.
- Bontis, N. (2002). There is a Price on Your Head: Managing Intellectual Capital Strategically, *Business Quarterly*, Summer, 40-47.
- Bowley, A.L. (1926). *Measurements of Precisions Attained in Sampling*. Amsterdam: Bull International Statistical Institute.
- Chiva, R. Alegre, J. & Lapiedra, R. (2007). Measuring Organizational Learning Capability Among the Workforce. *International Journal of Manpower*, 28, 224-242.
- Cronbach, L.J. (1951). Coefficient Alpha and the Internal Structure of Tests. *Psychometrika*, 16(3), 297-334.
- Ekwe, M.C. (2013). Effect of Intellectual Capitals on Employee Productivity of Banks in Developing Economies: The Nigeria Experience. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 4(11), 139-148.
- Engstrom, T.E.J, Westnes, P. & Westnes. S.F. (2003). Evaluating Intellectual Capital in the Hotel Industry. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 4(3), 287-303.
- Fam. D. Mitchell, C. Abey Suriya, K. & Meek, T (2013). Facilitating Organizational Learning to Support Decision Making and Planning for Sustainability in the Water Sector. *Water Policy*, 15(6), 1094-1108.
- Gorelick, C. (2005). Viewpoint Organizational Learning vs the Learning Organization: A Conversation with a Practitioner. *The Learning Organization*, 12(4), 383-388.
- Iswati, S & Anshori, M. (2007). *Management Accounting* 7<sup>th</sup> ed, Singapore: South Western, Thompson Learning Inc.
- Jones, G.R (2000). *Organizational Theory*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed, New York: Prentice-Hall.
- Maaloul, A and Zeghal, D. (2010). Analyzing Value added as an Indicator of Intellectual Capital and its Consequences on Company Performance. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 11(1), 39-60.
- Moghadam, S.K. Zabihi, M.K., Kargaram, M, Hakimzadeh, A. (2013). Intellectual Capital and Organizational Learning Capability. *Journal of Soft Computing and Applications*, 1-9.
- Olunifesi, A.S. & Bontis, N (2012). Managing Intellectual Capital in Nigerian Telecommunications Companies. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 13(2), 262-282.
- Penrose, E.T. (1959). *The Theory of the Growth of the Firm*. New York: John Wiley.
- Porter, M.E. (1995). Towards a New Conception of the Environment Competitiveness Relationship. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, (Fall 1995).



- 
- Roos, J. Roos, G, Dragonetti N. & Edvinson, L. (1997). *Intellectual Capital: Navigating the New Business Landscape*. London: MacMillian Business.
- Sarmadi, S. (2013). Investigating of Relationship between Intellection Capital and Financial Performance of Petrochemical Companies listed in Tehran Stock Exchange. Retrieved from <http://www.ssm.com/abstract=2251620>.
- Teece, D.J, Pisano, G. & Shuen, A. (1997). Dynamic Capabilities and Strategic Managemnt. *Strategic Manageemnt Journal*, 18(7), 509-533.
- Vorhies, D.W & Morgan, N.A (2005). Benchmarking Marketing Capabilities for Sustainable Competitive Advantage. *Journal of Marketing*, 69, 80-94.
- Wenerfelt, B.(1984). A Resource-based View of the Firm. *Strategic Management Journal*, 5(2), 171-180.



## APPENDIX

### Sample Questionnaire

**Instruction:** Please tick ( ☐ ) in the box provided as it best represent your thought or view

S/N	Questionnaire Items <i>Employee Competence</i>	SA (5)	A (4)	UD (3)	D (2)	SD (1)
1	I am familiar with the way things are done because I am used to it before coming to this organization.					
2	I am experienced with the kind of equipment that is used in my organization.					
3	With the knowledge I have about the kind of machines being used here, my work is less stressful.					
4	I have acquired knowledge on my own about these equipment before I was employed in this firm.					
5	Before coming to this organization, I have worked in similar organization before.					
6	It is easier for me to learn new things faster because I have the knowledge needed.					
7	My organization will perform better if the employees can adopt new way of doing things.					
8	My ability to learn is influenced by the level of skills I have in that area.					
9	When I am thought how to do things better, it is easy for me to learn and understand.					
10	I do not have problem in learning new techniques					



## **CHANGE MANAGEMENT AND ORGANIZATIONAL INNOVATION IN SELECTED MANUFACTURING FIRMS IN AWKA, ANAMBRA STATE, NIGERIA**

**Dr. Ikon Michael A., Dr. Onwuchekwa Faith C. and Ezeaku C.U.**

Department of Business Administration, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka Nigeria.

**ABSTRACT:** *This study examined the influence of Change Management on Organizational Innovation with particular reference to selected manufacturing firms in Awka. The study seeks to find out specifically the relationship between Environmental-adaptability and product innovation. The study is anchored on Three Steps Change Theory by Kurt Lewin. Survey research design was adopted. The population of the study is four hundred and eighteen (418) and complete enumeration was adopted. Pearson's Product Moment Correlation was used for data analysis. The findings revealed that there was significant positive relationship between environmental-adaptability and product innovation. The study recommends that focused manufacturing firms should always try to improve their products using innovations that are environmental adaptive.*

**KEYWORDS:** Change Management, Organizational Innovation, Product Innovation, Environmental Adaptability, Nigeria

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **Background of Study**

Most organizational managers today would agree that change has become a constant phenomenon which must be attended to and managed properly if an organization is to survive. Changes in technology, the market place, information systems, the global economy, social value, workplace demographics and the political atmosphere all have significant effect on the processes, products and service produced. The culmination of these forces has resulted in an external environment that is dynamic, unpredictable, demanding and often devastating to those organizations which are unprepared or unable to respond (Burnes, 2004). While change is a constant experience, knowledge and awareness about many of the critical issues involved in the management of such change is often lacking in those responsible for its progress.

Change Management refers to any approach to transitioning individuals, teams and organizations using methods intended to re-direct the use of resources, business process, budget allocations or other modes of operation that significantly reshape a company or organization. Organizational change management considers the full organization and what needs to change. Ansoff and McDonnell (1990), state that change arises out of the need for organizations to exploit existing or emerging opportunities and deal with threats in the market.

Change Management emphasizes the need for the change management plans and strategies to be formulated within the context of overall organizational strategies and objectives and to be responsive to the changing nature of the organization's external environment. It is an approach which requires interpretation and adaptation by practitioners to ensure that most suitable fit



between business strategies and plans. Thus, the overall themes of change management are the integration of all institutional functions, adherence to broad organization goals and responsiveness to the external environment (Armstrong, 2009).

Change Management is a systematic approach to dealing with change, both from the perspective of an organization and on the individual level. For organization changes, we can define change management as “activities involved in (1) defining and instilling new values, attitudes, norms, and behaviors within an organization that support new ways of doing work and overcome resistance to change; (2) building consensus among customers and stakeholders on specific changes designed to better their needs; and (3) planning, testing and implementing all aspects of the transition from one organizational structure or business process to another” (Pittaway, 2005).

The term, Innovation, dates from the 16<sup>th</sup> century, and is derived from the Latin, *innovatus*, “to renew or change”. In today’s business environment, to innovate is essential for survival; constantly evolving technologies and market dynamics ensure that stasis or inertia are certain to result in obsolescence. Innovation has been studied through the lenses of economics, engineering, political science, sociology and other fields. From the organizational perspective, Innovation is defined as the successful introduction of new thing or method. Innovation is the embodiment, combination, or synthesis of knowledge in original, relevant, valued new product, processes or services (Luecke & Katz, 2003). Innovation is widely regarded as a critical source of competitive advantage in an increasingly changing environment (Dess and Picken, 2000). According to management scholars, innovation capability is the most important determinant of firm performance (Mone, McKinley, Barker, 1998). In Cox, Annette, Rickard, Catherine, Tamkin, & Penny (2012) research, innovation means, renewal in structure, process or borders of one organization by purpose of access to thrift in use of workplace or capital source and or improved ability for satisfying customer needs, for example; teaming, diversifying staff skills and management system. Innovation includes the new methods of the management, new organization, new market concepts and new firms (Battisti and Stoneman, 2010).

Choopani, Zare, Mojtaba, & Aghil (2012) express three dimensions of Organizational Innovation that include; production innovation, process innovation and administrative innovation. Since Organizational Innovation involves changes, firms equally employed change management strategies to handle the inherent distortions embedded in the change process.

The manufacturing industry plays a vital role in the Nigeria economy and also in the lives of the people. The manufacturing industry is an organization that is motivated by a number of factors to utilize input like raw-materials, land and man-power in the production of physical or tangible products for their consumer satisfaction.

Juhel Nigeria Limited is a pharmaceutical company for production of antibiotic and anti-infectives, analgesics, vitamins and minerals, cough and cold preparations, cardiovascular and anxiolytics, antimalarial and anti-diabetics, antihistamines, antacids, anti-flatulents and table drinking water. The company maintains high quality standard in all its operations. With high production capacity, the policy thrust is to continue to provide cost-effective, affordable, local alternatives of life saving drugs to the teeming population. Juhel Nigeria Limited is also in the downstream petroleum product market. It has its corporate Headquarters and manufacturing plant for oral drugs at Enugu State Nigeria and manufacturing plant for other drugs (infusion injections and ear/eye drop) at Awka Anambra State.

Millennium Industries Limited is a domestic and industrial plastic company a subsidiary of St Michael Group. They are into the production of plastic chair, stool, tray waste basket, kitchen utensils and household appliances.

### **Statement of the Problem**

The quest to meet customer's ever-changing demand and taste, innovations in processes, procedures and operation have become inevitable so as to position the organization to compete favorably with its competitors and remain in business, in the ever-increasing dynamic business world. This requires various degrees of change in organizational procedures, processes, technologies and operations. However, the resistance to change by humans (the desire to maintain status quo) usually conflicts with such organizational intentions. This conflicting interest of employees with organizational policies has been the bane of change management. Thus, managing such change have become a subject of intense contemporary discuss, as it has proved intractable in some situations, especially for manufacturing industries, leading to organization breakdown. The focused firms have experienced various problems that range from resistance to changes brought by innovation of product, process and administration. However, in spite of all the improvement that are aimed at embracing the inevitable change, the workers in the focused firms find it difficult to adapt to the changes that was brought on by the innovation. It is against this backdrop that the researchers wish to assess the relationship that exist between these organizational variables and hence, to advance appropriate change management strategies which could be deployed by manufacturing firms, with a view to optimizing organizational innovations and better positioning, to compete favorably with its competitors, without necessarily leading to organizational breakdown.

### **Objective of the Study**

The broad objective of the study is to examine the influence of Change Management on Organizational Innovation with particular reference to selected manufacturing firms in Awka.

The specific objective of the study is:

- To determine the relationship between the management of Environmental-Adaptability and Product Innovation in selected manufacturing firms in Awka.

### **Research Question**

Following the objective of the study the following research question applies:

- What is the relationship between Environmental-Adaptability and Product Innovation in selected manufacturing firms in Awka?

### **Hypothesis**

For the purpose of this study, the following hypothesis is formulated and shall be tested:

H<sub>0</sub>: There is no significant relationship between environmental-adaptability and product innovation in selected manufacturing firms in Awka.



---

### **Significance of the Study**

The entire study is important as it shall contribute to existing scholarly knowledge in Change Management and Organizational Innovation. The study will be of relevance to researchers, students and manufacturing firms. The result will help enlighten management of various organizations of the influence of change management strategies on organizational innovation. It will also serve as a reference point for further studies.

### **Scope of the Study**

The study is focused on Change Management and Organizational Innovation in the selected manufacturing firms in Awka. The manufacturing firms selected for this study are Juhel Nigeria Limited and Millennium Industries Limited.

### **Limitations of the Study**

The study experienced drawbacks due to uncooperative attitude of the employees. The researchers mitigated by revisiting the companies several times and convincing the employees on the need to assist in completing the questionnaire.

## **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**

### **Conceptual Review**

#### **Change Management**

Organizational change is seen as a necessary concept for organizations to compete in the ever changing and competitive business environment. The rapid development of information and communication technology has prompted many organizations to actively seek for new ways, ideas and creative solutions in improving their current product, process, system and technology which is referred to as organizational change. Change Management in organizations are now shifted from being the responsibility of an internal or external change agent dedicated to its implementation and management to increasingly being identified as a core competency for most organizational leaders (Doyle, 2002).

Change Management is an approach to shifting or transmitting individuals, teams and organizations from current state to a desired future state, it is an organizational process aimed at helping change stakeholders to embrace changes in their business environment. Organizational change involves both managing the change processes and handling human issues at the local level (Kanter & Dretler, 1998). The purposes of change management for different organizations are probably not the same, but the ethos of change management is the same, that is, making the organizations more effective, efficient and responsive to the turbulent environment changes (Armbruster, Bikafalvi, Kinkel and Lay, 2008)

Change Management suggests that resistance is a natural reaction to change that always contains a coded message and happens on an emotional and not an intellectual level. Accordingly, it is important not to 'overcome' resistance i.e. with logical arguments or even fight the resistance but treat resistance as an emotional process where feelings are involved. It



is also viewed as important to pause and deal with resistance immediately, when it appears which can mean a delay in the project plan (Doppler and Lauterburg, 2000).

Lending support to the above view, Kanji and Moura (2003) and Lycke (2003), state that changes can be numerous and could also include changes to procedures, structures, rules and regulations, technology, training and development and customer needs within organizations.

De Jager (2001) state that change is a simple process. At least, it's simple to describe. It occurs whenever we replace the old with the new. Change is about travelling from old to new, leaving yesterday behind in exchange for a new tomorrow. But implementing change is incredibly difficult. Most people are reluctant to leave the familiar behind.

### **Environmental-Adaptability**

Teece and Pisano (1994) identified environmental adaptability as a measure of change management strategy. Winners in the global market are firms that can demonstrate timely responsiveness and rapid and flexible product innovation, coupled with the management capability to effectively coordinate and redeploy internal and external competences. This source of competitive advantage is referred as dynamic capabilities. Zollo and Winter (2002) found that these capabilities are originated from a learned and stable pattern of collective activities, and that firms differ in their dynamic capabilities partly because they implicitly or explicitly emphasize differently the strategic importance of change in the future. Zollo and Winter (2002) and Eisenhardt and Martin (2000) also argued that firms dynamic capabilities differ because they are in environments with different rates of change dynamic capabilities are importance to consider in order for a firm to reconfigure and renew its organization. Brown and Eisenhardt (1998) found that present in high velocity industries needed to manage the demand for continual renewal, so they examined the aspect of renewal of firms further using complexity and evolutionary theories as well as literature exploring the fundamental nature of change and evolution. As a result, they developed a number of new concepts that all created a higher flexibility for a firm to adapt and reconfigure as a result external change.

### **Production Innovation**

The need for new product is driven by the fact that customers' habits are continually evolving, especially as new technology develops and competing suppliers offer innovative new solutions to satisfy customers' needs. There are several options for expanding an enterprise's reach and developing new products, with various levels of risk and reward associated with them (Prahalad and Hamel 1994). Generally, the option consists of the following

- Product extensions
- Market extensions
- Product and or Market diversification.

New product development is not just the status-quo; it is usually time consuming, risky and frequently costly. A clear strategic vision with regard to innovation needs to be articulated by an enterprise. Therefore, the drive for innovation and diversification generally comes from top of the organization, if new product development is to be successful (Hamel and Prahalad, 1994). Prior to instituting a process for product development, a new organizational structure





may need to be implemented, because new product development especially as the level of diversification and innovation increases, rarely resides easily in a non-dedicated group or unit. A new organizational structure may include innovation teams, or may integrate R and D into a business unit (Dessler, 2005).

### **Theoretical Framework**

This study is anchored on Three Step Change Theory by Kurt Lewin (1951). Social scientists view behavior as a dynamic balance of forces working in opposing directions. Driving forces facilitate change because they push employees in the desired directions. Restraining forces hinder change because they push employees in the opposite direction. Therefore, these forces must be balanced and Lewin's three-step model can help shift the balance in the direction of the planned change. Kurt Lewin developed a change model involving three steps: unfreezing, changing, and refreezing. Before a change can be implemented, it must go through the initial step of unfreezing. Because many people will naturally resist change, the goal during the unfreezing stage is to create an awareness of how the status quo, or current level of acceptability, is hindering the organization in some way. Old behaviors, ways of thinking, processes, people and organizational structure must all be carefully examined to show employees how necessary a change is for the organization to create or maintain a competitive advantage in the market place. Communication is especially important during the unfreezing stage so that employees can be informed about the imminent change, the logic behind it and how it will benefit each employee. The idea is that the more we know about a change and the more we feel it is necessary and urgent, the more motivated we are to accept the change.

Lewin's second step is changing. Now that the people are 'unfrozen' they can begin to move. Lewin recognized that change is a process where the organization must transit or move into this new state of being. This changing step, also referred to as 'transitioning' or 'moving' is marked by the implementation of the change. This is when the change becomes real. It's also, consequently, the time that most people struggle with the new reality. It is a time marked with uncertainty and fear, making the hardest step to overcome. During the changing step people begin to learn the new behaviors, processes and ways of thinking. For this reason, education, communication, support and time are critical for employees as they become familiar with the change. Again, change is a process that must be carefully planned and executed. Throughout this process, employees should be reminded of the reason for the change and how it will benefit once fully implemented.

Lewin called the final stage of his change model freezing, but many refer to it as refreezing to symbolize the act of reinforcing, stabilizing and solidifying the new state after the change. The changes made to organizational processes, goals, structures, offerings or people are accepted and refrozen as the new norms or status quo. Lewin found the refreezing step to be especially important to ensure that people do not revert back to their old ways of thinking or doing prior to the implementation of the change. Efforts must be made to guarantee the change is not lost; rather it needs to be cemented into the organization's culture and maintained as the acceptable way of thinking or doing. Positive rewards and acknowledgement of individualized efforts are often used to reinforce the new state because it is believed that positively reinforced behavior will likely be repeated. The relevance of this theory to the study is that it will help management to know how to go about the implementation of change in their organization.



## **Empirical Review**

Empirically, change management and its effect on organizational performance of Nigerian telecoms industries was examined by Olajide Olubayo (2014). In conducting the study, 300 staff of Airtel were randomly selected from the staff of 1000. Data collected were analyzed using One-Way analysis of variance. The findings revealed that a change in technology has a significant effect on performance and that changes in customer taste have a significant effect on customer patronage.

Igwe, Nwokedi and Udeh (2013) conducted an empirical investigation on the impact of change management on selected manufacturing firms in South East Nigeria. The sample size of the study was 267 top and middle management staff of the selected manufacturing firms. Chi-square statistic and Pearson product moment correlation coefficient was used for analyzing the data. The study revealed that change management improves the level of performance and that there is every strong positive relationship between commitment of top management, middle management and success rate of implementation in the selected firms.

Islam Mohamed Salim and Mohamed Sulaiman (2011) conducted a research to investigate the effect of organizational learning on innovation as well as the impact of innovation on company performance. Data were collected via electronic survey from 320 small and medium enterprises operating in the ICT industry in Malaysia with a sample size of 200. The study incorporated two sets of analyses. First, Pearson correlation analysis examined the correlation between organizational learning and innovation as well as innovation and performance. Next, multiple stepwise regression analysis was performed to establish the predictive power of organizational learning on innovation and that of innovation on performance. Findings revealed that organizational learning capability is positively related to organizational innovation and that organizational innovation is significantly related to organizational performance.

Munyao (2013) investigated the role of change management on the performance of Kenyatta National Hospital with a sample size of 48. Qualitative data was analyzed by the use of statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) version 21. In addition, descriptive and inferential statistics were used in the study. The finding showed that information technology, innovation, employee's motivation and management skills positively related with the performance of Kenyatta National Hospital in Kenya.

## **METHODOLOGY**

### **Research Design**

This study employed survey research design. The method was chosen by the researchers because data would be collected directly from the participants. The primary data were collected through questionnaire.

### **Population of the Study**

A total staff strength of 418 from the two manufacturing firms constituted the population of the study. Out of the total population Juhel Nigeria Limited has 308 staff and Millennium

Industries Limited has 110. Complete enumeration method was adopted, as the researchers made use of the entire population of the two firms.

**Table 3.1 Selected manufacturing Firms**

Juhel Nigeria Limited	308
Millennium Industrial Limited	110

*Source: Field Survey 2017*

### Method of Data Collection

Data for the research were collected from primary source. Copies of a structured questionnaire were administered, and the respondents were placed on objective response for each statement on a Five Point Likert Scale. The response scoring weights were Strongly Agree-5 points, Agree-4 points; Neutral, 3-Disagree-2 points, and Strongly Disagree-1 point.

### Validity of Instrument

Face and content validity were used in the study to validate the instrument. These addressed whether or not the conceptual variables appeared to be adequately measured both on the content and surface. The validity of the instrument was ascertained by giving out copies of the draft questionnaire, research questions, hypothesis, alongside with the purposes of the study to experts and validators from Education Foundation Department of Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka. They were asked to check the face and content validity of the instrument to see if the instrument would actually measure what it intended to measure. All corrections made were incorporated in the final instrument used.

### Reliability of the Instrument

Reliability is the consistency of information overtime. This study adopted Split-Half reliability technique for reliability test of the instrument. The result obtained is given below

**Table 3.2: Reliability Table**

Cronbach's Alpha	Part 1	Value	.921
		N of Items	12 <sup>a</sup>
	Part 2	Value	.897
		N of Items	12 <sup>b</sup>
Total N of Items			24
Correlation Between Forms			.910
Spearman-Brown Coefficient	Equal Length		.953
	Unequal Length		.953
Guttman Split-Half Coefficient			.892

*Source: Field Survey 2017.*

The formula is given as:

$$r_{SB} = \frac{2r_{hh}}{1 + r_{hh}}$$

Where

$r_{hh}$  = Pearson correlation of scores in the two half tests.

Applying the formula, we would have:

$$r_{SB} = \frac{2 \times 0.910}{1 + 0.910}$$

$$r_{SB} = \frac{1.82}{1.910}$$

$$r_{SB} = 0.952879$$

### Method of Data Analysis

In analyzing the data, Pearson's Product Moment Correlation Coefficient was adopted. Pearson Correlation was used to examine the relationship that exists between environmental-adaptability and product innovation.

## DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

**Table 4.1 Schedule of questionnaire administered and returned**

ORGANIZATION	No Distributed	No Returned	No Analysed
Juhel	308	297	283
Millennium	110	93	87
Total	418 (100%)	390 (93%)	370
Percentage			(89%)

*Source: Field Survey 2017*

From Table 4.1 above, the questionnaire administered and returned is shown. A total of 418 copies of questionnaire were distributed to the focused firms, out of which 390 were retrieved. 20 of the retrieved copies were invalidated because some of the questionnaire items were double-ticked, not ticked or too mutilated to comprehend.

## Respondents Demographic Information

**Table 4.1.1: Sex**

		Frequency	Percent
Valid	MALE	216	58.4
	FEMALE	154	41.6
	Total	370	100.0

Source: Field Survey 2017

Table 4.1.1 shows the sex of the respondents, 216 representing 58.4 percent respondents were male while 154 respondents 41.6 were female. It shows that male workers are needed more in the focused firms because nature of job requires stamina.

**Table 4.1.2: Academic Qualification**

		Frequency	Percent
Valid	SSCE	219	59.2
	HND	69	18.6
	B.Sc/Bed/Btec	79	21.4
	M.Sc/MBA/Med	3	.08
	Ph.D	-	-
	Total	370	100.0

Source: Field Survey 2016

The table 4.1.2 shows that 59.2 % of the respondents are SSCE holders, 18.6% are HND holders, 21.4% are B.Sc/Bed/Btec holders, and .08% is M.Sc/MBA/MEd while no respondent had a Ph.D degree. This implies that the respondents were literate enough to understand the issues at hand and respond meaningfully to the questions that were asked.

**Table 4.1.3: Work Experience**

		Frequency	Percent
Valid	Less than 3 YEARS	250	67.6
	3-5 YEARS	75	20.2
	6-8 YEARS	43	11.6
	9-11 YEARS	2	.05
	12 years and Above	-	-
	Total	370	100.0

Source: Field Survey 2017

The table 4.1.3 depicts that 250 respondents have worked in the organization for less than 3 years, 75 have worked for 3-5, and 43 have worked for 6-8 Years, 2 for 9-11 Years while none of the respondents have worked for more than 12 years. Hence, the result indicate that majority of the respondents have not worked in the organizations for more than 3 years

### Descriptive Statistics

#### Research Question:

What is the relationship between Environmental-Adaptability and Product Innovation in selected manufacturing firms in Awka?

**Table 4.1.5: Descriptive Statistic for Research Question**

<b>Environmental- Adaptability</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Minimum</b>	<b>Maximum</b>	<b>Mean</b>	<b>Std. Deviation</b>
My organization work environment is very conducive	370	2	5	3.22	1.123
I am comfortable with my work environment.	370	2	5	2.94	1.025
My work place allows me to be highly productive.	370	2	5	3.19	.849
My organization maintains a work condition that discourages employees' turnover.	370	2	5	3.93	1.083
<b>Product Innovation</b>					
We change our existing product according to customers' evolving habits.	370	1	5	3.47	1.167
New products in my company often help us to respond to our competitors.	370	1	5	4.37	.896
In my company we continuously improve old products and raise the quality of new product.	370	1	5	3.64	.921
The need to enter new market encourages my company to develop new product	370	1	5	3.52	1.026
Valid N(listwise)	370				

*Source: Field Survey 2017*

From Table 4.1.5, it shows the mean scores of questions asked to answer research question. The decision rule is to accept all items with a mean score of 3 and above and to reject any with



a mean score below 3. From the result above, all questionnaire items were accepted except one which was rejected.

### Test of Hypothesis

H<sub>0</sub>: Environmental-Adaptability (ENVAD) has no significant relationship with Product Innovation (PROINN) in selected manufacturing firms in Awka.

**Table 4.2.2: Correlation for Hypothesis**

Correlations		ENVAD	PROINN
ENVAD	Pearson Correlation	1	.933**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	370	370
PRODI NN	Pearson Correlation	.933**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	370	370

\*\* . Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Source: Field Survey 2017

Table 4.2.2 above shows the correlation result of hypothesis. The Pearson's r is .933 and the p-value is .000 which is less than the significant level at .05. Going by the decision rule, this goes to show that there is a significant positive relationship between the variables and therefore the research hypothesis is accepted, while the Null hypothesis is rejected.

### Discussions of Findings from the Test of Hypothesis

#### Result from test of Hypothesis

The result of this hypothesis reveals that Environmental-Adaptability has a significant positive relationship with Product Innovation. The result is in tandem with the outcome of the study by Mohammad and Ghazal (2012) which opined that organizational learning approaches can affect organizational innovation. Consequently, there is need for organization to pay attention to organizational adaptation strategies as this will improve product innovation. This is in line with the assertion of Edegbai (2014) that there is a strong positive relationship between environmental-adaptability and product innovation.

## SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

### Summary of Findings

From the discussion of findings, the summary was made:

- Environmental-adaptability has a significant positive relationship with product innovation.



- Correlation coefficient (r) of ENVAD & PRODINN (0.933) and it is significant at 0.05 (p-value (.000) < 0.05). This indicates that when work environment is conducive, it enables the employee to follow any change that may come up in the organization.

## Conclusion

Based on the findings of this study, it was established that changes in the organization have a significant impact on the whole firm. Change is unsettling and disruptive. It is occurring at an increased rate in the world of business and workers are easily worried by change and they have a variety of reasons to resist it but it is inevitable in the competitive business environment. Change needs to be managed right from the beginning of the innovation process so as to prevent resistance to the change. To be effective and efficient in managing this change, organizations and their managers need to develop effective and efficient change management strategy.

## Recommendations

Based on the findings the study thus recommends:

1. In order to achieve the intended change outcome, management of the focused companies need to control and by extension direct the employees to ensure compliance with the laid down rules and regulations so as to prevent them from going back to the former way of doing things.
2. Focused manufacturing firms should use appropriate change management strategies as situations demands because rarely will a single strategy suffice.

## REFERENCES

- A., C., D., M., E., & N., (2012). Work Organization and Innovation, *European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions*.
- Ali, M., Nahid, T., Zakaria, S., & Naser, K. (2014). Relationship between Organizationa Innovation and System Thought in Service Organization in Iran. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Science*, 4 (7), 25-41
- Andy, N. & Jasper. H (1998). Innovation and Business Performance: A Literature review. The Judge Institute of Management Studies, University of Cambridge.
- Annika. S.(2012). Organizational Innovation: A Conceptualization of how they are created diffused and sustained. Chalmers University of Technology, Gothenburg.
- Ansoff, H. & Mc Donnell (1990). *Implanting Strategic Management* Englewood cliffs, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition, Cambridge UK: Prentice Hall,
- Armbruster, H., Bikfalvi, A., Kinkel, S., G. (2008). Organizational Innovation: The Challenge of Measuring Non-technical Innovation in Large-Scale Surveys. *Technovation*, 28(10), 644-657.
- Ashraf, F. & Asifkhan, M. (2013). Organizational Innovation and Organizational Effectiveness among Employees of Cellular Companies in Islamabad. *Pakistan Journal of Psychological Research*, 28(1), 01-24.



- Atalay. A. (2013). The Relationship between Innovation and Firm Performance: An emperical evidence from Turkish Automotive Supplier Industry. *Proceedia social and Behaviour Science*, 75, 226 -235.
- Bahrami, S., Rejaei, S., Apha H., Taghi, B., Hassanali, Y.M, & Mohammad H., (2011). "Analyzing multi-relationship of Intellectual capital and organizational. Innovation in High Education" *Journal Quarterly of research and planning on high education*, 61, 27 -50.
- Bail, M. N. (1988). *Innovation and the Productivity Crisis*. Washington DC: The Brookings Institution.
- Battisi, G., & Stoneman.D. (2010) How innovative are UK Firms? Evidence from the fourth UK Community Innovation Survey or Synergies between Technological and Organizational Innovations. *British Journal of management*, 21, 187-206.
- Brown S.L & Eisenhardt K.M (1998) competing on the Edge: strategy as structured" chaos Boston, MA: Harvard Business school press.
- Burnes, B. (2004), *Managing Change: A Strategic Approach to Organisation Dynamics*, 4th edition, Pitman Publishing
- Camison-Zornoza, C., Lapiedra- Alcami, R., Segarra-Cipres, M. & Boronat-Navarro, M. (2004). 'A meta-analysis of Innovation and Organizational size'. ' *Organization Studies*, 25, 331-61.
- Choopani, H., Zare, K., Mojtaba, Q., Aghil. Q.Z., (2012). Studying the Relationship Between the Intellectual Capital with the Organizational Innovation (case study, stock company of Development Insurance), *Innovation and Creativity in Humanities*, second period, 1, 27-58.
- Damanpour, F. (1987). The Adoption of Technological Administrative and Ancillary Innovations: Impact of Organization Factors, *Journal of Management* 13 (4), 675-688.
- Damanpour, F., Evan, W.M. (1984). Organizational Innovation and Performance: The Problem of "Organizational Lag". *Administrative Science Quarterly* 29,392-409.
- De Jager, P. (2001). Resistance to change: A New View of an Old Problem. *The Futurist*, 53(3), 24-27.
- De Jong (2006). Individual Innovation: The connection between Leadership and Employees' Innovative Work Behavior. Paper provided by EIM Business and Policy Research in its series Scales Research Reports with number R200604. <http://www.entrepreneurship-sme.eu/pdf-ez/R200604.pdf>
- Dess, G.G. & Picken, J.C. (2000). 'Changing roles: Leadership in the 21<sup>st</sup> century'. *Organizational Dynamics*, 28, 18-34.
- Dessler, G. (2005). *A Framework for Human Resource Management*, UK: Prentice Hall:
- Dopson, S., & Newmann, J.E (1998). Uncertainty, Contrariness and the Double-fired: Middle , Managers' Reactions to Changing Contracts, *British Journal of Management*, 9, 53-70.
- Dougherty, D & Hardy. C. (1996). Sustained product innovation in large, mature organizations: Overcoming innovation –to-organization problems. *Academy of management journal* 39 (5), 1120-1153.
- Doyle, M. (2002). From Change Novice to Change Expert: Issues of learning, Development and Support. *Personal Review*, 31 (4) 465-481.
- Edegbai, R. (2014). Change Management Strategies and Organizational Innovation in Manufacturing Firms in Rivers State: University of Port Harcourt.
- Eisenhardt, K. M. and Martin, J. A. (2000). Dynamic Capabilities: What are they? *Strategic Management Journal*, 21(10-11), 1105-1121.



- Ford, J., & Ford, L (2008). The Sage Handbook of New Approaches on Management and Organization
- Freeman, C. (1982), "The economics of industrial innovation", London: Frances Pinter.
- Grant, M.R. (2005), Contemporary Strategy Analysis (5th ed) United Kingdom: Blackwell Publishing.
- Gumusluoglu T & Ilsev A (2009). Transformational Leadership, Creativity and Organizational Innovation, *Journal of Business Resources*. 62: 461-473.
- Gupta. G., (2013). Firm Growth and it's Determinants. *Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, 2, 15.
- Hamidzadeh, M. & Eghtesadi, G. (2012). Organizational Learning and Organizational Innovation in Tondguyan Petrochemical Company in Iran. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management*, (1), 92-98.
- Igwe , N., Nwokedi, R. & Udeh, S. (2014). An Empirical Investigation into the Impact of Change Management on Selected Manufacturing Firms in South East Nigeria. *International Journal of Business Administration*, 5(1), 53-75.
- Islam, M. & Mohamed, S.(2011). Organizational Learning, Innovation and Performance. A Study of Malaysian Small and Medium Sized Enterprises. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 6 (12), 118-125
- Kanji, G.P., & Moura, E.P. (2003). Sustaining Healthcare Excellence through Performance Measurement. *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 14(3), 269-289.
- Kanter, R.M & Dretler, T.D. (1998). Global strategy and its Impact on Local Operations: Lessons from Gillette Singapore. *Academy of Management Executive*, 12 (4), 60-68.
- Kanugisha .S. (2013). Effects of Change Management in an Organization. *Wyno Journal of Management and Business Studies*, 1(1), 1-18.
- Kuswanto, F., Rosil, M., Radiah, A., & Hamidreza, G. (2012). Impact of Distribution Channel Innovation on the Performance of Small and Medium Entreprises. *International Business and Management*, 15, 50-60.
- Lansisalmi, H., Kivimaki, M., Aalto, P. & Ruoranen, R. (2006). 'Innovation in Healthcare: a Systematic Review of Recent Research'. *Nursing Science Quarterly*, 19, 66-72.
- Liao, S.H., Fei, W.C., & Liu, C.T. (2008). Relationships between Knowledge Inertia, Organizational Learning and Organizational Innovation, *Technovation*, 28 (4), 252-195.
- Luecke, R & Katz, R (2003) "Managing Creativity and Innovation", Harvard Business School Press, MA.
- Lycke, L. (2003). Team Development when Implementing TPM. *Total Quality Management*, 14(2), 205-213.
- Mone, M.A., McKinley. W. & Barker, V.L. (1998). 'Organizational Decline and Innovation: A Contingency Framework'. *Academy of Management Review*, 23, 115-32.
- Munyao, M.M. (2013). The Role of Change Management on the Performance of Public Institutions in Kenya: A Case of Kenyatta National Hospital. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Entrepreneurship*, 1(5), 1-17.
- Ndahiro, S., Shukla, J. (2013). & Oduor, J. Effect of Change Management on Performance of Government Institutions in Rwanda. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 3(5), 94-107.
- Neu, W. A & Brown, S. W. (2005). Forming Successful Business-to-Business Services in Goods-Dominant Firms. *Journal of Service Research*, 8(1), 3-17.
- Olajide, O. (2014). Change Management and its Effects on Organizational Performance of Nigeria Telecom Industries. *International Journal of Humanities Social Science and Education*, 11(11), 170-179.



- Ottenbacher, M., & Gnoth, J (2005). How to Develop Successful Hospitality Innovation. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly* 46 (2): 205-22.
- Pittaway, L., (2005), "Philosophies in Entrepreneurship: A focus on Economic Theories", *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour and Research*, 11( 3),201-221.
- Pittaway, L., Robertson, M., Munir, K., Denyer, D. & Neely, A. (2004). 'Networking and Innovation: A Systematic Review of the Evidence'. *International Journal of Management Reviews* 5(6), 137-68.
- Prahalad, C.K., & Hamel, G. (1994). "Strategy as a field of study: Why search for a new paradigm?" *Strategic Management Journal*, 15, 5-16.
- Rabia, K., Abaid, U., & Afsheen, F., (2009). Exploring the Moderating Role of Organizational Size in the Relationship between Transformational Leadership and Organizational Innovation. *African Journal of Business Management*, 3(11), 678-684.
- Rebound, M. a. (2008). Innovation Management of SMEs in the Creative Sector. *International Journal of Innovation*, 31.
- Rosli, M. M. & Sidek, S. (2013). Innovation and Firm Performance: Evidence from Malaysian Small and Medium Enterprises. Paper presented at the 20<sup>th</sup> International Business Information Management Conference (IBIMA). *International Business Information Management Association*, 794-809.
- Rouse, W. B. (2013). The Conditions of Complex Innovation Adoption Occurrence. *The Electric Journal Information System Evaluation*, 16, 10.
- Saweeya, P. (2011). Knowledge Management Strategy and the Effect on Organizational Innovation. Bangkok University, Thai.
- Shalley, C.E & Gilson, L.L (2004). What Leaders Need to Know: A Review of Social and Contextual Factors that can Foster or Hinder Creativity, *Leadership Quarterly*, 15:33-53.
- Tan, C. & Nasuridin, A. (2011). Human Resource Management Practices and Organizational Innovation: Assessing the Mediating Role of Knowledge Management Effectiveness. *The Electronic Journal of Knowledge Management*, 9(2), 155-167.
- Teece, David & Gary P. Pisano (1994). "The Dynamic capabilities of firms an Introduction", *Industrial & corporate change* 3(3), 537-556.
- Trott, P. (2008). *Innovation Management and New Product Development* (4th ed.): Financial Times/ Prentice Hall.
- Van Auken, H., Madrid Guijarro, A., & García Pérez de Lema, D. (2008). Innovation and Performance in Spanish Manufacturing SMEs. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Innovation Management*, 8 (1), 36-56.
- Wolfe, R.A (1994): Organizational Innovation: Review, Critique and Suggested Research Directions, *Journal of Management Studies*, 31.405-431.
- Zand, D. (1997). The Leadership Triad. *Soundview Executive Book Summaries*, 19(6), part 1,1-8.
- Zollo .M. & Winter .S. (2002); Deliberate Learning and the Evolution of Dynamic Capabilities. *Organization Science*, 13(3), 339-351

## APPENDIX

### QUESTIONNAIRE

Tick (✓) where; SD – Strongly Disagree, D – Disagree, U – Undecided, A – Agree and SA – Strongly Agree

#### Personal Data

SEX: Male [ ] Female [ ]

ACADEMIC QUALIFICATION: SSCE [ ] B.Sc/Bed/Btec [ ] M.sc/MBA/Med [ ] Ph.D. [ ]

WORK EXPERIENCE: less than 3years [ ] 3-5 years [ ] 6-8 years [ ] 9-11 years [ ] 12 years and above [ ]

S/ N	ITEMS	SA (5)	A (4)	SD (3)	D (2)	U (1)	N
	<b>ENVIRONMENTAL-ADAPTABILITY</b>						
1	My organization work environment is very conducive	78	48	121	123	-	<b>370</b>
2	I am comfortable with my work environment.	39	67	98	166	-	<b>370</b>
3	My work place allows me to be highly productive.	29	87	178	76	-	<b>370</b>
4	My organization maintains a work condition that discourages employees' turnover.	136	139	27	68	-	<b>370</b>
	<b>PRODUCT INNOVATION</b>						
5	We change our existing product according to customers' evolving habits.	89	103	78	91	9	<b>370</b>
6	New products in my company often help us to respond to our competitors.	206	127	9	24	4	<b>370</b>
7	In my company we continuously improve old products and raise the quality of new product.	49	199	67	50	5	<b>370</b>
8	The need to enter new market encourages my company to develop new product	78	103	125	61	3	<b>370</b>





## IMPACT OF INNOVATIVENESS ON ORGANIZATION AGILITY OF FOOD AND BEVERAGE FIRMS IN RIVERS STATE, NIGERIA

Felix M.O. and Hamilton D.I.

Department of Management, Rivers State University, Port Harcourt Nigeria

**ABSTRACT:** *This study empirically examined the impact of innovativeness on organizational agility of food and beverage firms in Rivers State, Nigeria. The survey research design was utilized. The sampling technique used was simple random sampling techniques. The sample size of 119 was obtained from 17 selected manufacturing firms in Rivers State Nigeria. The spearman rank order correlation was used in ascertaining the relationship between the predictor and the criterion variable. The result of the analysis revealed that innovativeness significantly and positively impacts on organizational agility of food and beverage firms in Rivers State. The study concluded that innovativeness helps in organizational encouragement of Research and Development, development of new work processes, new product/services creation and introduction, and assuming leadership in area of technology, and in development of competitive advantage. Additionally, innovativeness is positively and significantly related to organizational agility of food and beverage manufacturing firms in Rivers State Nigeria. It is recommended that; Innovativeness should be codified as prerequisite specification for potential employees, innovativeness should be enshrined into the culture of the organization and managers of organizations should always encourage employees to be creative enough and also attach reward to creative idea generation from employees. Also, there should always be periodic scanning of the external business environment in search of threats and opportunities, Organizations should stay aggressively competitive in order to combat rivals when the need arises and should be proper risk assessment before embarking on any project.*

**KEYWORDS:** Innovativeness, Organizational Agility, Speed, Flexibility, Competence, Food and Beverage Firms.

## INTRODUCTION

Change in consumers taste, globalization and rapid technological developments have contributed to the turbulence, unpredictability, hostility, complexity and uncertainties which characterized today business environment. These challenges, unpredictability and complexity of today business settings are considered as some of the main factors in the failure of various businesses in Nigeria. Clients in this period do not have patience to sit tight and wait for the moves planned by an organization; rather, they demand instant attention and gratification to their needs. The capacity to meet these customers need and secure the customer loyalty for sure has been of great worry to firms, and has therefore, called for organizations to be responsive. This has also driven some organizations in creation of new action plans and strategies to avert possible threats arising from these situations. One of the latest concepts in the strategic management discipline to achieve this goal is the concept of organizational agility. Indeed, business environment is fast changing; new ideas, innovations and practices





are gradually sending old business ideas, practices and culture into extinction. Organizations therefore, must be highly creative and resourceful to swiftly and rightly respond to events and changes in her environments in order to achieve positive organizational results.

Innovativeness makes all the difference in an organization's chance of success, effectiveness, and survival, and in the ability to swiftly and rightly respond to events and changes in the current fast changing and highly competitive business environment. innovativeness has been identified as the cornerstone of entrepreneurship (Loos 2006). Innovativeness explains the creative capability of an organization can stimulate agility in an organizational well as other organizational positive outcomes. Majority of the researches done in respect of innovativeness examined its relationship with organizational success (Khalili et al., 2013). However, limited allocation of resources for innovative activities has been identified as the greatest barrier to innovation within organizations by many researchers (Jaakson et al., 2011). One very factor that can aid an organization in the combat of these uncertainties is agility. Absence of agility infers delay in work process and service delivery which can prompt loss of clients and thus lead to business failure. Consequently, agile disposition enables firms to adjust and quickly react to environmental uncertainties and in a way make progress. The need for business organization to assume an agility disposition cannot be over emphasized. The business environment in contemporary times is characterized of unpredictable and turbulent happenings as such organizations need agility disposition to carry on. Organizations that are craving to surmount this frequent environmental turbulence must be outfitted with explicit credit to enable them to be lively. Such organizations must learn to change along the change in the business environment in order to stay relevant

Agility disposition enables an organization to swiftly react and conform to happenings in the external business sphere and it is perceived as a very vital component in enhancing organizational success (Oosterhout, Warts and Van 2006). Organizations therefore cannot over emphasize the need for agile disposition as a way of surmounting these realities and happenings in the business environment. Some Researchers opined that for an organization to stay agile then such organization must be learning oriented (Dove 1999). Organizations that desire to surmount this environmental turbulence must be equipped with specific attribute to help them gain agility. These capabilities therefore, include four main elements which are responsiveness, competence, flexibility and speed (Sharifi and Zhang 1999).

Donald (2009) defines organizational agility as the capacity to picture and grab opportunities more fastly than competitors do. Sharifi and Zhang (1999) describe agility as the ability to cope with sudden and unanticipated changes and survive business threats by transforming threats into opportunities. Dove (1999) describes agility as the ideal and suitable way to learn in an environment rich with knowledge so that customer-oriented and preferred products and services can be provided. With agility disposition, organizations therefore can swiftly react to uncertainties in the right direction by identifying opportunities in the face of risk.

Various studies argued that organizational agility is one factor that will aid an organization survive in the face of turbulent environmental changes. Organizations in today dynamic and intense rivalry characterized business world must therefore possess diverse competitive attribute to compete; else, they may liquidate owing to competitors' actions and inactions. One basic element that is very needful to organization in this uncertain business environment of this present age is agility. Agility aids firms to swiftly response to environmental changes thereby enhancing organizational efficiency. Agile organization is one that can turn turbulent

and ever-changing environment to its advantage and one that can swiftly check its rivals' moves at interval and take swift reprisal moves to battle it. These abilities in this way incorporate four fundamental components which are responsiveness, skill, adaptability and speed (Sharifi and Zhang 1999).

The aim of this paper is to empirically examine the relationship between innovativeness and organizational agility of food and beverage manufacturing firms. The specific objectives of the study are:

- (1). To examines the relationship between innovativeness and organizational speed of food and beverage manufacturing firms in Rivers State Nigeria.
- (2). To examines the relationship between innovativeness and organizational competence of food and beverage manufacturing firms in Rivers State.
- (3). To examines the relationship between innovativeness and organizational flexibility of food and beverage manufacturing firms in Rivers State. The research questions could be read off from these, and our hypotheses are:

**Ho1:** There is no significant relationship between innovativeness and speed of food and beverage firm in Rivers State.

**Ho2:** There is no significant relationship between innovativeness and competence and food beverage firm in Rivers State

**Ho3:** There is no significant relationship between innovativeness and flexibility of food and beverage firm in Rivers State

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### Theoretical Framework of the Study

This study is premised on Schumpeter theory of innovation (1985). The Schumpeterian school of thought holds the assumption that entrepreneurs cause change to happen and as such are seen as causing creative destruction. The theory also asserts that innovation is basically the ultimate aim for investment increase and changes in business. Hence, earns the justification for this study because one basic attribute an organization needs to glide through its turbulent environment is agility.

### The Concept of Innovativeness

Innovativeness refers to an organization's ability to be involved in creative initiative and trial of new ideas by the introduction of new products/services and technological lead the market through Research and development processes. Hence, Loos (2006) posited that innovation is the cornerstone for entrepreneurship. Furthermore, Lumpkin and Dess (1996) view innovativeness as the ability of a firm to creatively initiate new ideas, initiation and creation of new product, being the first to try new work processes which may facilitate new products and services as solution to the need of man. Innovativeness is the ability of an organization to transform its creative idea into reality, achieving improvement in work processes and product



and gaining competitive edge over rivals. Innovativeness focused on better ways to execute old or new job. An innovative firm is one who thinks outside the box and engages in the creation of new product and administrative processes so as to create value addition and ensure customer satisfaction.

Innovation is vital to entrepreneurship since it is very essential in enhancing economic growth. In the opinion of Lin et al (2008), countries with the largest economies can be associated with great commitment to innovation and research. Innovativeness as an organization capacity explains how start-up firms emerge and how established firms renew themselves to stay ahead of rivals. The execution of this function implies multiple modes of innovation: product, process, organizational or business model innovations. Once being aligned, the different modes of innovation may trigger processes of 'creative destruction' in the Schumpeterian sense. However, innovative activities are typically associated with risks and is aimed at creating some new process or product that gives its creator a competitive advantage over its business rivals; it does so by rendering obsolete some previous innovation; and it is in turn destined to be rendered obsolete by future innovations. Accordingly, Schumpeter (1985) calls innovation the specific tool of entrepreneurs, the means by which entrepreneurs exploit change and gain opportunity for different business or different services. Lin et al. (2008) suggest that innovativeness plays an important role in research, product development, technical expertise and knowledge transfer for future development. Therefore, it is necessary that these organizations replace their perspectives and approaches with new ones.

### **Benefits of Innovation**

Innovation offers various benefits to organizations. Jawoski and Kohli (1993) posited that firms operating in a turbulent market should always upgrade and periodically improve on the product they offer to the market as well as stay more creative so as to spontaneously respond to the ever-changing customer taste and preferences. Innovation is not only necessary in the area of new product and services but it's also very necessary in the production process which is an integration of administrative and technological processes. As Lumpkin and Dess (1996) asserted that the presence of innovativeness as an entrepreneurial element in organization strengthens an organization ability to be involve in research and development activities for novelty which may eventually facilitate the creation of new products, new work processes and new technological development. In order words, innovation does heavily influence production processes as well as it output, and can even change the way data are collected and applied. the innovative strength of an organization also involve the use of new business processes through various measures which include; drawing on new methods for work process, training and development of personnel, reducing the waste of processes, increasing product quality and ensuring periodic renewal of products upgrade and increased ability to improve productivity, whereby ensuring efficiency and effectiveness of firms processes in the way of achieving objectives. Innovations therefore are vital and heavily complement an organization's sustainability and success. Jawoski and Kohli (1993) posited that Innovation is very necessary in the production process which is an integration of administrative and technological processes. Slater and Narver (1995) posited that innovation does heavily influences production processes as well as it output and can even change the way data are collected and applied.



## **The Concept of Organizational Agility**

Agility refers to capacity of a firm to unconstrained reaction to changing economic situations and consumers taste. Agility is a swift way of reacting to external environmental happenings and sometimes making moves even before change occur. Ren, Yusuf and Burns (2001) considers agility to be a firm capacity to reengineer its wealth, interest in accordance with possible works on, having ecological consciousness and giving client variety items while remaining focused in speed of item presentation and conveyance, keeping up a moderately adaptable structure, being creative and guaranteeing item quality. This in this way infers all together for an association to remain fit and win its client dependability in an aggressive business condition like our own then dexterity mien can't be consigned. Donald (2009) defines organizational agility as the capacity to picture and grab opportunities more fastly than competitors do. Sharifi and Zhang (1999) describe agility as the ability to cope with sudden and unanticipated changes and survive business threats by transforming threats into opportunities. Dove (1999) describes agility as the ideal and suitable way to learn in an environment rich with knowledge so that customer-oriented and preferred products and services can be provided. With agility disposition, organizations therefore can swiftly react to uncertainties in the right direction by identifying opportunities in the face of risk. Thus, an agile organization responds quickly to changing market conditions and customer's needs.

It is the successful application of competitive bases such as speed, flexibility, innovation and quality by the means of the integration of reconfiguration, resources and best practices of knowledge rich environment to provide customer-driven products and service in a fast-changing environment (Ren, Yusuf and Burns, 2001). Plonka (1997) considered knowledge-oriented manpower as the main factors of creating agile organizations. Agility here is not all about response to environmental changes but measures how swift and proactive the response may be. A response that may come too late or too early and does not achieve result may not display agility. Various researchers have identified different factors as a source or stimulus toward agility in organizations and the offspring of them is "change" (Tahmasebufard, Zangoveinezhad and Jafari (2000). This therefore implies that in order for an organization to stay fit and win its customer loyalty in a competitive business environment like ours then agility disposition cannot be relegated.

According to Yusuf et al (1999) certain elements are seen as agility enablers as they provide the bedrocks and situations to create the attributes of agility. They are grouped into four (1) core competency management (2) virtual enterprise (3) capability of configuration and (4) knowledge-driven enterprises. In contrary Sharifi and Zhang (1999) posited that these attributes are obtainable through four areas of organization, staffing, technology and creativity. Likewise, Lin, Chiu and Tseng (2006) added other items to agility enablers and they include cooperative relationship, process integration, information integration and customer/marketing sensitivity. Tseng and Lin (2011) also added organization of business processes as one of the agility enablers. Agility disposition as a fundamental attribute of an organization is basically aimed at enriching and satisfying the needs of customers definitely, rightly and timely. Agility lay numerous merits for organizations, and such merits include the ability to respond quickly and effectively to changing market need, high ability to provide customized products to customers, ability to provide new products to market at lower prices, reduce production costs, increase customer satisfaction, elimination of non-value added activities and increase competitiveness (Tseng and Lin 2011).



A holistic framework on agility measures proposed by Sherechig, Karwowski and Layer (2007) include: agility drivers, strategic abilities, agility providers and agility capabilities. Agility drivers according to them consist of all factors of the external business environment creating turbulence and the unpredictability of the changes which drive an organization to adopt agility. Strategic abilities on the other hand are determined through factors such as responsiveness, flexibility, competence and speed which are considered as the main features of an agile organization that allows adaptation to changes. They further posited that agility capabilities could be achieved by a means of agility providers. Agility providers on the other hand can be derived from four manufacturing areas; organization, technology people and innovation. They asserted only and when only these criteria are integrated agility could be achieved.

Haraf (2015) on the other hand identified 10 basic elements which they called ‘the pillars of agility’. These elements include, (i) culture of innovation (ii) empowerment (iii) tolerance for ambiguity (iv) vision (v) strategic direction (vi) change (vii) communication (viii) market analysis and response (ix) operations management and (x) development of a learning organization. According to Haraf (2015), all other pillars previously discussed culminated in this final pillar. Developing a learning organization is presented as the final pillar of agility because it provides the necessary tools and cultural implications to enable the previous pillars to exist in a harmonious fashion, unique, to the various purposes and functions of differing organizations (Haraf 2015).

### **Dimensions of Organizational Agility**

Different dimensions of organizational agility have been identified by various authors. Sharifi and Zhang (1999) identified responsiveness, competence, flexibility and speed as basic measures of organizational agility. Coffman and Harder (1998) posited that the basic elements of the agile organization include learning ability, creativity, fastness, timely communication, and adaptability and employee’s participation. This study however, adopted speed, flexibility and competency as measures of organizational agility.

**Speed:** this is the capability to instantly respond to changes concerning new goods, respond to market, appropriation of time for products and service transfer (Kuleelung et al 2015). Speed represent a time an organization utilized to react to occurrences in its environments. Speed is concerned with fast movement in the right direction which will yield positive result for the organization. A culture of speed evolves when an organization consistently initiate speed in all areas of its operation ranging from; new product idea generation, combating rivals, task accomplishment and service delivery. Time is a valuable asset and the main asset when spent either wrongly or appropriately can't be recover. Most organization fails today not on the grounds that they lack the right blend of assets but because they lack speed in meeting up with prevalent trends in today business world. With the pace at which society advances, organizations need take the necessary steps to stay applicable. The speed of an organization can be estimated over an assortment of components, for example, basic leadership time slack, imaginative moves, responsiveness to clients’ needs and the procedure of undertaking execution.

One of the primary ways in achieving customer satisfaction is by manufacturing products to meet their demands as quick as possible and which shows the importance of customer feedback in the product design. Speed implies consistent, strong and rapid response to sudden





changes, new market opportunities and customer specification. Thus, the competitive advantage of these firms often depends on the speed with which they enter the market and meet the customers (Li et al., 2008).

**Flexibility:** This is the ability to implement different processes and apply different facilities to achieve the same goals, consists of items such as: product volume flexibility, people flexibility. Reed and Blundson (2012) defined flexibility as the capability of an organization to adjust its internal structure and work processes in response to environmental changes. A flexible organization thus, is one that does easily and swiftly adjust to environmental changes. Flexibility is the ability to produce and deliver various products and achieving different objectives with same resources and equipment. Ability to change and adjust as quickly as possible in today ever-changing business environment has become a thing of concern to several organization. Teece and Augier (2009) posited that a company can actualize competitive edge over rivals when in possession of resources or competences, but without flexibility the returns can be sustained only for a short period of time.

**Competence:** Agile organizations are mainly dependent on the capabilities and competencies of its workforce, both managers and workers, to learn and progress with change. Consequently, when considering human resources as the most important assets in an organizations asset structure, we need to think about the capability to reconfigure and transform the workforce to business needs with the result to create organizational agility. Competence thus, deals with the ability of an organization to effectively utilize its resources towards goal maximization. Therefore, a workforce is expected to exploit competencies by proactively innovating their skills and capabilities based on organizations' needs in order to adapt to diverse and changing requirements. Agility capacity of employees requires being proactive, adaptive and generative to be sustained. Competences therefore imply the ability of an organization to connect with key resources and capabilities combination to transform and direct them towards customer satisfaction. Obiekwe (2018) noted that organizational competencies can be successfully achieved through effective human capital development. This is also supported by Nwaeke and Obiekwe (2017).

### **Innovativeness and Organizational Agility**

Covin and Slevin (1991) describe innovativeness as a firm's propensity to experiment with new ideas in order to activate a process that results in new products, services or technological development. No doubt, innovativeness is an offspring of creative thinking as it deals with the ability of an organization or individual to transform its creative thinking into realities by a way of new product introduction, value addition and modification; hence Lumpkin and Dess (1996) posited that innovativeness is characterized of creative mindset, encouragement of Research and Development, development of new work processes, new product/services creation and introduction, and assuming leadership in area of technology. Organizational innovativeness in today's business settings, deals with creative thinking, being first mover in new initiatives and ideas or introducing new work processes.

Mehdi *et al.*, (2015) confirmed that innovativeness positively influences organizational agility. Similarly, Mishra (2017) posited that entrepreneurial organizations are alert, fast, forward looking, adaptive, absorptive and driven by. Tahmasebifard *et. al.*, (2017) also confirmed a strong relationship between innovativeness and organizational agility

## METHODOLOGY

The research design adopted in this paper is the survey method. The survey research design was utilized. The sampling technique used was simple random sampling techniques. The sample size of 119 was obtained from 17 selected manufacturing firms in Port. The spearman rank order correlation was used in ascertaining the relationship between the predictor and the criterion variable. The reliability of the instrument was also achieved through confirmatory tests using Crombach Alpha coefficient. Data generated were analyzed and presented using both descriptive and inferential statistical techniques.

## Data Analysis and Results

Three hypotheses where tested in this study. The results are presented below:

**Table 1: Correlation between Innovativeness and Organizational Agility**

		Innovativeness	Speed	Flexibility	Competence
Spearman's rho	Correlation Coefficient	1.000	.514**	.437**	.601**
	<b>Innovativeness</b> Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.000	.000	.000
	N	97	97	97	97
	Correlation Coefficient	.514**	1.000	.802**	.366**
	<b>Speed</b> Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.	.000	.004
	N	97	97	97	97
	Correlation Coefficient	.437**	.802**	1.000	.344**
	<b>Flexibility</b> Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.	.007
	N	97	97	97	97
	Correlation Coefficient	.601**	.366**	.344**	1.000
	<b>Competence</b> Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.004	.007	.
	N	97	97	97	97

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The results in table above indicate that there is a significant association between innovativeness and Speed, innovativeness and flexibility, innovativeness and competence. Innovativeness is significantly correlated to Speed ( $r = 0.514$ ,  $p = 0.000 < 0.05$ ). Innovativeness is significantly correlated to Flexibility ( $r = .437$ ,  $p = 0.000 < 0.05$ ); and





Innovativeness is also significantly associated to competence ( $r = .601$ ,  $p = 0.000 < 0.05$ ). The association between Innovativeness and the measures of Organizational Agility is observed to be significant at the 0.05 level of significance. Going by this result, the three null hypotheses were rejected, and we therefore accept the alternative hypotheses that innovativeness is positively and significantly correlated with organizational speed, flexibility, and organizational competency.

### Discussions of Findings

The result of this study indicated a significant relationship between innovativeness and the under studied three measures of organizational agility which are; speed, flexibility and competence from the study. It was observed that innovativeness significantly associated with speed. This therefore implies that any creative move by an organization must be in consonance with speed because a fantastic product, that is introduced to the market at the wrong time and later than expected due to delay in production process may not be of profit to the organization as consumers may exhibit low patronage towards such products due to its wrong appearance time in the market.

Hence, Surlivan (2011) asserted that the business world is becoming more radical and evolutionary new entrants are displacing old leaders as a result of their innovative disposition. The result of the study also indicated a significant correlation between innovativeness and flexibility. This implies that innovative disposition of an organization goes a long way to influence the capability of such firms in terms of its adjustments to environmental occurrences. Hence Lumpkin and Dess (1996) posited that innovativeness as a firm's ability to absorb and support new ideas, novelty and creativity that may give into new products, services and production techniques. The result of this findings it's in agreement with a related work done by Mehdi et al (2015), which confirmed a positive relationship between innovativeness and organizational agility of which flexibility is one.

For innovativeness and competence our study observed a significant relationship between innovativeness and competence which is in the same direction with the work of Tahmassbifard *et al* (2017) which confirmed a strong relationship between innovativeness and organizational agility.

### CONCLUSIONS

Organizational innovativeness which is characterized by creative mindset, helps in organizational encouragement of Research and Development, development of new work processes, new product/services creation and introduction, and assuming leadership in area of technology. Organizational innovativeness in today's business settings also deals with creative thinking, being first mover in new initiatives and ideas or introducing new work processes. The actualization of competitive edge over rivals is therefore; only possible when an organization is in possession of human resources with creative competences and ideas to drive the organization forward, and the flexibility to help create new initiative to assist in the development of agility capacity. Agility helps Organizations to swiftly react to external environmental happenings and sometimes making moves even before changes occur. Innovativeness is vital in the area of new product and services development, and also very necessary in the production process which is an integration of administrative and

technological processes. In all the findings from the analysis reveals that innovativeness is positively and significantly related to organizational agility of food and beverage manufacturing firms in Rivers State Nigeria.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Drawing from above conclusions we therefore recommend that Innovativeness should be made a prerequisite specification for potential employees because employees are the life wire of the organization and an organization void of innovative employees can never thrive in this jet age. Innovativeness should be enshrined into culture of the organization so as to achieve adaptive capability. Managers of organizations should always encourage employees to be creative enough and also attach reward to creative idea generation from employees even if such employee is the least in the organizational structure

## REFERENCE

- Covin, J.G, Green, K.M., & Slevin, D.P. (2006). Strategic process effects on the entrepreneurial orientation: *Theory & Practice*, 30(1), 57–81.
- Donald, S. (2009). Competing through organizational agility. *Mckinsey Quarterly*, 2(2), 5-9.
- Dove, R. (1999). Knowledge management, response ability, and the agile enterprise. *Journal of Knowledge Management* 3:1, 18–35.
- Dove, R. (2001). Response ability: the language, structure, and culture of the agile enterprise. John Wiley & Sons, New York.
- Jaakson, K., Tamm, D. & Hämmal, G. (2011). Organizational innovativeness in Estonian Biotechnology organizations', *Baltic Journal of Management*, 6(2), 205–226.
- Jaworski, B., & Kohli, A. (1993). Market orientation: antecedents and consequences, *Journal of Marketing*, 57(3), 53–70.
- Khalili, H., Nejadhussein, S., & Fazel, A. (2013). The influence of entrepreneurial orientation on innovative performance: Study of a petrochemical company in Iran, *Journal of Knowledge-based Innovation in China*, 5(3), 262–278.
- Li, G., Lin, Y., Wang, S., & Yan, H. (2006). Enhancing agility by timely sharing of supply information. *Supply Chain Management: An International Journal of Management*, 11(5), 425-435.
- Lin CT, Hero Chiu H & Chu PY. (2006). Agility index in supply chain, *International Journal of Production Economics*, 100, 285–299.
- Lin, C.T., Chiu H & Tseng YH. (2006). Agility evaluation using fuzzy logic, *International Journal of Production Economics* 1(01), 353–368.
- Lin, C-H., Peng, C-H., & Kao, D.T. (2008). The innovativeness effect of market orientation and learning orientation on business performance, *International Journal of Manpower*, 29(8), 752–772
- Loos, J. (2006). Networking, the Missing link in firm based Entrepreneurial Orientation performance models.
- Lumpkin, G. T., & Dess, G.G. (1996). Clarifying the entrepreneurial orientation construct and linking it to performance, *Academy of Management Review* 21(1), 135–172.



- Mehdi, E., Seyyed, A., & Saeed, K. (2014). Entrepreneurial orientation and organizational agility in manufacturing firms. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, 22(2), 179-195
- Mishra, A., & Mishra, D. (2009). Customer relationship management: Implementation process perspective. *Acta Polytechnica Hungarica*, 6(4), 83
- Nwaeke and Obiekwe (2017). Impact of manpower training and development on organizational productivity and performance: A theoretical review. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 9(4): 154-159.
- Obiekwe (2018). Human capital development and organizational survival: A theoretical review. *International journal of management and sustainability*, 7(4) 194-203
- Oosterhout, M.V, Warts, E., & Hillegersber, V. J. (2006) Change factors requiring agility and implications for it. *European Journal of Information Systems*, 15(2), 4-58.
- Plonka, F.S (1997). Developing a lean and agile work force. *Human factors and Ergonomics in Manufacturing* 7(1), 11-20
- Ren, J., Yusuf, Y.Y., & Burns, ND. (2001). Organizational Competitiveness: Identifying the Critical Agile Attributes using Principal Component Analysis, 16th International Conference on Production Research, ID 0588, 29 July 3–August 2001, Prague.
- Schumpeter J. (1985) Invention, innovation and technological change. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 75(1), 152/ 56
- Sharifi, H., & Zhang, Z. (1999). A methodology for achieving: Agility in manufacturing organizations: An introduction. *International Journal of Production Economics*, 62(3), 64-69.
- Slater, S.F., & Narver, J.C. (1995). Market orientation and the learning organization. *Journal of Marketing*, 2(3), 5-10.
- Tahmasebifard, A., Zangouinezhad, A., & Jafari, P. (2017). Fast adaptation, strategic flexibility and entrepreneurial roles. *Chinese Management Studies*, 5(3), 256-271.
- Teece, D.J., Pisano, G., & Shuen, A. (1997). Dynamic capabilities and strategic management. *Strategic Management Journal*, 18(7), 509–33.
- Tseng, C.H. & Lin C.T. (2011). Enhancing enterprise agility by deploying agile drivers, capabilities and providers, *Information sciences* 18(1), 3693-3708.
- Yusuf, Y.Y., Sarhadi, M., & Gunasekaran, A. (1999). Agile manufacturing: The Drivers, concepts and attributes, *International Journal of Production Economics* 6(2), 33-43.



## THE IMPACT OF THE SEEDS ALREADY IMPLANTED BY “TALAL ABU-GHAZALEH ORGANIZATION” ON THE ORGANIZATION’S PERFORMANCE

**Professor Mohamad Shehada and Dr. Muntaha Bani-Hani**

Talal Abu Ghazaleh University College

**ABSTRACT:** *The objective of this paper is to measure the impact of the seeds (competence, creativity, innovation, technology, and entrepreneurship) that have been already implanted by Talal Abu-Ghazaleh Organization (TAGORG) on the performance of that organization. The target population for this study is 70-unit managers and their assistants at (TAGORG). 66-unit managers and their assistants participated in the completion of the questionnaires and 3 were excluded. The findings of the study stipulate that the seeds already implanted by (TAGORG), increased the effectiveness and efficiency of the services and image of (TAGORG). In order to formulate appropriate competitive advantage through the seeds implanted, it is first recommended to analyze the company’s strategic outputs. After all, this would create an environment within (TAGORG) to promote mutual respect, trust and concern between management and employees and that would influence performance.*

**KEYWORDS:** Culture, Performance, Knowledge, Competence, Creativity, Innovation, Entrepreneurship, Technology, Products, Services and Image.

### INTRODUCTION

“Culture is the DNA of human social systems, the ensemble of values, beliefs, history, traditions, way of thinking and doing, that link people together and make the organization’s identity” (Tito Conti, 2009). The organization’s culture of Talal Abu-Ghazaleh identifies and classifies itself with the knowledge it entertains, the competence it practices, the creativity that exists, the innovation that entails and the technology that is profoundly applied.

Values can be generated and created by organizations. Organizations decide the kind of value to be generated and the intended beneficiaries of it. Those beneficiaries might be the stakeholder, but also the organization itself to sustain its development. A fair balance between given and received value is necessary for keeping the level of employees’ contribution high. This point is critical when aiming at high performance.

To increase contributions and seek excellence, relations between employees themselves and employees and top management should be based on shared social values: trust, intellectual honesty, mutual respect, willingness to share information, and openness and transparency.

## Research Objectives

The objectives of the study include:

1. Defining the organizational culture of TAGORG.
2. Knowing the seeds that have been planted by TAGORG.
3. Exploring the impact of these seeds on TAGORG services and image.
4. Determining the most susceptible seed that affected TAGORG performance.
5. Identifying the possible solutions to increase the performance of TAGORG.
6. Helping the top management of Abu-Ghazaleh Organization to conduct a checkup based on the results of this project.

## Significance of the Study

Conducting such a project is very crucial and important. Most of the time we look at culture as a tool that influence our attitudes and has an impact on our behavior. Culture, to us, is our hidden father and mother. It has its values, customs, traditions, beliefs, way of thinking and way of doing things. It has to be respected not overlooked and obeyed; otherwise, we will be slapped and punished. Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization has its own flavor and unique culture. In this study, we try to investigate the impact of the seeds that have been already implanted by Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization's culture on the performance of the organization and the harvest the organization gained.

**Research Problem:** Organizational culture is the stem of excellence. Talal Abu-Gazaleh Organization has planted the seeds of their organizational culture (Competence, Creativity, Innovation, Technology and entrepreneurship) a long time ago and it is time to check whether these seeds have any impact on their services and image.

## Research Hypothesis

The Hypothesis for this paper are:

Ho1: The company performance (Services & Image) is not a result of the seeds (Competence, Creativity, Innovation, Technology and entrepreneurship) already implanted by Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

Ho2: The services that exist are not as a result of the seeds implanted by Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization (TAGORG) with its elements (Competence, Creativity, Innovation and Technology and entrepreneurship) at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

Ho3: The image that exists is not as a result of the seeds implanted by Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization (TAGORG) with its elements (Competence, Creativity, Innovation and Technology and entrepreneurship) at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

## Research Model

The Study will use various variables to gain better understanding of the research problem.

### Independent Variable X

Seeds of Corporate Culture

### Dependent Variable Y

Corporate Performance

Competence Com 1-6	
Creativity Cre-5	Services Ser-5
Innovation Inn-4	
Entrepreneurship Ent1-4	Image Img-5
Technology Tech-5	

**Definitions of Terms:** (Definitions are taken from Wikipedia and some other dictionaries).

**Competency:** “A cluster of related abilities, commitments, knowledge, and skills that enable a person (or an organization) to act effectively in a job or situation”.

**Creativity:** “The tendency to generate or recognize ideas, alternatives, or possibilities that may be useful in solving problems, communicating with others, and entertaining others and ourselves”.

**Innovation:** “The process of translating an idea or invention into a good or service that creates value for which customers will pay. To be called an innovation, an idea must be replicable at an economical cost and must satisfy a specific need. Innovation involves deliberate application of information, imagination and initiative in deriving greater or different values from resources, and includes all processes by which new ideas are generated and converted into useful products. In business, innovation often results when ideas are applied by the company in order to further satisfy the needs and expectations of the customer”.

**Technology:** “The application of scientific knowledge to the practical aims of human life or, as it is sometimes phrased, to the change and manipulation of the human environment”.

**Entrepreneurship:** “is what people do to take their career and dreams into their hands and lead it in the direction of their own choice. It is about building a life on their own terms. No bosses. No restricting schedules and no one holding them back. Entrepreneurs are able to take the first step into making the world a better place, for everyone in it”.

**Performance:** “The accomplishment of a given task measured against preset known standards of accuracy, completeness, cost, and speed. In a contract, performance is deemed to be the fulfillment of an obligation, in a manner that releases the performer from all liabilities under the contract”.

**Organizational Performance:** “Is a composite assessment of how well an organization executes on its most important parameters, typically financial, market and shareholder performance”.





## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

The social culture of the external environment is inevitably reflected in the company's (more generally, organizations) internal environment and culture. That is why understanding the culture of the environment and being in harmony - or, at least, coming to terms - with it, is of paramount importance, and will be more and more so with the progress of globalization. Globalization is the irreversible move from closed - or almost closed - systems to open systems. Such move was first forced by economic/trade interests, but the extent to which it will be successful in generating harmonious and peaceful growth worldwide depends on cultural attitudes: respect of cultural differences, not imposing one's own values, common research of shared values that can be accepted by all the interested parties. That certainly, means sacrifices from all sides and there seems to be no alternatives.

The ability to engage employees and customers, compete, and innovate have a great impact on organizational culture. OC is the set of interactions, values, visions, missions, the daily aspects of communication, and operational goals that create the organizational atmosphere that paves the way to people to work. "Corporate culture is, above all else, the most important factor in driving innovation." (Science Daily, 2016)

Business leaders should find out the way to create an effective organizational culture. If organizational culture has an influence on innovation, performance, and employee development and retention, then what is the bottom line for fostering that organizational environment ?

Checks and balances are used to enhance the organizational culture. New employees to the organization can be attracted to any organization by its culture but job fit and motivation must match a desire to integrate into the culture.

### **Talal Abu Ghazaleh Organization**

Talal Abu-Ghazaleh is the name of the person who created, established, nurtured and cherished this organization. He called the company after his name. The company was established in 1972 and with dedication, patience, long working hours, enthusiasm, and open-mindedness, the company grew up so fast and now it has branches all over the world. The company's main activities include: training, education, intellectual property, publications, broadcasting, legal consultations, financial controlling, internal & external auditing, information technology & social media, collection, quality control & assurance, trade mark protection, electronic archives, translation and others. The company became international and the number of employees working at TAGORG are counted by thousands covering most countries of the world.

### **Sources of Information**

In this paper, we used mainly primary and secondary sources to gather information. The secondary sources were gathered from journals, pamphlets, brochures, books, and websites. The primary sources were collected from distributing a questionnaire that was designed and articulated by a group of specialists and university professors in the field of management to check and examine the paragraphs of the questionnaire.



## Research Methods

**Method:** a survey study targeting employees working at TAGORG in winter 2018. The Survey contains a description of sample opinion on the seeds implanted by TAGORG and the TAGORG performance.

**Sample:** A random sample of (63) managers was used. The focus is on two issues the services provided and the image of TAGORG in the main offices and branches of TAGORG.

**Measures:** measures are designed through dialogue and representative ideas that belong to the seeds implanted and the performance of the corporation. Measures are classified into five dimensions (i.e. Competency, Creativity, Innovation, entrepreneurship and technology) and two dimensions to Organization Performance (i.e., Services and Image).

**Population:** The population of the study is the managers and their assistants at Talal Abu Ghazaleh organization. The sample consisted of 66 and 3 of which were excluded because they were not completed.

**Reliability:** “The reliability of a measure is an indication of the stability and consistency with which the instrument measure the concept and help assess the “goodness” of a measure”. (Sekaran & Bougie, 2010: 161-3).

The integrin consistency reliability is a test of consistency of respondents’ answers to all items in a measure. The most popular test of integrin consistency reliability is cronbach’s Alpha. (Ibid: 162). Sekaran.

Alpha values are shown in table 1. The range of these values is (0.63--0.92) which indicate the higher the coefficients, the better the measuring instrument.

**Table 1: Cronbach Alpha Values**

Variables	Variables
Competence	0.63
Creativity	0.81
Innovation	0.75
Entrepreneurship	0.77
Technology	0.90
Seeds Implanted	0.92
Services	0.83
Image	0.85
Corporate Performance	0.60
Total	0.90

## Validity

Measures derived from the questionnaire are reliable because they provide stable and reliable responses. In this paper, Cronbach's Alpha factor was > 70% and this shows valid and reliable results. Likert Scale 1= Strongly Disagree 2= Disagree 3=Neutral 4=Agree 5=Strongly Agree was used to analyze answers.

## Scope and Limitations

The difficulties we faced were : (1) the difficulty of finding similar studies done in similar manner in Jordan, so that we can compare our findings with others' findings; (2) we were surprised by the lack of cooperation by TAGORG managers in filling the questionnaire that we have distributed; (3) We have distributed 70 questionnaires to different departments and units in the company and only 66 were returned. After revising the filled questionnaires, only 63 were valid for analysis.

## RESULTS

### Descriptive Results

Table 2: This table shows the mean and standard deviation values of the seeds implanted and corporate performance. These values show the following:

1. Managers and their assistants at TAGORG perceived the seeds implanted as medium.
2. Innovation and creativity have given high attention while technology and competence have given medium attention.
3. Managers and their assistants at TAGORG have perceived the quality of corporate performance as medium.
4. Image has given medium attention while services have given low attention.

Standard deviation and mean values to the seeds implanted and corporate performance is (N=63).

### Analytical Results

For the purpose of testing the null hypothesis a multi regression is used to show the following models:

**Model (1)** is built on the null hypothesis: corporate performance does not depend on the seeds implanted.

Table 3: Indicates that the significance (f) value means the multi regression model is good enough to test the function idea.

Table 4: Indicates the results of analyzing that model. Depending on the (t) values and the significance of that.

We can classify the functions into two categories:

- a. Entrepreneurship has a significant impact on the Corporate Performance at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).
- b. Seeds implanted have no significant impact on the Corporate Performance at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).
- c. A value of ( $R^2 = 0.29$ ) which means Entrepreneurship can explain (0.29) change in the corporate performance. The results indicate the acceptance of the null hypothesis.

**Model 2:** Based on the null hypothesis the services offered are not a function of competency, creativity, innovation, technology, and entrepreneurship at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ )

Table 5: Shows the value (f) significant that gives approval of multi regression model that can be used to improve the function idea. Table (6) describes the output of analyzing this model.

According to (t) values and its significant the results indicate that Services are not a function of the seeds implanted therefore accepting the null hypothesis.

**Model 3:** Based on the null hypothesis, Image is not a function of competency, creativity, innovation, technology, and entrepreneurship at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

Table 7: Shows a significant value of (f). This indicates approval of multi regression model that can be used to improve function idea logic and shows outputs of analyzing model building logic. The results of (t) values and their significant take two orientations:

- Image is a function of Competency, Creativity, and entrepreneurship at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ )
- Image is not a function of Innovation, Technology at ( $\alpha = 0.05$ )
- A value of ( $R^2 = 0.32$ ) gives opportunity to explain (0.32) change in Image through three dimensions of Corporate Performance.

These results show a full acceptance of the null hypothesis.

**Descriptive Variables** = x1 x2 x3 x4 x5 x6 b1 b2 b3 b4 b5 n1 n2 n3 n4 nt1 nt2 nt3 tech1 tech2 tech3 tech4 tech5

Bg1 bg2 bg3 bg4 bg5 ss1 ss2 ss3 ss4 ss5 competency, creativity, innovation, technology, entrepreneurship, services, image.

**Table 2: Descriptive Statistics**

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
Com1	63	4.03	1.41
Com2	63	3.13	1.54
Com3	63	3.24	1.60
Com4	63	4.24	1.06
Com5	63	3.80	1.30
Com6	63	2.64	1.30
Cre1	63	4.33	0.86
Cre2	63	4.33	0.90
Cre3	63	4.29	0.91
Cre4	63	3.64	1.25
Cre5	63	4.08	1.02
Inn1	63	4.29	0.81
Inn2	63	4.35	1.01
Inn3	63	4.19	1.01
Inn4	63	3.89	0.97
Tech1	63	3.83	1.16
Tech2	63	4.4	0.96
Tech3	63	3.56	1.25
Tech4	63	4.03	1.06

Ent1	63	3.64	1.20
Ent2	63	3.87	1.21
Ent3	63	3.68	1.20
Ent4	63	3.79	1.11
Ent5	63	3.57	1.29
Ser1	63	2.51	1.55
Ser2	63	2.67	1.54
Ser3	63	2.71	1.49
Ser4	63	3.84	1.44
Ser5	63	3.06	1.52
Img1	63	4.11	1.06
Img2	63	4.08	1.05
Img3	63	1.6032	.88972
Img4	63	4.1746	1.07072
Competency	63	4.3492	.84546
Creativity	63	3.5106	.81533
Innovation	63	4.1333	.75605
Technology	63	4.1786	.72182
Entrepreneurship	63	3.3016	.85767
Services	63	2.9587	1.01719
Image	63	3.6635	1.16904
Performance	63	3.3111	.55860
Valid N (list wise)	63		.59218

**Table 3: Correlations**

	Competence	Creativity	Innovation	Technology	Entrepreneurship
Competence Pearson Correlation Sig. (2-tailed) No.	1 63	.580** .000 63	.536** .000 63	.485** .000 63	.358** .000 63
Competence Pearson Correlation Sig. (2-tailed) No.	.580** .000 63	1 63	.783 63	.698**	.541**
Competence Pearson Correlation Sig. (2-tailed) No.	.536** .000 63	1 63	1 63	.730** .000 63	.616** .000 63
Competence Pearson Correlation Sig. (2-tailed) No.	.485** .000 63	.698** .000 63	.730** .000 63	1 63	.564** .000 63
Competence Pearson Correlation Sig. (2-tailed) No.	.358** .000 63	.541** .000 63	.616** .000 63	.564** .000 63	1 63

**\*\*Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)**

**Table 4: Model Summary**

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.569a	.324	.265	.47903

*Predictors: (constant), entrepreneurship, Competence, Technology, Creativity, Innovation*

**Table 5**

Model	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	R	R2
Regression	6.266	5	1.253	5.462	.000a	0.57	0.32
Residual	13.080	58	.229				
Total	19.346	63					

a. *Predictors: (constant), entrepreneurship, Competence, Technology, Creativity, Innovation*

b. *Dependent Variable: Image*

**Table 6: Coefficients**

Model	Unstandardized Coefficient		Standardized Coefficient		
	B	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig.
1 (constant)	2.801	.374	-.271	7.491	.000
Competence	-.186	.093	.528	-1.997	.051
Creativity	.390	.141	.114	2.763	.575
Innovation	.088	.156	.227	.564	.575
Technology	.148	.111	-.516	1.331	.189
Entrepreneurship	-.283	.078		-3.638	.001

**Table 7: Correlations**

	Comp.	Creat.	Innov.	Tech.	Entrep.	Ser.	Image	Perf.
Competence Pearson	1	.580**	.536**	.485**	.358**	.282*	.021	.289
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)		.000	.000	.000	.000	.025	.871	.022
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63
Creativity Pearson	.580**	1	.783	.698**	.541**	.254	.339**	.410**
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.000					.045	.007	.001
N	63	63	63			63	63	63
Innovation Pearson	.536**	.783	1	.730**	.616**	.237	.229	.342**
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.000	.000	.000	.061	.070	.000
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63



Technology Pearson	.485**	.698**	.730**	1	.564**	.320*	.256**	.436**
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.000		.000	.011	.43	.000
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63
Entrepreneurship Pearson	.358**	.541**	.616**	.564**	1	.532**	-.130	.464**
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.000	.000		.000	.311	.000
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63
Services Pearson	.282*	.254	.237	.320*	1	.532**	-.130	.464**
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.025	.045	.061	.011		.000	.311	.000
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63
Image Pearson	.021	.339**	.229	.256*	-.130	-.211	1	.263*
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.871	.007	.070	.43	.311	.096		.037
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63
Performance Pearson	.289	.410**	.342**	.436**	.464**	.887**	.236*	1
Correlation Sig. (2-tailed)	.022	.001	.006	.000	.000	.037	.037	
N	63	63	63	63	63	63	63	63

\*\* Correlation is significant at 0.01 level (2-tailed)

\* Correlation is significant at 0.05 level (2-tailed)

## CONCLUSION

The managers and their assistants at Talal Abu-Ghazaleh Organization (TAGORG) have to think deeply of the critical issues belonging to the company performance. Improvement and maintenance of the output of the organization performance depends on discovering the seeds implanted by TAGORG.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

The findings of this paper suggest that TAGORG can create more customers' satisfaction by improving overall customer relationship quality, communicating information to customers efficiently and accurately, showing real commitment to service, handling potential and manifest conflicts skillfully, and delivering services competently. TAGORG should take into consideration the following:

1. Develop employee's responsibilities and roles;
2. Increase career progression opportunities;
3. Employee satisfaction;
4. Recognize successes;
5. Offer talent retention bonuses.

Moreover, leaders at TAGORG should consider the following:

- Owners must have an understanding of the behavioral tendencies and thinking of their employees and how their mental energy manifests itself in outward behavior.
- Organizational goals should be related to allow employees to internalize those goals and identify with them.
- Promoting shared knowledge base and diverse thinking to create a true sense of collaboration within the organization is the function of the owners of TAGORG.

## Future Research

In order to monitor the performance of the TAGORG, it is beneficial to make statistical comparison between some of the regional and international companies and TAGORG and to keep records of some of the statistics that show the followings:

- The Number of innovative and creative ideas, the level of competency among employees, the degree of advancement in technology, the number of entrepreneurs that jumped out of the bottle.
- The ratio of employees participated in giving suggestion compared with total number of the organization headcount.
- The annual budget consumed for the rewards and incentives.

## REFERENCES

- Alkailani M, Azzam I.A., Athamneh A.B. (2012), "Replicating Hofstede in Jordan: Ungeneralized, Reevaluating the Jordanian Culture". *International Business Research* 5: 71-80.
- Allred SB, Ross-Davis A (2011), "The Drop-Off and Pick-Up Method: An Approach to Reduce Nonresponse Bias in Natural Resource Surveys. *Small-Scale Forestry*", 10: 305-318.
- Al-Rasheedi, S. (2012), "Influence of National Culture on Employee Commitment Forms: A case study of Saudi-Western IJVs vs Saudi Domestic companies". University of Warwick, WMG
- Arifin M. (2015), The Influence of Competence, Motivation, and Organizational Culture to High School Teacher Job Satisfaction and Performance. *International Education Studies* 8: 38 - 44.
- Ashipaoloye F.K (2014), A Comparative Analysis of the Organizational Culture and Employee's Motivation of Selected Cities in Calabarzon: Basis for Employee's Motivation, Leadership and Innovative Management. *APJMR* 2: 54-63.
- Aviv, S., Maria, S.A., Minoo, F. (2007), Hofstede's Dimensions of Culture in International Marketing Studies. *J. Bus. Res.* **60**(3), 277-284
- Bigliardi B, Dormio AI, Galati F, Schiuma G. (2012), The Impact of Organizational Culture on the Job Satisfaction of Knowledge Workers. *VJIKMS* 42: 36-51.
- Chell, E. (1994), Making the Right Decision, Organizational Culture, Vision and Planning, *International Small Business Journal*, January-March 12(2): 90.
- Contiu L.C., Gabor MR, Oltean F.D. (2012), Employee's Motivation from a Cultural Perspective-A Key Element of the Hospitality Industry Competitiveness. *Procedia Economics and Finance* 3: 981-986.
- Ehteshamul M., Muhammad, S. A. (2011), Impact of Organizational Culture on Performance management practices in Pakistan. Department of Management Sciences, COMSASTS Institute of information Technology, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Elenkov, D. S., Judge, W. & Wright, P. (2005), Strategic Leadership and Executive Innovation Influence: an International Multi-Cluster Comparative Study. *Strategic Management Journal*, 26:665-682.
- Hockings, M., Stolton, S., Leverington, F., Dudley, N. and Courrau, J. (2006), Evaluating Effectiveness: a Framework for Assessing Management Effectiveness of Protected



- Areas. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Cambridge, UK and IUCN, Switzerland: IUCN. Hofstede, G. 1980. *Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work Related Values*, Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.
- Jaara, Hani Youssef Khalil, (2010), *Organizational Culture and its Relationship with Organizational Affiliation, Empirical Study on the Staff of Government Institutions in the Southern Part of the West Bank*, Unpublished Master Thesis, Graduate Studies, Jerusalem, Palestine
- Kaiser, R. B., Hogan, R. & Craig, S. B. (2008), *Leadership and the Fate of Organizations*, *American Psychologist*, 63(2):96-100.
- Kalaw J.F (2014), *Organizational Culture and Job Satisfaction among Teaching Employees of Lyceum of the Philippines University-Batangas: Basis of Enhancement*. *International Journal of Information, Business and Management* 6.
- Karlsen J.T. (2011), *Supportive Culture for Efficient Project Uncertainty Management*. *Int J Managing Projects in Bus*, 4: 240-256.
- Koesmono H.T. (2014), *The Influence of Organizational Culture, Servant Leadership, and Job Satisfaction Toward Organizational Commitment and Job Performance Through Work Motivation as Moderating Variables for Lecturers in Economics and Management of Private Universities in East Surabaya*. *Educational Research International* 3: 25-39.
- Madu B.C. (2012), *Organizational Culture as Driver of Competitive Advantage*. *JABE* 5:1-9.
- Mihaela O. C. lin P. (2014), *The Relationship between Staff Motivation - Organizational Culture - Company Performance*. *Annals of the Constantin Brâncuși University of Târgu Jiu, Economy Series: ISSN-L 1844 - 7007*.
- Rogers, P. & Meehan, P. (2007), *Building a Winning Culture*, *Business Strategy Series*, 8(4): 254-261.
- Sokro E. (2012), *Analysis of the Relationship That Exists Between Organizational Culture, Motivation and Performance*. *Problems of Management in the 21st Century*. Volume 3:106-118.
- Suppiah V, Sandhu M. S. (2011), *Organizational Culture's Influence on Tacit Knowledge-sharing Behavior*. *Journal of Knowledge Management* 15: 462-477.
- Sysinger Y.E. (2012), *A Study of Organizational Culture and Commitment in Manufacturing Organizations*, PhD thesis, Purdue University, Indiana.
- Szczepaska-Woszczyna K. (2014), *The Importance of Organizational Culture for Innovation in the Company*. *Forum Scientiae Oeconomia* 2: 2-39.
- Taurisa C.M., Ratnawati I. (2012), *Analysis of the Effect of Organizational Culture and Organizational Commitment on Job Satisfaction in Improving the Performance of Employees (Study on PT. Sido Appears Kaligawe Semarang)*. *JBE* 19: 170-187
- Uddin M.J, Luva, RH, Hossian S.M.M (2012), *Impact of Organizational Culture on Employee Performance and Productivity: A Case Study of Telecommunication Sector in Bangladesh*. *International Journal of Business and Management* 8: 21-30.
- Yeh H, Chien S (2012), *The Mediating Effect of Organizational Commitment on Leadership Type and Job Performance*. *HRAL* 8: 50-59.
- Yusof H. S.M, Said NSM, Ali S.RO (2016) *A Study of Organizational Culture and Employee Motivation in Private Sector Company*. *J Applied Environment* 6: 50-54.



## EFFECT OF EMPLOYEE TRAINING ON PERFORMANCE OF SELECTED MULTINATIONAL CORPORATIONS IN NIGERIA

**Dr. Dim Ethelmary<sup>1</sup>, Emeakayi Hope Chizoba<sup>2</sup> and Arua Nneka Maria<sup>3</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Senior Lecturer Department of Business Administration Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University, Igbariam Campus

<sup>2</sup>Lecturer Department of Business Administration Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University, Igbariam Campus

<sup>3</sup>PhD Student Department of Business Administration Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University, Igbariam Campus

**ABSTRACT:** *This study examined effect of employee training on performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria. Both primary and secondary data was employed, population of the study was 2774 but Taro Yamane formular was adopted to trim it to a sizable figure of 359. Questionnaire were distributed in order to realize a quality data; descriptive survey design was adopted to add value to the study. Conclusions were established that employee training has a positive significant with employee performance, findings disclosed that there is a significant relationship between coaching and employee performance. Recommendations were made that organization should evaluate coaching type of training and development programs; it is vital to evaluate coaching in order to assess its effectiveness in learning outcome of employees.*

**KEYWORDS:** Employee Training, Multinational Corporations, Coaching, Mentoring, Training & Development, Nigeria

## INTRODUCTION

### Background of the Study

This research work explored Employee training and Organizational performance. Training of employees has been one of the pressing problems that have greatly affected the performance of organizations. Employee training is essential features of an organization aims at achieving an effective performance in an environment that is ever dynamic and volatile.

The history of training in business organizations is as old as the entire history of business organizations Miller (2006). This is because the knowledge base or skill of the normal employees in the labour market is not sufficient for the specialized task within the organization. Training started about century ago, when researchers started a branch of research under the name of "Vocational training" (Salas and Cannon Bowers, 2001). The beginning of the twentieth century and especially after World War 2 saw the wide spread of training programs among organizations, involving more and more employees. Luo (2000). In the 1910s, only a few large companies such as Westinghouse, General Electric, and International Harvest had factory schools that focused on training technical skills for entry-levels workers. By the end of 1990, forty percent of the fortune 500 firms in America had a corporate university or learning centers Meister (1997).



Training in Nigeria can be traced back to 1960 when it was discovered that most of the top government and business positions were occupied by expatriates Olalere and Adesoji, (2013). The departure of the whites after the independence gave rise to a big vacuum of capable indigenous human capital. This prompted the Federal Government of Nigeria to set up a Manpower Board in 1962 following the Ashby Commission's Recommendations Olalere and Adesoji, (2013). Consequently, the Federal Government of Nigeria established complimentary institution like the Centre for Management Development (CMD), Administrative staff College of Nigeria, Industrial Training Fund (ITF), and Federal Training Centre to train and retrain employees as well as give orientation to fresh graduates of formal academic institutions Olalere and Adesoji, (2013).

In third world countries most people associated multinational companies with neo-colonialism while the Euro-American nations described multinationals as the engine of growth in the under developed countries. These two opposing views about multinationals will help to examine what multinational corporations are all about.

An organization is classified as international when the organization engages in foreign business but has no direct investment.

Some of these multinational companies are Guinness Nig Ltd. Nigerian Breweries, oil companies like chevron, Total, Texaco, PZ, UAC and a host of others. These above-mentioned corporations have their headquarters in the United States of America and Europe with huge capital and assets based and technical skills extended to their respective countries where their branches are located.

The local branches are mere subsidiaries and are located mainly in under developed countries of the world. "The effect of these multinational have contributed to the improvement of the economics of such countries where they have their subsidiaries. These corporations are believed to be facilitating the transfer of technology to- the less developed countries.

Guinness Nigeria PLC is a brewery company with many branches nationwide and its headquartered office situated in Lagos. The company has staff strength of over 15,000 workers and a large number of casual workers. They manufacture Guinness Stout, Harp Beer, Guinness malt, and the rest of others. Research made to the company the major aim of Guinness is to impact knowledge to Nigerian, technology transfers and skill development that Nigerians can set up their own brewery industries to manufacture their own brands of beer.

Texaco commences operation in Nigeria in 1961 under business name American oversea Corporation, Joint business with Standard Oil Corporation of California Chevron, Drilling Operation began in 1963 after Biafran war production rose to 2,500 barrels of oil per day production boomed in 1984 with 65,000 per day. The firm operating name changed to Texaco Overseas Corporation of Nigeria now becoming 60% for NNPC, 20% for Texaco and 20% for Chevron. Chevron's activities inland and in shallow waters has been deeply affected by infighting between ethnic groups in host communities but the company has been active producing in western Nigeria

UAC Known as UACN was incorporated under the name Nigerian Motors Ltd on April 22, 1931 as a wholly owned subsidiary of the United Africa Corporation Ltd but later became UACI now subsidiary of unilever. Many of these companies later became divisions under UAC of Nigeria in 1973 following consolidation exercise.



PZ cussons is a major British manufacturer of personal healthcare products and consumer goods, it operates worldwide mostly in Africa and Commonwealth nations, the company is listed on the London Stock Exchange and Consitituent of the FTSE 250 Index it was founded in 1975 when the firm took over Cussons Soap from Cusson family who founded it in 1938. PZ expanded during 20<sup>th</sup> century acquiring factories and establishing officer in every corner.

### **Statement of the Problem**

The perception of employees on training has a greater impact on the success of any organization. If the employees are satisfied with the training policies of the organization, this will have a positive impact on the organization's performance. The perception or attitude of employees is transformed into positive or negative behavior. How seriously does the Management take the Training Policy of its organization? Some see training and development as a waste of time and resources that would have been employed in the production of goods and services that will yield profit to the organization. Sometimes, the fear that an employee could leave the organization after training affects the employees training and sometimes makes it unplanned and unsystematic.

The procedure and process usually adopted by some Human Resource Departments in the identification of those employees that require training are worrisome. Employees sometimes go for training for personal reasons which include enriching themselves; preparing themselves for other positions in other organizations; power play/politics; because he/she knows the person in-charge of training and not necessarily because there is an identified skill gap which needs to be filled through training.

These multinational companies find it difficult to transfer skills and technology to indigenous employees because it is not their people they will like them to serve them as slaves without acquiring any knowledge or skills it is against this back drops that we fall back to study the effect of employee training on performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria.

### **Objective of the Study**

The main objective of this study is to investigate Employee training and Organizational performance of selected multinational corporation with focus on the processes and procedures of selecting employees for training. However, specific objectives of the study are as follows:

1. To examine the nature of relationship between coaching and Job satisfaction in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
2. To find out the relationship between mentoring and employee Commitment in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
3. To identify the nature of relationship between on the job training and Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
4. To identify the nature of relationship between off the job training and Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

## **Research Hypotheses**

For the purpose of this study, these hypotheses will be tested.

1. H1: There is a significant relationship between Coaching and Job satisfaction in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
2. H1: There is a significant relationship between mentoring and employee Commitment in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
3. H1: There is a significant relationship between on the job training and Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.
4. H1: There is a significant relationship between off the job training and Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria

## **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**

### **Review of Related Literature**

Much have been said and written about the activities of multinational companies in developing countries. But not many of such literatures however, focused squarely on the very subject, which this study intends to examine. The researcher consulted previous work related to this subject and their fact were analyzed, and re-interpreted, ideas and opinion already expressed by various scholars were also taken into considerations. In view of this, a proper view of previous literatures of this research becomes highly desirable.

### **Conceptual Review**

Discussion of cultural environment, its diversity and influence on domestic and global business activities has no limit. Hick and Gullet (2001) posit that no business function in a vacuum; it operates within internal and external environment. Cultural environment is a part of external environment of business, which creates challenges and influence on the conduct of business and consumer pattern of consumption.

Multinational Corporations have been widely defined as business enterprises that maintain value added-holdings overseas. Dunning (2008) sees Multinational Corporation as an enterprise that engages in foreign direct investment (FDI) and that controls value added holdings in more than one country. Multinational Corporations are economic organizations that evolve from its national origins and span across borders (Kogut and Zander, 2003). To Akinsanya (1984), multinational corporations are foreign firms outside the shore of original domain. Jones (2002) describes Multinational Corporation as one which undertakes foreign direct investment, own or control income-earning assets, produces goods and services outside its country of origin in more than one country. Caves (2007) lent credence-to the view of Jones (2002) that multinational corporation carries out its business in other geographical areas outside the area of origin.

In cross border business, multinational corporations' step into different cultural environment that is characterized by unfamiliar value systems, customs, norms, ethos, behaviour, lifestyle, languages, beliefs and religion. Miroshink (2002) notes that cultural environment of the host



countries places restriction on the business undertakings of multinational firms. He attributes the cultural blunders, committed by multinational enterprises and business managers to poor acculturation 'and further opines that multinational corporations gain competitive advantage in the host countries through intercultural alignment.

Cross cultural risk is exacerbated by ethnocentric/home country orientation where one's own culture is used as standard for judging other countries. Howard (2009) argues that managers who engage in cross boarder should give up their ethnocentric orientation in favour of polycentric, geocentric orientation and acculturation for inter-cultural alignment. Howard (2009), polycentric orientation focuses on the host country mindset where business managers develop greater affinity with the country in which they carry out their business activities, 'Geocentric orientation is a global mindset where business managers are able to understand business across national geographical boundary while acculturation is the process of adjusting and adapting to a culture other than one's own.

Williams, James and Susan (2005) hold that religion and language are important aspects of culture, which have significant impact on business management. Religion as part of culture goes with certain beliefs and perceptions. It influences the type of business activities to operate on. Every form of culture is identified with language. Language is used to promote products and services; it affects consumer behaviour and makes consumers to accept a product. Advertising, personal selling, sales promotion and publicity cannot be effectively used without language (Ekpette; 2001). Language 'means different things to different people of diverse cultures.

### **1. Employment Generation:**

The multinational has employed so many Nigerians in their organization, thereby reducing unemployment problem in the country. They have equally contributed to the promotion of most business activities. This is so because all most every shop in this country sells their products, this will help to create self-employment.

### **2. Education:**

Apart from assisting tertiary institutions in the country financially, the multinational such as Nigeria Breweries, oil companies Texaco, Chevron etc, offers scholarship to our deserving sons and daughters in their various discipline of higher institutions of learning.

### **3. Health:**

The multinational companies do not only take care of their employee's families and even relations. Above all, they help in establishing hospitals and clinics in Nigeria for example; Guinness plc constructed an eye clinic with hospital equipment and handed it over to the Anambra State Government.

### **4. Skill Development:**

Many Nigerians have been trained in their various skills both in technical and managerial profession by the multinational after being trained worked for some time with their companies, left the classroom in our universities thus putting practical experiences into our students.





## **5. Social Responsibilities:**

Multinational always put something back into the society as reward for purchasing their products through activities such as becoming leaders in the crusade, for environmental protection. They have helped in the building of primary, secondary school hospitals and the rest of others.

### **Training**

Training has been defined by different authors in different ways. Training primarily focused on teaching organizational members on how to perform their current jobs and helping them acquire knowledge and skill they need to be effective performers. Jones, George and Hill (2000) Another concept says that "it is a systematic acquisition and development of the knowledge and skill and attitude required by employees to adequately perform a task or job or to improve performance in the job environment" Tharenou, Saksand Moore, (2007).

Other scholars view training as "a planned process to modify attitude, knowledge or skill behavior through learning experience to achieve effective performance in any activity or range of activities Beardwell and Holden (2001). Training has the distinct role in the achievement of any work force Stone RJ (2002).

### **The Purpose of Staff Training**

A number of authors recognize the purpose of training as being to develop capacities of employees and by extension represents an investment in human resources Ulrich and Lake, (1990). The quality of employees and their development through training and education are major factors in determining long-term profitability of any business venture.

Noe (2008) says Human Resource professionals also believe that an organization is only as good as its employees, and this understanding suggests that training should be more specifically responsive to employees' training needs. Arguing in the same line, Bratton and Gold (2000) affirm that successful corporate leaders recognize that their competitive edge in today's market place is their people. They also acknowledge that few organizations know how to manage human resources effectively, primarily because traditional management models are inappropriate in today's dynamic work environment.

To manage an organization both large and small requires staffing them with competent employees. The formal educational system in Nigeria does not adequately teach specific job skills for a position in a particular organization and few employees have the requisite knowledge, abilities, skills and competencies needed to work. As a result, many employees require extensive training on the job to acquire the necessary knowledge, abilities, skills and competencies needed to make substantive contribution towards the organization's growth.

### **Types of Training**

The type of employee training which is best suited to a particular organization depends on a number of considerations. The skill gap to be filled, the job description, the employee present qualification and the challenges faced by the employee in performing his/her job. The approaches that can be used in implementing training fall broadly into two categories namely:

on-the job and off-the job techniques, notwithstanding that some of the training techniques cut across Kempton, (1995).

### 1. On-the-Job Training

Adamu (2008) asserts that on-the-job training is designed to impart knowledge of job by working under an experienced worker. The trainer or the experienced worker teaches and advises the trainee on specific methods and techniques of doing the job. In some cases, the trainee is expected to learn by watching the master. The trainee is learning and at the same time working, although the trainee's output will not be much. The procedure is usually unsystematic and most times, it is by trial and error. Baum and Devine (2007) opine that it is better for the organizations to give their employees on the job training because it is cost effective and time saving. Besides, it helps their employees learn in a practical way.

### 2. Off-the-Job Training

Off-the job training is a process of acquiring skill and knowledge at a location different from the employee office. It includes group discussion, individual tutorials, lectures, reading, training courses and workshops Kempton, (1995). It permits individuals to leave their primary place of work for a different location. Its advantage includes, the trainee's ability to concentrate, analyze past behaviors and reflect on what has been successful and what has not Okanya, (2008). This kind of training offers an opportunity to impart knowledge and skills that can be learnt or practiced in a safe and conducive atmosphere. Kempton (1995) opines that if training is conducted in an organized and systematic way it will be able to develop new attitudes and experiences that contribute to the success of the organization, improve employee morale which would translate to better performance and greater performance and create a psychological climate which orients the activities of each employee towards achieving the goals of the organization.

**Mentoring:** mentoring enables staff to acquire skills needed to progress effectively in their work environment. There is no doubt that the effect of teaching on worker received sooner or later show on them

**Coaching:** in this techniques, the manager (trainer) and the subordinate trainee work together in a student- tutor relationship in which trainer couches and guides the trainee and the purpose is to explain the "whys" and "hows" of particular job functions, and provides feed back to the trainee regarding his performance and any grounds for improvements.

### The Advantages of Training

In the words of Nwachukwu (1998) the advantage of training are:

1. **It Improves Employee's Morale:** An employee who has undergone a good training programme feels confident that he is capable of executing daily task. This increases his liking for his job, unlike one who has not been trained and finds job very difficult. His ability to do his job correctly, gives him more feeling of satisfaction.
2. **Closely Allied to a Low Turnover Rate:** It is the feeling that once, an establishment makes an investment in an employee, it gives him a feeling of belonging, and the general

impression that the organization will value him. Each training course that he gets reinforces his belief in the organization and himself as he familiarizes with his tools to mastering the working of the machinery, to obtaining the technique knowledge required for doing minor repairs. This ability of course, improves his chances of promotion from junior to senior staff with all its benefits.

3. **Performance Increase in the Organization:** There is an increase in both 'quality and quantity of output because of increasing the skills of the employees.
4. **Employees Performance Increases:** Training applies to new employees as well as to the experienced ones. It helps to increase the employee level of performance on their present jobs.

### **Problems of Training**

Philips (1983) identified four problems that militate against management training and development in Nigeria: They are:

1. The explosion of economic activities, which have given rise to excessive expansion of institutions and creation of new ones, both in government and in private sectors. The effect cannot really be supplemented.
2. There is element of creeping ineffectiveness of management. This is evident by the growing level of indiscipline and authoritarian tendencies both in public and private institutions.
3. There is also the problem of reluctance to release staff particularly good ones for any external period of training. The reason for this is that the burden of day-to-day management is becoming so great that the organization can no longer spare existing personnel for training.
4. Recruiting qualified trainers and selection of the appropriate trainees have been a major problem facing human resources development in Nigeria.

### **Organizational Performance**

Baker & Sinkula (1999). Organizational performance encompasses three specific areas of organizational outcome (1) Financial performance (profits, return on assets, return on investment) (2) market performance (sales, market sales) (3) shareholders return (total shareholder return, economic value added).

Organizational performance is the most important criterion in evaluating performance of organization, their actions and environment. Organizational performance is one of the most important variable in management research because continuous performance is the focus of any organization in that it is only through performance that organizations are able to grow and progress, we agree that organization performs when they accomplish their goals leading to show that profit is one of the indicators of performance when organization is performing it leads to increase in profit, large market share, international recognition, sustainability etc. Performance is highly needed in organizations.

## Theoretical Framework

Theory of Chris Agris of 1923-2013 and Schultz in 1961 and developed by Becker in 1994

Christ Agris believes that employees are not lazy but they behave the way they do due to how they are being treated at workplace (as children)

He propounded immaturity and maturity theory which sees employees as migrating from immaturity to maturity, He indicates that human personality develops from immaturity to maturity

<b>Immaturity</b>	<b>Maturity</b>
Passivity dependence	Activity Relative independence
Behave in few ways	Behave in many ways
Erratic, shallow interest	Deeper Interest
Short time perspective	Long-time perspective
Subordinate position	Superior position
Lack of awareness of self	Awareness/self-control

The more we understand employee needs and integrate these needs with that of organization it leads to better achievement of organizational goals, because employees will co-operate, training leaders leads to maturity because all the employees will learn through training and will lead to better performance and the employees will know that the organization has his/her interest in mind which lead to greater performance for achieving organization objectives.

This study is also based on human capital theory proposed by Schultz in 1961 and developed by Becker in 1994. According to the theory, Human capital theory suggests that education or training raises the performance of workers by imparting useful knowledge and skills, hence raising workers' future income by increasing their lifetime earnings (Becker, 1994). The human capital model suggests that an individual's decision to invest in training is based upon an examination of the net present value of the costs and benefits of such an investment. Individuals are assumed to invest in training during an initial period and receive returns to the investment in subsequent periods.

## Empirical Review

Several works have been done in the area of employee training, and organizational performance.

Hameed & Waheed (2011) carried out a conceptual review in Togo on Employee training and Its effect on Employee Performance. The authors noted that the success or failure of the organization depends on employee performance. With this, organizations are investing huge amount of money on employee training. Their study analyzed the theoretical framework and its effect on employee performance. Further discussion proposed model which explains the relationship between employee development variables (employee learning, skill growth, self-

directed, employee attitude) and employee performance variable. Result reveals that employee training has effect on employee performance.

Mehrabani & Mohamad (2011) carried out a qualitative study in Iran that introduce the "training activities" and "knowledge sharing" as two variables which impact on the relation of "leadership development" on "organizational performance", the interviewers chosen are the managers and key executives of three Iranian oil companies. The results of their study show that by using the 'training activities and 'knowledge sharing" with the enhancement of leadership organizational performance too would enhance. In addition, six training activities are introduced as the most important methods in this study. These activities are; Case study, Role play, Action learning, 360-degree feedback, Job rotation, and Job assessment. They concluded that training activities is important requirements for enhancing the organizational effectiveness. They also suggested that performing a quantitative approach to find out the importance of each factor as a moderator in the relationship between leadership and organizational performance is useful.

### Research Design

A descriptive survey design was used for this study since it gives the reader background information on how to evaluate the findings and draw conclusions.

### Population of the Study

The population comprised of senior & junior staff in Selected multinational corporations used in Nigeria, the records was obtained from human resources department of each company (2019).

**Table 1: Breakdown of Population of the Study.**

S/N	NAME	POPULATION
1	Texaco Nigeria plc	479
2	Guinness Nigeria plc,	780
3	UAC Nigeria plc	870
4	Chevron Nigeria plc	645
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>2774</b>

### Sample Size and Sampling Technique

Sample size determination is the act of choosing the number of observations or replicates to include in a statistical sample. Random sampling was used in distributing the questionnaires to the study sample; we chose this procedure because it is much easier and economical to select using a random sample.

### Formula: Using Taro Yamane formula

$$N = \frac{N}{1 + N (e)^2}$$

Where:

$n$  = desired sample size

$N = 2774$

$e$  = Limit of error tolerance which was assured to be 5% (0.05): confidence limit.

Computing with the above formula, the number of questionnaires to be administered was obtained

$N = 2774$

$e = 5\%$  or 0.05

Therefore,

$$n = \frac{2774}{1 + 2774 (0.05)^2}$$

$$n = \frac{2774}{1 + 2774 (0.0025)}$$

$$n = \frac{2774}{1 + 3.61}$$

$$n = \frac{2774}{7.735}$$

$n = 358.6$  as sample size from a population of 2774

Therefore, the sample size of this study is 359

### Methods of Data Analysis

This represents the procedures for analysing data collected. Deals with technical procedures needed to carry out the statistical or quantitative analysis. The data generated through the questionnaires was analysed through the aid of a computer system and the application of SPSS (Statistical Package for Social Sciences). Frequency and simple percentages were used to present the personal information of the respondents. Correlation and Multiple Regression were used to analyse the hypotheses. The regression model is represented as:

$$Y = \alpha + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \beta_4 X_4 + \beta_n X_n + \epsilon$$

Where:

$Y$  = Organizational Performance (OP)

$\alpha$  = Constant Term

$\beta$  = Beta coefficients

$X_1$  = Coaching (C)



$X_2$ = mentoring (M)  
 $X_3$ = On the Job Training (ONJT)  
 $X_4$ = Off the Job Training (OFJT)  
 $X_4$ = Job Rotation (JR)  
 $\epsilon$  = Error Term

### Presentation of Demographic Data

**Table 2: Gender of the Respondents**

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Male	146	59.0	60.4	60.4
	Female	124	41.2	39.6	100.0
	Total	300	100	100.0	
Total		300	100		

*Source: Field Survey, 2019/SPSS*

The table above shows the demographic profile of the employees of the sampled Multinational Corporations in Delta State, Nigeria. A higher proportion of the respondents (59%) are female while 41% of the respondents are female.

**Table 3: Marital Status of the Respondents**

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Married	100	33	33	40
	Single	180	60	60	60
	Others	20	7	7	100.0
	Total	300	100	100.0	

*Source: Field Survey, 2019/SPSS*

Table 4.2 shows that 60% of the respondents are single, 33% are married while the remaining 17% of the respondents are either divorced or separated.

**Table 4: Age Bracket of the Respondents**

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	20 - 30 years	100	33	33	33
	31 - 40 years	148	49	49	49
	41 - 50 years	38	13	13	18
	51 years and above	14	5	5	100.0
	Total	300	100	100.0	

*Source: Field Survey, 2019/SPSS*

The table above revealed the age bracket of the respondents. The distribution shows that 33% of the respondents are between the age brackets of 20 to 30 years while 148 respondents

representing 49% are within the age bracket of 31 - 40 years. On the same note, 13% of the respondents are within the age bracket of 41 - 50 years while the remaining respondents representing 5% are within the age bracket of 51 years and above.

**Table 5: Educational Qualification of the Respondents**

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	OND/NCE	100	33	33	33
	B.Sc./HND	160	53	53	53
	M.Sc./MBA	34	11	11	11
	Others	6	3	3	3
	Total	300	100	100.0	100.0

*Source: Field Survey, 2019/SPSS*

Table 4.4 further shows that 33% of the respondents have either Ordinary National Diploma or National Certificate on Education as their educational qualification. 67% of the respondents agreed that they have either Bachelor of Science (B.Sc.) or Higher National Diploma (HND). The table also shows that 32% of the respondents have worked in the Multinational Corporations between zero to five years while 53% of the respondents have worked between 6 to 10 years. On a similar note, 14% of the respondents have worked between 11 to 15 years while the remaining 4% have worked between 6 years and above.

### Multiple Regression Analysis

Multiple regression result was employed to test Employee Training and Organizational Performance. The result of the multiple regression analysis is presented in the tables below.

**Table 6: Summary of the Regression Result**

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	.286 <sup>a</sup>	.682	.570	3.212	1.667

*a. Predictors: (Constant), CO, ME, ONJT, OFJT, JR*

*b. Dependent Variable: Organizational Performance*

*Source: SPSS Version 21.0*

Table 6 shows that  $R^2$  which measures the strength of the effect of independent variable on the dependent variable have the value of 0.682. This implies that 68% of the variation in Organizational is explained by variations in Coaching (C), mentoring (M), On the Job Training (ONJT), Off the Job Training (OFJT) and Job rotation (JR). This is supported by adjusted  $R^2$  of 0.570.

In order to check for autocorrelation in the model, Durbin-Watson statistics was employed. Durbin-Watson statistics of 1.667 in table 4.4 shows that the variables in the model are not autocorrelated and that the model is reliable for predications.

**Table 7: ANOVA Result**

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regression	281.805	4	70.451	6.830	.000 <sup>b</sup>
1 Residual	3156.413	306	10.315		
Total	3438.219	310			

a. *Dependent Variable: Organizational performance*

b. *Predictors: (Constant), Coaching, mentoring, On the Job Training, Off the Job Training, Job rotation*

Source: SPSS Version 21.0

The f-statistics value of 6.830 in table 4.5 with f-statistics probability of 0.000 shows that the independent variables has significant relationship with the dependent variable. This shows that), Coaching, mentoring, On the Job Training, Off the Job Training and Job rotation can collectively explain the variations in Organizational performance in the selected multinational companies.

**Table 8: Coefficients of the Model**

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	18.325	1.834		9.994	.000
Coaching	.118	.044	.151	2.660	.008
Mentoring	.081	.051	.090	1.591	.113
On the Job Training	.091	.046	.109	2.980	.041
Off the Job Training	.005	.053	.194	0.014	.003

a. *Dependent Variable: Organizational performance*

Source: SPSS Version 21.0

Table 8 shows the coefficient of the individual variables and their probability values. Coaching has regression coefficient of 0.118 with a probability value of 0.008. This implies that Coaching is imperative in organizational performance in selected multinational companies. Mentoring has a regression coefficient of 0.081 with a probability value of 0.113 implying that the level of mentoring does not affect organizational performance in selected multinational companies

Furthermore, On the Job Training has a regression coefficient of 0.091 with a probability value of 0.049. This implies that the On the Job Training does not affect employee performance in selected multinational companies. On a similar note, Off the Job Training has a coefficient value of 0.174 and a probability value of 0.000. This shows that the Off the Job Training affects the organizational performance in selected multinational companies.

## Test of Hypotheses

Here, the four hypotheses formulated and tested using t-statistics and significance value of the individual variables in the regression result. The essence of this is to ascertain how significant are the effect of individual independent or explanatory variables on the dependent variables. The summary of the result is presented in the table below.

**Table 9: T-Statistics and Probability Value from the Regression Result**

Independent Variables	T	Sig.
(Constant)	9.994	.000
Coaching	2.660	.008
Mentoring	1.591	.113
On the Job Training	2.980	.041
Off the Job Training	0.014	.003

*a. Dependent Variable: Organizational Performance*

*Source: Authors Compilation from the Regression Result*

## Hypothesis One

Ho: There is no significant relationship between coaching and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

Ho<sub>1</sub>: There is a significant relationship between coaching and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

In testing this hypothesis, the t-statistics and probability value in table 4.7 is used. Coaching has a t-statistics of 2.660 and a probability value of .008 which is statistically significant. Therefore, we reject the null hypothesis and accept the alternative hypotheses which state that there is a significant relationship between coaching and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

## Hypothesis Two

Ho: There is no significant relationship between mentoring and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

Ho<sub>1</sub>: There is a significant relationship between mentoring and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

Mentoring has a t-statistics of 1.591 and a probability value of 0.113 which is statistically insignificant. Therefore, we reject the alternative hypotheses and accept the null hypothesis which states that there is no significant relationship between mentoring and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.



### **Hypothesis Three**

H<sub>0</sub>: There is no significant relationship between on the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

H<sub>01</sub>: There is a significant relationship between on the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

On the job training has a t-statistics of 2.980 and a probability value of 0.041 which is statistically significant. Therefore, we reject the null hypothesis and accept the alternative hypotheses which states that there is a significant relationship between on the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria

### **Hypothesis Four**

H<sub>0</sub>: There is no significant relationship between off the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria

H<sub>01</sub>: There is a significant relationship between off the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria

Off the job training has a t-statistics of 3.908 and a probability value of 0.000 which is statistically significant. Therefore, we reject the null hypothesis and accept the alternative hypotheses and conclude there is a significant relationship between off the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria

## **DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS**

The study examines employee training and organizational performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria. From the findings it was discover that there is a significant relationship between coaching and Employee performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. This is in line with previous empirical findings of Mba and Godday (2015), Akungba Akoko. Ogbonna (2013) Yaron (2012) shows that there is a significant relationship between coaching and Employee performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

The studies find out that there is no significant relationship between mentoring and Employee performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. The findings are disagreeing with Atual and Amabalika (2013) Olcurame (2008) oshen and Siby (2005) in their survey significant relationship between mentoring and Employee performance

The third hypothesis shows that There is a significant relationship between on the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. The result is in tandem with outcomes from previous empirical research as Khana (2011) Okanya, (2008). Kempton (2005) who concludes that on the job the training has a positive significant influence on the organizational performance

The result of fourth hypothesis shows that there is a significant relationship between off the job training and organizational performance of selected multinational co-operations in



Nigeria. This agrees with Moinak Adamu (2008) Devine (2007) highlighted that off-the-Job training have a significance influence on organizational performance

### **Summary of Findings**

The study examined the employee training and organizational performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria. The hypotheses formulated were tested using multiply regression analysis. At the end of the analysis, the following were discovered that.

1. There is a significant relationship between coaching and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. Coaching recorded a correlation coefficient of 0.141 which is statistically significant at 0.01 level of significance. This indicates that coaching has a positive moderate relationship with organizational performance.
2. There is a significant relationship between mentoring and organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. Mentoring recorded a correlation coefficient of 0.49 with organizational performance and this is statistically insignificant. This shows that shows that Mentoring has weak positive relationship with organizational performance
3. There is a significant relationship between off the job training and Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. Off the Job Training recorded a correlation coefficient of -0.290 with organizational performance. This shows that Off the Job Training has a negative relationship with organizational performance.
4. On the job training has a significant relationship with organizational performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria on the job training recorded a correlation coefficient of 0.394 with organizational sustainability which shows that on the job training has a positive moderate relationship with organizational performance

### **CONCLUSION**

The study examines employee training and organizational performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria. For the findings, coaching has a positive significant relationship with Employee performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. On the job training has a positive significant relationship organizational performance and off the job training has a positive significant relationship Employee performance of selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria. While mentoring have a negative significant relationship with Employee performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria.

Therefore, the study concludes that employee training has a positively significant relationship with Organization performance in selected multinational co-operations in Nigeria





## RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings of the study the following recommendations are proffered towards employee training and organizational performance of selected multinational corporation in Nigeria.

1. The organization should initiate policy for training instead of mentoring to enhance the ability of their employees.
2. On-the-job and in-house methods of training should be used extensively by organizations and government, especially in the training of junior staff as they tend to be cheaper and more effective.
3. Employees should be exposing to regular professional training areas such as foundation, career or development, preserves and off-the-job-pupilage training as to enhance their productivity in the organization
4. Coaching should be adopted by organization to improve performance of employees for improvement of the organization.

## REFERENCES

- Adesoji (2013) People and Performance Knowledge Workers, CIPD, London.
- Ahmad, Z.K. & Bakar, R.A. (2003). The association between training and organizational commitment among the while-collar workers in Malaysia. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 7(3), pp. 1S6-135
- Becker and Gerhart (1996) Training and Evaluation, Report NO 389, Institute of Employment Studies, Brighton.
- Boydell, T., & Leary, M. (1995). Identifying Twining Needs. London: Institute of Personnel and Development-
- Bratton and Gold (2000) Strategic human resources management a global perspective, in *International Human Resources Management* ed R. Pieper, De Gruiter Berlin New York.
- Ekpetete (2006). The adoption of job rotation: Testing the theories. and *Labor Relations Review*, 59, 653-666.
- Ellinger, A.D, Ellinger, A.E, & Keller, S. B. (2003) "Supervisory Coaching behaviour employee satisfaction, and warehouse employee performance: A dynamic Perspective in the distribution in industry" *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 14 (5) 435 - 458
- Ezigbo (2011) Mentoring and Training drawing distinctions Reviewed July 2 (11) pg 6 - 12.
- Flppo (1984) Raite to improved performance institute of personnel management London.
- Bryan (1990) Employee Relations, Institute of Personnel and Development London.
- Green et al (2000) Effect of training and business mentoring development in Europe Strategies and options 293 - 299.
- Hamid & Waheed (2011) Creating a learning organization from ideas to action, *Human Resources management Summer* pg 299 -311.
- Harrison, J.K (1992) "Individual and Combined effects of behaviour modelling the cultural assimilator in cross cultural management training" *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 77(6), 952 - 962



- Harvard Business essential (2004). "Coaching and Mentoring: how to develop top talent and achieve stronger performance" (1st ed) Boston, Mass Business school press.
- Healthfield (2014) Assessment Centres, Institute of Personnel Management, London.
- Rousseau (1989) Competency based recruitment and selection, Wiley Chichester.
- Hicks, W.D. & Klimaski, R.J. (2001). Entry into training programs and its effects On training Outcomes: a field experiment. *Academy of Management Journal*, 30, pp. 42-52.
- Kempton (1995) Risk Management and Organizational Performance in UK Int. *Journal of Human Resources Management* February pg 41 - 58.
- Kirk Patrick, D.L. (1994), *Evaluation and Training Programmes*. Sanfraicisco U.S.A Berret - Koechor.
- Luo (2000) *Training in Knowledge Economy*, CIDD London.
- Mathias and Jackson (2000) Competence-based Training, Vocational Qualifications and Learning Targets: Some Lessons for the Learning and Skills Council. *Education and Training*, 44, Dp. 250-261.
- Mayhew. C. & Quinlan, M. (00?). Fordism in the fast food industry, pervasive management. Control and occupational health and safety risks for young temporary workers. *Sociology of Health & Illness*, 24(3), pp. 261-284.
- Meister (1997) *Human Resources Management in action*, the truth is out at last, personnel management April No 2 Vol 2 pg. 28 - 31.
- Michael P. & Paul J. (1992). Congruence between theory and practice in management training needs analysis. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management* 3(3). pp. 593-605.
- Miller (1996) Competency Based Approach to Management Performance *Journal of Management* volume 2 No 8 USA.
- Mourdoukoutas (2012) *Development in Management of Human resources and interim report*, Warwick papers on industrial relation no 17, University of Warwick.
- Onwuchekwa, C.I. (1995), *Personnel Management: Awa* Goshen Publishers.
- Partlow (1996) Human resources consideration and value creation, the meditating role of intellectual capital, paper delivered at National Conference of US Academy of Management Toronto.
- Partlow (1996), Core competence of the Corporation *Harvard Business Review* 8, No 3, 1996.
- Peninou, G. (2003). *Who is Afraid of the multinational?* England: Saton House.
- Penny (2005) *Human Resources Champions* Harvard Business School Press Boston, MA.
- Blundell et al (1996) *Evaluating personnel function*, Hutchinson, London.
- Booth and Zoega (2000) *Human Resources Strategy*, McGraw - Hill New York.
- Seashore (2016) *Principles of Coaching* 3rd edition Michigan Press.
- Stoner, Freeman and Gilbert (2007) *Management* fifth edition, New Delhi Prentice Hall India Ltd.
- Stonner, J.A.F. Freeman, A.E. and Gilbert D.R. (2007), *Management*. New- Jersey, U.S.A. Prince-Hall Inc.
- Ulrich D and Brockbank (2005) *Role call, people management* 16 June pg 24 - 28, Cambridge, MA.
- Unamaka, P.C and Ewurum, U.J.F, (1995), *Business Administration*. Enugu, Precision Printer and Publishers.



## MANAGEMENT SUCCESSION AND ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL ATTAINMENT OF SELECTED PRIVATE HOSPITALS IN ANAMBRA STATE

Dr. Ethelmary Dim<sup>1</sup> and Rev. Sis Eugenia Ofordeme<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Senior Lecturer Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management Sciences,  
Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University, Igbariam Campus.

<sup>2</sup>Ph.d Student Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management Science,  
Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University, Igbariam Campus.

**ABSTRACT:** *Average Nigerian orientation towards succeeding an outgoing executives of management staff is stepping into a vacuum created and continue from where he/she joins. Management succession has to be strategically Structured in order to ensure uninterrupted and allows flow of management. Descriptive survey design was adopted and population of 90 was used, questionnaire was used in collection of data, Pearson correlation, Regression method of testing was also applied in order to dictate the relationship between management succession and organizational goal attainment. Findings revealed that there is significant effect on the sustainability of private hospitals in Anambra State and recommendations were also generated that there must be adequate structure plan, policy for promotion must be adopted and applied for best interest of the organization, new successor must be properly mentored on how to strike balance between control professionalism and human relations within private hospital so as to retain and motivate staff to put in more effort.*

**KEYWORDS:** Management Succession, Organization, Goal Attainment, Private Hospitals

### INTRODUCTION

Management succession has become an important initiative and innovation for many organizations around the world. It is a strategic process that minimizes leadership gaps. The need to identify and develop top talent for management succession is an important issue. Management succession enables organizations to quickly react to change and endure turbulence period. Chandler (2007) defines organization as coordination of individual efforts to accomplish a common objective.

Terry Lucey (2005) sees organization as group created and maintained to achieve specific objectives. It may be a hospital with objectives dealing with health care, local authority with objective of providing service to local community etc.

Main concept of organization is how to achieve goals. An organization strives for survival and continuity, manpower planning (Human resources) is important and seen as total package in relation to caliber of workforce in the organization. Employees most at times falsify their age in order not to retire at the appropriate age thereby leading to either leadership vacancies or inadequacy or lack of competent hand because of age of some employees that are redundant and unable to fill the vacant position. Korn (2007) argues that organization must



begin on time to plan for succession before top managers retire. Chara et al (2001) asserts that it is essential for organization to train successors before the vacancies are created.

Nigeria has witnessed a serious growth and increase in organization whose role has been tailored to fulfill national aspirations and government has laid more emphasis on training and development of human resources mostly those in managerial cadre. Still a good number of these young executives became unsuccessful in reaching their goals because of inadequate planning. Management manpower planning is a process. It starts with management manpower planning to staff development then organizational performance, appraisal and analysis, manpower inventory ends in final decision to re-allocate human resources in organization.

Most private hospitals when the founder dies, the hospital will close down due to lack of succession planning. If this were to put in place earlier the problem of management succession would not have arisen, the owners of private hospital will set these plans before hand to avoid closure when they are no longer available.

Growth and stability of these private hospitals will come when there are properly and legally structured, well managed and professionalized. Most of these private hospitals operate blindly, some even working as one man show without their children or relations studying the course or learning about the business when the owners dies or gets old the hospital will collapse. Dele (2014) notes that private business goes into extinction after the death or retirement of their founders and it has serious social and economic consequences and it consists of loss not only to proprietor's family but to employees and surrounding communities at large, whose economic well-being and health depends on survival of these business (hospitals).

### **Statement of Problems**

Like most human endeavor there are problems that organizations are confronted with in the process of managing their workforce. Trying to achieve managerial task like planning, directing, controlling and coordinating all human activities in organizations, a lot of problems are encountered. Lack of continuity in most private organization is alarming. A good number of young executives became unsuccessful in reaching their goals because of inadequate planning, the expediency for personal objectives has led more emphasis on training and development of human resources especially those on the managerial cadre. Poor succession due to lack of experience, incompetence, no clear division of labour leads to crisis.

Manpower training and development is rare in some private organizations they do not care about training their employees, succession planning is meant to prepare managers to set into the shoes of their existed colleagues in order to prevent organizational hiccups and confusion.

It is against this backdrop that we are trying to examine management succession in selected private hospitals in Anambra State

### **Objectives of the Study**

Major objective is to ascertain the effect of management succession in organization goal attainment. Specific objectives of the study are.



1. To determine if survival strategy will lead to succession planning of private hospitals in Anambra State.
2. To ascertain if family conflict will lead to succession planning of private hospitals in Anambra State.
3. To identify if sustainability will lead to succession planning of private hospitals in Anambra state.

### **Research Hypotheses**

1. Survival strategy does not affect goal attainment of management Succession of private hospitals in Anambra State.
2. Family conflict does not affect goal attainment of management succession of private hospitals in Anambra State.
3. Sustainability does not affect management succession of private hospitals in Anambra State.

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

Survival of organization, continuity and viability are primary responsibility of top management of all organizations and it cannot be properly fulfilled unless there is provision for management succession. Succession planning is a process for identifying and developing new leaders who can replace old leaders when they leave, retire or die in business, it entails developing internal people with potential to fill key business leadership positions in a company. It aims at continuity of leadership preventing chaotic power struggle, it is settled by order of succession.

Effective succession planning concerns with building a series of feeder group up and down the entire leadership pipeline, in a nutshell replacement plan in focus.

Organizations use succession planning as a process to ensure that employees are recruited and developed to fill each key role within the organization. Through one's succession planning process one recruits, superior employees develop their knowledge, skills and abilities and prepares them for advancement or promotion into more challenging roles. Merch (2016) asserts that as one's organizations expands, losses key employees, provides promotional opportunities or increases sales, one's succession planning aims to ensure that one has employ people ready and waiting to fill new roles.

Ewing (2012) states that managerial succession planning is uncommon because of difficulties in anticipating contingencies and on accounting for movement of several levels of employees it is detailed aspect of manpower planning and it requires, great caution.

Necessity for management succession is a must for any organization if the organization want to be in existence, the importance of the study entails that a policy of promoting staff should be organized from within the hospital, it will help the staff to rise and those qualified will have opportunity for promotion.



Employees with ability for potentials must be recognized early and give opportunity for continuous growth which will help in advancement.

Top management must see that the system operates effectively without favoritism.

### **Necessity for Management Succession**

Barker (1993) It is of great importance if organizations such as private hospitals under study to plan ahead of succession to avoid closure of most private hospitals which is what happens with most of the private hospitals within the State.

Top management must bear in mind that succession planning is in their Jurisdiction and it must be done with care, no preferences, so that the best will emerge and priority must be placed on sound education, experience, capability to handle the position in question.

Promotion can be of advantage because passing through many steps experience, knowledge and it is effective administrative procedure too, this will give the opportunity to take qualified employees and it is opportunity for promotion which is another way for Job satisfaction.

Employees with rich potentials and ability must be dictated early and opportunity given to them for growth and stability, further training should be accorded to them for further development to be able to fit in properly.

These private hospitals should encourage high leadership capability to help dictate mature staff early because the earlier the better, when the top management noticed that capable employees that will replace them have high leadership capacity it will be of advantage to them because they will be happy that there is continuity even if they are no longer there.

Top management of these private hospitals should avoid sentiments, suspicion of favoritism everything must be done on merit because it entails life any mistake will lead to doom and death which will not promote the image of the hospital.

### **Problems of Management Succession**

Good number of factors can bring about problems in succession bid in most private hospitals in Anambra State and such problems are;

- **Procrastination-** Abebe 1980 cited by Dim 2014 asserts that from the day I was told I was going to be appointed chairman we start thinking of my succession as well.
- **Fear of Organizational Change** - organizations should learn how to change policies in consistent to organizational strategies so that employees will cope and succession be smooth.
- **Social Responsibilities** -The need of the society if not attended to can turn into social problems for the organization, top management should ensure that social responsibility should be given attention. Top management should ensure that social responsibility should be attended to for survival of the organization and for successful interaction of the organization with all environmental facets.





- **Frequent Replacement of Chief Executive Officers** - frequent replacement of chief executives has created lots of problems for many organizations new issues or trends introducing into the organization which might not suit the organization which can even lead to unqualified and inexperienced successors.
- **Organizational Policies** - Internal policies of private hospitals can be of advantage or disadvantage it is necessary to map out the right way for succession and include it in the policies to avoid power struggle and political maneuvering because it cannot lead the hospital or other organization forward.
- **Selection and Development**- selection and development of potential successors must be resolved by private hospital owners to avoid closure when the owner is no longer alive or weak.

### Survival Strategy

Watson (2013) Organizational survival is a comprehensive approach for supporting and leading change within an organization.

Organization needs survival strategy for sustainability survival strategy is a step by step road map on how to transform your corporate destiny and build a sustainable future. survival strategy is an approach created for business to meet the needs of today's customers and position an organization to outperform while positively impacting society, environment community and the bottom line. There are many issues to consider social commitment, economic commitment, environmental commitment, ethical commitment, social commitment integrates individual and community stakeholder interests into your strategy and align them with your organizational values, Economic commitment helps to develop a business model that will generate profits through sustainability. Environmental commitment assesses the organizational impact on the environment and take proper action, ethical commitment portrays building trust among all stakeholders through openness, transparency and accountability all these encompasses the changes business are facing from the above these strategies will be implemented to meet the market demand and ensure organizational survival.

**Succession Planning & Organizational Goal Attainment** Coventry and Barker (1993) mapped out time cycle for succession planning which falls into three phases.

1. Emergency replacement plans to cover accidents or mishaps to key people. If an accident happens in an organization the question of who will replace comes in mostly for top management, planning has to be identified for people in key position. One to be chosen must have essential requirements like being familiar with the job, be informed of progress in the departments and be able to take over within a short notice.
2. Long term resource planning it has to apply to all sphere forecast number of vacancies due to come due to staff turnover, retirement. Drucker 1974 as cited in Dim (2014) contributed this fact that plans should be made ahead of people to manage an organization. He contended that the worst things to happen to an organization is try to adopt new comers and leave out people that have been in the organization for long. Candidates assuming to replace must be loyal, committed, dedicated to work have integrity, intelligent and hardworking experience and age should be considered too



3. Short term planning – replacement entails that there is plans ahead in case of emergencies. Short term planning means standby personnel are available, in case there is any shortfall, it can also be that retirement for some personnel are visible people are being trained to replace them whenever they are leaving to avoid organization suffer unnecessarily. Management should plan ahead by search for candidates that are capable to replace, shortlist and interview them select the possible candidates and prepare them for the new post. This detailed planning can start 2 years before the expected date to allow the whole process to be done smoothly without disruption of work. Coventry and Barker (1993) are of the view that short term planning is considered with final stage of enabling people to fit into a specific job perfectly.

### **Sustainability and Organizational Goal Attainment**

Organization are change agents and major force for survival of business in these private hospitals, there is need for strategic alignment as seen in Watson 2013, this will entail corporate strategy which guides major actions of the organization and set directions for the future which will lead to integration of sustainability into corporate strategy which when adhered to will be of competitive advantage. These private hospitals will learn to operate in environment where emission constraints are part of business and aggregation and adaptation are part of strategic issues that will be of advantage.

In order to reduce cost private hospitals should reduce cost by combing activities into optimal unit for efficiency, it should also reduce waste.

### **Adaptation and Organizational Goal Attainment**

This is possible to maximize the interest of the environment by being responsive to their needs and desires adapting to environment will be of advantage because without adapting much will not be achieved, adaptation will lead to maximization of all environmental advantage which helps in enriching productivity.

### **Family Conflict and Organizational Goal Attainment**

This is focused mainly on determining the relationship between family conflict at work place and organizational goal attainment. Scrambling for whom to take over the affairs of the hospital is a serious issue to settle earlier and this can be done by making succession plan earlier before it is late. Another serious issue in family conflict is that conflict arises when the demands of one domain are incapable with demands of the other. Frane et al (1992), stressed that relationship between family conflict and sustainability exists when there is work pressure, lack of autonomy and lack of role ambiguity, These unfulfilled family obligation may then begin to interfere with work function consideration must be given to specify these areas on time and prepare for succession earlier to avoid much conflict.

## **THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

Competency theory of succession planning. This theory relies on competency theory of succession planning of Vathanophas and Thalingan (2007) competency theory is a



framework that identifies a combination of skills, knowledge and behaviours which a successor must possess in order to perform and ensure the survival of business. It adds that for this model to be respected, competencies must comply with the job activities of successor otherwise the business will fail. This theory specifically means that the owner manager of a private business should retire from the management position the moment his/her management capability is declining as a result of old age-related health challenges, otherwise the family business will fail. The theory supports objective one survival strategy is needed for sustainability which business needs for survive succession, the second objective to determine family conflict will lead to succession planning of selected private hospital, if family conflict can be eliminated a capable hand in the family can manage the hospital either at retirement or death of the founder, such person should be given the chance otherwise business is bound to fail. Objective three is all about sustainability which relates to the theory that if sustainability is to corporate strategy it will lead to competitive advantage that will generate profit and promotion of the business which entails to succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State. Competency theory indicates that competent hands should be given opportunities to manage the business for survival opportunity.

## **EMPIRICAL REVIEW**

Tanikin (2005) studied organizational goal attainment in UK (United Kingdom) in a plastic manufacturing company with sample size of 250 workers, using descriptive survey design to establish the effect of worker training and motivation and organizational goal attainment the findings positively show that there is great relationship between employee training and motivation and organizational goal attainment.

Hasket, Hawkes and Pereira (2003) carried out a research in Lurich to investigate the relationship between sustainability and organizational goal attainment in 20 hospitals using descriptive survey design, data were collected with questionnaire and it was tested using correlation. The findings showed that there is significant relationship between sustainability and organizational goal attainment in those hospitals used.

Dearden and Van Reenen (2000) analyzed the effect of survival strategy of employees and organizational goal attainment using 87 breweries in Belgium, structured questionnaire was administered to people data generated were analyzed using multiple regression to ascertain the relationship between survival strategy and organizational goal attainment. The findings showed that there is positive relationship between survival strategy and organizational goal attainment.

## **METHODOLOGY**

**Research Design** – Research design is an interactive process and model needing continual analysis of interest evaluation of processes and procedures, it is a structure and comprehensive action plan for generating and analyzing data necessary to help identifying and solving problems at hand. This study adopted descriptive survey design which used Mean and standard deviation to answer the research questions, Z-test was used to test the

hypotheses at 0.05 level of significant. It was adopted because it is appropriate and will reduce error, bias and maximize reliability of data gathered.

This research concerns with effect of management succession and organizational goal attainment. The entire population of the selected staff from selected private hospitals in Anambra State was 90 this was extracted from each hospital personnel unit. The whole population will be used, no need for sample.

S/N	Hospital	Town	Population
1	St Gregory's Hospital	Awka	20
2	Okike Hospital	Ekwulobia	20
3	St Agnes Hospital	Nnewi	20
4	Aruike ndi oya Hospital	Onitsha	30
	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>90</b>

### Source of Data

Primary source of data was employed and it was sourced as first-hand information and remained in their raw form as no researcher has made use of them.

### Method of Data Analysis

Mean and standard deviation were used to answer the research questions Z-test was used to test the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance. In analyzing the data, mean from 1.00-1.49=very low; 1.50-2.49=low, 2.50=3.49=high; 3.50-4.00=very high. In analyzing the data for the null hypotheses, Z-test was used to test the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance. The choice of Z-test is in line with the recommendation of Howith and Cranner (2011) who recommended the use of Z-test for samples from 40 and above. Since the sample size is more than 40, the choice of Z-test is therefore appropriate for the study. As a rule, if the calculated Z-value is equal or greater than the table Z-value ( $> .05$ ), the null hypotheses was rejected whereas if the calculated Z-value is less than the table Z-value, the null hypotheses was not rejected.

## PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

The data collected are presented and analyzed. The results are presented according to the research questions and hypotheses.

**Research Question 1:** To what extent does survival strategy lead to succession of organizational goal attainment private hospitals in Anambra State?

**Table 1: Mean Score of Survival Strategy Lead to Succession of Organizational Goal Attainment**

	N	Mean	SD	Remark
<b>Organizational Goal Attainment</b>	681	2.91	.55	High



The mean score of 2.91 shown in Table 1 above indicates survival strategy lead to succession on organizational goal attainment of selected private hospitals is high.

**Research Question 2:** To what extent will family conflict lead to management succession of organizational goal attainment of selected private hospitals in Anambra State?

**Table 2: Mean Score of Family Conflict Lead to Management Succession on Organizational Goal Attainment Private Hospitals**

	N	Mean	SD	Remark
<b>Family Conflict</b>	282	2.93	.44	High
<b>Management Succession</b>	399	2.90	.61	High

The mean score of 2.93 for family conflict and 2.90 for management succession in Table 2 shows that family conflict and management succession' towards organizational goal attainment in selected private hospitals in Anambra State is high.

**Research Question 3:** To what extent will sustainability affect management succession of selected Private hospitals in Anambra State?

**Table 3: Mean Score of Sustainability and Management Succession on Organizational Goal Attainment of Selected Private Hospitals Private Hospitals**

	N	Mean	SD	Remark
<b>Sustainability</b>	526	2.90	.56	High
<b>Management Succession</b>	155	2.96	.50	High

The mean scores of 2.90 and 2.96 for sustainability and management succession indicate that sustainability affect management succession of selected Private hospitals in Anambra State to be high.

## **Test of Hypotheses**

### **Hypotheses One**

Ho: Survival strategy does not affect organization goal attainment of management Succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

Ho<sub>1</sub>: Survival strategy does not affect organization goal attainment of management Succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

**Table 5: Z-test Comparison of Survival Strategy and Organizational Goal Attainment Mean Scores of Management Succession of Selected Private Hospitals**

Source of Variation	N	Mean	SD	Df	z-cal	z-crit	Decision
Survival Strategy	103	3.50	.17	797	8.96	1.96	Sig
Organizational Goal Attainment	696	3.36	.15				

The result in Table 5 shows that the calculated z-value (.90) is less than the critical value (1.96) at alpha level of 0.05 and degree of freedom (df) 796. The null hypothesis therefore was rejected. This is an indication that survival strategy affects organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

#### **Hypothesis Two:**

Ho: Family conflict does not affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

Ho<sub>1</sub>: Family conflict affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

**Table 6: Z-test Comparison of Family Conflict and Organizational Goal Attainment Mean Scores on Management Succession of Selected Private Hospitals in Anambra State.**

Source of Variation	N	Mean	SD	Df	z-cal	z-crit	Decision
Family Conflict	103	3.41	.19	797	24.01	1.96	Sig
Goal Attainment	696	3.13	.09				

As indicated in Table 6, the analysis shows that the z-cal value of 24.01 is less than the critical value of 1.96 at alpha level of 0.05 and degree of freedom (df) 797. This shows that the difference between Family conflict and organizational goal attainment of management succession of private hospitals in Anambra State significant. Therefore, the null hypothesis of no significant difference between family conflict and organizational goal attainment was rejected. Which state that family conflict significant affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

#### **Hypothesis Three:**

Ho: Sustainability does not affect organizational goal attainment management of succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

Ho<sub>1</sub>: Sustainability affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.





**Table 7: Z-test Comparison of Sustainability and Organizational Goal Attainment of Succession of Selected Private Hospitals**

Source of Variation	N	Mean	SD	df	z-cal	z-crit	Decision
Sustainability	532	290	.54	679	.65	1.96	Not Sig
Organizational Goal Attainment	149	2.94	.55				

The result in Table 7 shows that the calculated z-value (.65) is less than the critical value (1.96) at alpha level of 0.05 and degree of freedom (df) 679. This is an indication that the significant effect of Sustainability and organizational goal attainment on of management succession of private hospitals in Anambra State was not significant. The null hypothesis therefore was therefore rejected. Which states that sustainability does not effect on organizational goal attainment management of succession of private hospitals in Anambra State

## SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

1. Survival strategy does not affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.
2. Family conflict does not affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.
3. Sustainability does not affect organizational goal attainment management of succession of selected private hospitals in Anambra State

## CONCLUSION

The study examined the effect of management succession and organizational goal attainment in selected private hospitals in Anambra State. From the data analysis, the study found out that survival strategy, family conflict and sustainability does not affect organizational goal attainment of management succession of private hospitals in Anambra State. Therefore, the study concludes that management succession does not affect organizational goal attainment of selected private hospitals in Anambra State.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Survival strategy should be put in place by identify employees with rich potentials and ability that must be dictated early and opportunity given to them for development and stability, further training should be rendered to them for further growth to be able to fit in properly.



2. Because of family conflict, organization or management must bear in mind that succession planning must be done with care, no favorites, so that the best will emerge and priority must be placed on sound education, experience, capability to handle the position in question
3. For the management to Sustain the organization, selection and growth of potential successors must be resolved by private hospital owners to avoid closure when the owner is no longer alive or weak.

## REFERENCES

- Abede C.F (2012) How to Reach the Leaders Nim Journal Vol. 16, No 4
- Aldrich H. (2004) Ethic Entrepreneurship Immigrants Business Society New Bury C.A Stage.
- Barker (1993) Competency based recruitment and selection, Wiley Chichester
- Chandler (2007) Principles of Management Prentice Publishers India
- Dearden and Van Reenen (2000) Managaing Individual performance, American compensation Association, Scottsdale Arizona
- Dele (2014) Selection and Appraisal, reconstructing social relation in new perspectives in Human Resources management ed J. Sterey Routledge London.
- Dim E. (2014) Journal of Social Science Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University 25<sup>th</sup> April Volume 10 No 2
- Drucker P. (1985) *How to Save Family Business the Wall Street Journal volume 10 No 16 August New York*
- Drucker P. (1990) Management task, Responsibilities and Practice London Heineman
- Ewing (2012) *Succession Planning and Strategic CAP Journal Volume 2 No 4*
- Frane et al (1992), Personnel Management in African a Comparative analysis of Ghana, Nigeria, Internaional Human resources management, Brewster and styson, Pitman London.
- Gregory Balestrero & Nathalie Udo (2013) Organizational Survival published by Niagraw hill
- Hasket, Hawkes and Pereira (2003) Human Resources Champions Havaard Business School Press Boston, USA
- Korn (2007) *Human Resources Management in action, the truth is out at last, personnel management April No 2 Vol 2 Pg 28-31*
- Lawal A.O (2011) Mentoring A Key in Human Resource Management, the Life Centre for Psychological Studies ile ife Nigeria
- Liroff S. (2008) Family Businesses, Firm grows but acknowledges Challenges. Financial Executive [www.journalsexecutive.org](http://www.journalsexecutive.org)
- Merch (2016) Training in Knowledge Economy, CIPD London Mograw hill
- Nkam M.C, Sena O & Ndamsa D. (2017) *Factors affecting sustainability of family business in Cameroun, empirical study in Northern Cameroun Journal of Entrepreneurial vol 2. No 19*
- Obayan A.O.U (1995) Changing perspectives in the extended family system in Nigeria Implications for Family dynamics and Counseling Psychology
- Tanikin (2005) Evaluating Personnel function, Hutchinson, London
- Terry Lucey (2005) Management Information System, 9<sup>th</sup> Edition New York Press
- Watson 2013 Strategic Human Resources Management, Academy of Management Review 23(4) 56-72



## USING THE DART MODEL OF VALUE CO-CREATION TO PREDICT CUSTOMER LOYALTY IN PENSION FUND ADMINISTRATION IN NIGERIA

Ojiaku Obinna Christian<sup>1</sup>, Nwatu Basil Chibuike<sup>2</sup> and Aghara Vincent Nnamdi<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Marketing, Faculty of Management Sciences, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Nigeria.

<sup>2</sup>Department of Marketing, Enugu State University of Technology, Agbani, Enugu State, Nigeria.

<sup>3</sup>Department of Marketing Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra State, Nigeria.

**ABSTRACT:** *As today's empowered consumers increasing put businesses under pressure to co-create value with them, businesses are uncertain if involving customers in value co-creation is a potent strategy for winning customers' loyalty. This study attempts to predict customer loyalty based on the DART (dialogue, access, risk assessment and transparency) model of co-creation. In a cross-sectional survey, involving 364 clients of pension service firm across MDAs in Southeastern Nigeria, we found that the dialogue, access and transparency dimensions of co-create significantly predicts customer loyalty. The implication of the study for practice is discussed.*

**KEYWORDS:** Value Co-Creation, Customer Loyalty, Dialogue, Pension Fund, Nigeria

## INTRODUCTION

In today's knowledge economy, the enablement created by the internet-technology has created a class of sophisticated and knowledgeable consumers who are more connected and empowered than ever before. These consumers are active recipients of brands and offerings and are also able to accept or reject a company's offering based on their experiences and knowledge (Roser, Samson, Humphrey, & Cruz-Valdivieso, 2009). As a consequence, consumers demand greater levels of personalisation in their consumption experience and have thereby placed businesses under increased pressure to co-create value with them. Businesses on the other hand, are compelled to search for new and better ways to create value and differentiate their market offerings in order to profitably attract and retain customers (Bendapudi & Leone 2003; Roser et. al. 2009; Shaw & Ivens 2002). Thus, a potent strategy for firms is to reconfigure its relationships and systems in order to enable customers to utilize all available resources to create value for themselves (Normann & Ramirez, 1993).

Value co-creation is defined as the processes through which firms collaborate with customers to create value (Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004). Customer value creation is centered on what the customer does, whereas co-creation takes into perspective the processes within the network (Gummerus, 2013). Value is said to be co-created when an interaction between the company and the customer exist (Alves, Fernandes & Raposo, 2016; Grönroos & Voima 2013). Value co-creation is associated with the opportunity to gain competitive advantage by developing unique competence, together with the appropriate organizational resources and technological capabilities aimed at better satisfying customers demand and gaining customer



loyalty (Bendapudi & Leone, 2003; Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004). Previous research found a positive correlation between value co-creation and attitudinal loyalty (Auh et al. 2007; Sohby et al., 2009), increased likelihood of positive word-of-mouth (File, Judd, & Prince, 1992) and service recovery (Dong, Evans, & Zou, 2008). However, there are recent call for more research to better understand the relationship between customer value co-creation and loyalty (Alves et al., 2016; Payne, Storbacka & Frow, 2008).

Despite the increasing interest in customer value co-creation and its critical role in marketing success (Flores & Vasquez-Parraga, 2015), empirical investigation on the effect of customer value co-creation on marketing outcomes is still sparse. Most of the scholarly debate on co-creation has centered on theoretical underpinnings or conceptual frameworks (Etgar, 2006; Flores et al., 2015; Neghina, Caniels, Bloemer & van Birgelen, 2015; Payne et al 2008; Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004; Saarijarvi, 2012) with very few empirical investigations (Auh et al. 2007; Randell et al., 2011; Rajan & Read, 2016; Sohby et. al., 2009). More so, the literature is dominated by scholarly discussion from developed economies, with few articles identified from context of Sub-Sahara Africa (Osei-Frimpong, Wilson & Owusu-Frimpong, 2015). In fact, the literature on the dimensions of value co-creation is confusing and ambiguous (Neghina et al., 2015). Several researchers conceptualize value co-creation as complex and consisting of several dimensions. For instance, Randell et al. (2011) operationalized value co-creation as consisting of connection, trust and commitment, Yi and Gong (2013) considers co-creation as a third-order factor consisting of two primary dimensions, customer citizenship and customer co-creation behavior and Neghina et al. (2015) proposed the dimensions of co-creation as consisting of individuating, relating, empowering, ethical, developmental, and concerted interactions. Prahalad & Ramaswamy (2004) in their seminal paper proposed the DART (dialogue, access, risk assessment and transparency) model of customer value co-creation as the fundamental building blocks of value co-creation. The DART model is yet to be empirically investigated. Accordingly, this study builds on the DART model (Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004) and investigates the effect of value co-creation on customer loyalty in the Nigerian pension service industry. In other words, the study investigates the effect of dialogue, access, risk assessment and transparency on customer loyalty with pension service firms.

The Nigerian pension service industry consists of pension fund administrators (i.e., PFAs), pension fund custodians, and the regulatory body (i.e., National Pension Commission), employers of labour, employees or retirement savings account holders (RSA). The industry contributes about 6 per cent to the nations GDP and manages over ₦7.4 trillion (\$20.5 billion) pension assets (National Pensions Commission, 2016). However, the industry is under increased threat of collapse at least for pension fund administrators following public distrust towards the scheme and unfavourable government policies. Furthermore, despite the high switching barrier customers' experience and the 'passively' competitive nature of the market, evidence of switching behaviour has started to emerge as manifested by the increased agitations to switch provider on the one hand, and concerted efforts to amend the Pension Reform Act (2010 amended) to allow for licensing of ministries, departments and agencies to operate and manage a closed pension in order to privately run, operate and administer pension funds for its workers on the other hand (Ojiaku, Olise & Nwankwo, 2015). Accordingly, it has become imperative that pension firms collaborate with customers to co-create value in the administration of their pension fund in order to build trust, commitment and loyalty. Arnould (2005) argue that for firm to succeed, and gain customer loyalty, it is



important that resources are deployed to enable customers integrate their cultural resources into the firms' systems and processes and extract value for themselves. (Alves et al., 2016).

The rest of this paper is organised as follows: In section 2 related literatures is reviews. Section 3 discusses the research method, while section 4 presents the results of the study. Then the discussion and implications are presented in section 5. Finally, the conclusion of the study, limitations and suggestions for further research is presented in sections 6 and 7 respectively.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### Customer Value Co-Creation

Customer value co-creation is a post-modern marketing thought centered on service-dominant logic (Vargo and Lusch, 2004). According to the service-dominant logic, customers actively participate in defining and creating value with firm rather than being passive receiver of value embedded in product or service output (Vargo and Lusch, 2004). The value co-creation paradigm differs from the traditional paradigm of good-logic, where firm create value and customer receive value at the point where goods are exchanged for money thereby assigning distinct roles to firms and customers (Vargo, Maglio and Akaka, 2008). In the S-D logic, 'the customer is always a co-creator of value' (Lusch and Vargo, 2006b: 284) and 'value is always uniquely and phenomenologically determined by the beneficiary (i.e., customers)' (Lusch and Vargo, 2006b). Thus, value is co-created through the combined efforts of firms, employees, customers, stakeholders, government agencies, and other entities related to any given exchange, but are always determined by the customer (Vargo et al., 2008). According to Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004), co-creation refers to the processes by which both consumers and firms collaborate, or otherwise participate, in creating value. Co-creation is a joint activity involving two or more economic actors with the purpose of creating value beyond what each actor can achieve independently (Neghina et al., 2017).

In Value co-creation, firms through active and conscious process, develop, design, manufacture and propose value through market offerings and customers continue value creation process through use (Heinonen, Strandvik, & Voima, 2013; Vargo et al., 2008). Co-creation enables the firm to develop product or services tailored to the customer needs rather than standardize offering. Prahalad and Ramaswamy, (2004) add that it is the consumers' integration of resources during co-creation that allows value to emerge. In other words, customers extract value by acting on operand resources facilitated by the firm. As in the case of pension services, pension firms provide operand resources in the form of pension accounts (i.e., mandatory retirement savings accounts and voluntary pension accounts) whereas the customer extract value by opening retirement savings accounts and providing employment information for consequent funding of the accounts. In addition, pension firms facilitate value co-creation through providing customers access to their pension accounts using digital platforms. Therefore, customers are value co-creators during consumption and in value-supporting interactions whereas firms are value facilitators and co-creators (Heinonen et al., 2013). Groonroos & Voima, (2013) delineate the co-creation activities into the provider sphere, customer sphere and the joint provider and customer sphere. Similarly, Payne et al. (2008) designate these same processes as the processes of customer value creation, processes of supplier value creation, and processes of encounter (Alves et al., 2016).





## **Dimensions of DART Model and Hypotheses**

### **Dialogue**

Dialogue is an interactive process where customers and firm reasons together around issues of common interest to create a common platform of knowledge, which supports value co-creation (Grönroos, 2000). Dialogue is an interactive communication necessary to make value proposition and co-create value with customers (Lusch & Vargo, 2006); Ballantyne and Varey (2006) add that it is a process of learning together, with its ethical underpinnings built on trust. Customers interact with companies in respect of new product or service development, support services, or both in order to initiate, develop, and manage co-creation (Galvagno & Dalli, 2014). For instance, pension service firms interact with customers to learn about their preferences, problems and value expectations with respect to their pension accounts. Customers in turn learn about the challenges of the firm in receiving pension contributions, regulation restrictions on investments, value propositions and together information is shared between the customer and firm, and value is co-created. When dialog is lacking, consumers can enforce interaction by forcing firms to respond when they complain, negotiate, fight and appropriate (Cova & Dalli, 2009). Therefore, the quality of the interaction and the responsibility for the final value that is created and shared lies with the firm, the service employee and the customer (Grönroos, 1996; Grönroos and Voima, 2013). The dialogue between customers and firm supports value co-creation and leads to sustainable competitive advantage (Ballantyne & Varey, 2006,). Tynan, McKechnie, and Chuon (2010) find that co-creating experiences for luxury brands involve an active dialog between owners, employees and customers. Baumann & Le Meunier (2015) posits that interactive dialogue between customers and service employees is the nucleus of value co-creation. Therefore, the interactive communication with customers in value co-creation will lead to customer loyalty. Thus:

H<sub>1</sub>: Dialog will have a significant influence on customer loyalty.

### **Access**

According to Prahalad & Ramaswamy (2004) value co-creation means that firms will have to grant customers deep access into their process and resources and allow customers experience the brand. Access in the context of co-creation is the willingness to share control over information and facilitate a collaboration environment (Rajan & Read, 2016). Customers need to access as much information as they need from the company as well as from other customers (Jaakkola & Alexander, 2014) when experiencing the service. For co-creation to occur firms have to provide the necessary support devoid of barriers through the provision of appropriate tools, trainings, and facilitative environment to enable customers co-create value across the value chain. Company supports can take the form of access to the internet environment such as customers' online accounts, social media and company's website for an enjoyable and rewarding experience (Fuller, 2009). Suh and Lee (2005), emphasizing the importance of access, posit that access to virtual environments enables customers to solve problems conveniently and complete stated tasks easily. In a similar vein, Jaakkola and Alexander (2014) report that a central factor driving customers' engagement with a service provider is the access provided through easy involvement with the service system. Pension service firms can provide customers access into their systems and processes by allowing customers easy access into their pension savings accounts, investments portfolios and returns,





updates on personal information e.t.c., and by so doing increase the customers commitment with the firm and willingness to recommend the firm to others. Therefore, we expect access to have a significant positive effect on customer loyalty. Thus:

H<sub>2</sub>: Access will significantly influence customer loyalty

### **Risk Assessment**

Risk is the possibility of suffering injury or loss due to product or service use. According to Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004), it is “the probability of harm to the customer” (pg. 7). Risk assessment is the extent customers are able to make informed choices based on the associated costs and benefits of using a product or service. A precondition for customers accepting responsibility for risk is the firms’ willingness to enable customers to make informed risk-benefit tradeoffs through transparency about the various risk associated with the products and services on offer (Prahalad and Ramaswamy 2004). In pension services, customers need to be aware of the social, financial, and security risk involved in co-creating value. Traditionally, companies shield customers from the risk inherent in the use of service offering, but as customers becomes value co-creators, they become more willing to assume responsibility for these risk (Prahalad and Ramaswamy, 2004). Thus, companies would have to proactively communicate and share information with customers regarding its resources, capabilities and the risk customers may encounter while using the service to gain competitive advantage (Prahalad and Ramaswamy, 2004). Baqer (2006) find that customers are willing to purchase a co-produced service when they are aware of the risk involved in co-producing the service. Therefore, we expect customers’ ability to assess the risk involved in co-creating pension services to significantly influence their loyalty with a pension service provider.

H<sub>3</sub>: Risk Assessment will significantly influence customer loyalty

### **Transparency**

Traditionally, the transactional nature of customer-company interaction leads to information asymmetry in favor of the company. However, as customers become empowered, this information asymmetry in cost and another related factor is gradually diminished. Therefore, it is important that companies are transparent in dealings with customers to facilitate dialogue and enable value co-creation to occur. According to Randall et al. (2011), value co-creation means that a certain degree of transparency, integrity and shared risk should be present. Transparency is concerned with the extent companies are willing to share information about the business (Baqer, 2006), its products, technologies, processes, systems, transaction cost, security concerns, and profit. Transparency of information is required to develop trust between companies and customers. In addition, transparency is necessary to build close relationships between customer and firm and thereby enable value co-creation to occur. Neghina et al. (2015) suggest the need for ethical joint actions for symmetric information exchange between service employees and customers. Employees ethical action include presenting service providers offer truthfully, treating customers with respect, ensuring transparency and full disclosure during service interaction (Neghina et al., 2015). They argue that providing false or misleading information and other unethical claim affect customers switching behavior (Neghina et al., 2015). In contrast, providing open dialogue and transparency builds trust and increase customers’ commitment to a firm (Terho et al., 2012).



Accordingly, information transparency would have positive influence on customers' loyalty. Thus:

H<sub>4</sub>: Transparency will significantly influence customer loyalty with pension service firms

### **Customer Loyalty**

Firms strive to achieve customer's loyalty, because a loyal customer is an asset to the firm and a source of competitive advantage. Oliver (1999) defines customer loyalty as a deeply held commitment to always patronize a service provider or product consistently in the future irrespective of situational influences or marketing efforts to cause switching behaviour. In the context of pension service, it is a customers' commitment for continuance patronage and recommend intention. Customer loyalty is perceived as future intention-to-repurchase or commitment that reflects the cognitive and emotional attachment associated with a brand. The literature suggests that customer loyalty leads to firm profitability because customer loyalty positively influences firm product-marketplace performance (Anderson & Mittal 2000) and financial performance (Anderson et al., 1994; Gupta & Zeithaml 2006), and creates shareholder wealth (Anderson et al. 2004). Evidence suggests that co-creating value with customers leads to loyalty (Alves et al., 2016). For instance, Cova and Dalli (2009) argue that involving customers in service co-production increases their affective evaluations of the service and the company and invariably increases their loyalty and willingness to buy. Luo et al. (2015) add that co-creation practices strengthen ties, enhances the level of commitment and boost customer loyalty among community members.

### **METHODS**

364 respondents from Anambra State, Southeast Nigeria, participated in the study. The respondents were proportionately selected from pension account holders in ministries, departments and agency (MDAs) in Anambra State Southeast, Nigeria. The choice of MDAs is because of the mandatory nature of the scheme in the sub-sector. The instruments were self-administered and returned to the interviewer upon completion.

### **Measures**

The survey instrument consists of a 7-point Likert-scale ranging from Strongly Disagree '7' to Strongly Agree '1'. The questionnaire is structured in two-parts. The items were generated from themes in the co-creation literature. 6 items were generated for dialogue dimension, while assess contains 4-items. Risk assessment consists of 5 – item and while 5 –items was generated for transparency. Customer loyalty was measured using 5 –items adapted from Abba & Hamdy (2015). Data collected were analysed using SPSS version 17 to generate needed information. Descriptive statistics was used to summarize the demographic characteristics of respondents, while a principal component analysis was performed to reduce the data and test for commonality. The hypotheses were tested using multiple regression analysis. The validity and reliability of the constructs was tested after a pilot study by performing a principal component analysis (PCA). The constructs were face validated by marketing professionals with specialization in services marketing. Subsequently, the instruments were pilot tested on a sample of 20 respondents for internal consistency. All the



factors were reliable with Cronbach  $\alpha > 0.70$  (Nunnally & Bernstein, 1994). The data were collected in December, 2015. The result of the principal component analysis, Cronbach's alpha is summarized in Table 2.

## RESULTS

### Profile of Respondents

Majority of the respondents were female (59%), more than half of the respondents (55%) were between the ages of 21 and 30 years. Less than 50% of the respondents are married and some are widowed (3%). The educational qualification of the respondents shows that 9 out of 10 respondents possess tertiary education qualification (90%). The summary of the respondents' profile is shown in Table 1.

**Table 1: Respondents Demographics Characteristics**

Variable	Description	Frequency	Valid Percent	Mean	Standard Deviation
Sex	Male	148	40.7	1.60	0.51
	Female	216	59.3		
Age	< 20 yrs	28	7.7	2.42	0.84
	21 - 30 yrs	199	54.7		
	31 - 40 yrs	106	29.1		
	41 - 50 yrs	19	5.2		
	>50 years	12	3.3		
Marital Status	Married	163	45.2	1.58	0.55
	Single	187	51.8		
	Widowed	11	3.0		
Educational Qualification	Tertiary education	328	90.1	1.10	0.30
	Secondary education	36	9.9		
N = 364					

*Source: Primary data*

### Principal Component Analysis

Principal component analysis (varimax rotation), extraction method was applied to the data. Items that did not load on any factor ( $< 0.5$ ) were removed. The first four components displayed eigenvalues greater than 1, and the results of a scree test suggest that the four components are significant. Therefore, the four components were retained. The factors account for 67.3% of total variance explained. Six items loading highly on the first factor were associated with *transparency* and account for 41.7% of explained variances while three items loaded highly on the second factor and are associated with *access*, the factors account



for 11.7% of the explained variance. The third factor consists of four items relating to *risk assessment* and accounts for 7.3% of the explained variance. Finally, four items loaded highly the fourth factor and are associated with *dialog* and accounts for 6.6% of the explained variance. One statement “My PFA recognizes the competence of its customers base” had a low loading (0.43) less than 0.5 and was dropped. The Cronbach’s alpha was computed to measure the internal reliability of the factors. All factors had internal reliability between .78 and .85 ( $\alpha > .70$ ; Nunnally, 1970).

**Table 2: DART-Model Principal Component Analysis**

Component Label	Items	Factor Loading	Cronbach’s “ $\alpha$ ”	Variance Explained (%)
Transparency	My PFA is open on pension investment and returns	.787		
	My PFA is open with information about its service systems and processes	.765		
	My PFA is open about pension administration fees and costs	.705		
	My PFA is transparent in their dealings with customers	.666		
	My PFA allows customers access to information on their ratings and performance.	.659	.85	41.7
Access	My PFA allows me access to information and tools I need to experience services	.802		
	My PFA provides me online access for service delivery	.783		
	My PFA allows me access to resources to suggest ways of services delivery	.774	.78	11.7
Risk Assessment	My PFA provides appropriate methods for me to assess risk involved in my dealings	.789		
	I am well informed of the risks involved in my pension fund investments	.677		
	I am willing to commit to creating desired value with my PFA even if it is risky	.619		
	My PFA should tell me about the risk involved in any business	.552	.79	7.3



Dialogue	My PFA engages in interactive dialogue with its customers	.815		
	My PFA uses different medium to communicate with its customers	.732		
	My PFA interacts with its customers to learn from them	.500		
	Interacting with my PFA gives me a sense of belonging	.653	.75	6.6

Note:  $p = 0.001$ ; extraction Method: Principal Component Analysis. Rotation Method: Varimax with Kaiser Normalization; variance explained 67.2%

Source: Primary data

### Hypotheses Testing

Multiple regression analysis was used to test the stated hypotheses. Overall, the result show that the model is a good fit ( $F[4, 361] = 12.49, p < 0.00$ ) and explains 14 percent of the variation in the dependent variable. All Variance Inflation Factor (VIF) is less than 5; therefore, our analysis is free from multicollinearity problem. However, as indicated in table 3, the predictor variables transparency, dialogue, and access had significant positive regression weights, indicating that customer value co-creation significantly influence customer loyalty. However, customers' risk-benefit trades off show a positive but insignificant effect. For the regression coefficients, Dialogue had the most prominent effect on customer loyalty and was found to be statistically significant ( $\beta = 0.27, p < 0.001$ ) thus, hypothesis 1 was accepted. Access was also found to statistically significant ( $\beta = 0.14, < 0.01$ ) thus, hypothesis 2 is accepted. Risk assessment was found to be statistically not significant ( $\beta = 0.09, p < 0.05$ ) thus hypothesis 3 is rejected. Dialogue had the most prominent effect on customer loyalty and was found to be statistically significant ( $\beta = 0.27, p < 0.001$ ) thus, hypothesis 4 is accepted. Finally, transparency was also found to be statistically significant ( $\beta = 0.11, p < 0.05$ ) thus, hypothesis 1 is accepted

**Table 3: Regression results**

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients		Sig.	Collinearity Statistics	
	B	Std. Error	Beta	t		Tolerance	VIF
1 (Constant)	1.272	.463		2.745	.006		
Transparency	.115	.050	.113	2.279	.023	.989	1.011
Access	.176	.064	.140	2.749	.006	.935	1.069
Risk Assessment	.088	.049	.093	1.803	.072	.914	1.094
Dialogue	.302	.059	.265	5.081	.000	.887	1.127

a. Dependent Variable: Customer Loyalty



## DISCUSSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

In this study, the DART model of value co-creation proposed by Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004) is empirically investigated using pension service firms. The findings provide support for the effect of value co-creation on customer loyalty and sustainable advantage supporting Ballantyne & Varey (2006) assertions. In other words, the findings empirically demonstrate that value co-creation leads to customer loyalty through dialogue, access, risk assessment and transparency.

The finding from this study provides support for the effect of value co-creation on customer loyalty and empirical evidence to support some of the theoretical proposition of the service dominant logic. The dominance and the significant effect of dialogue on customer loyalty support Baumann & Le Meunier (2015) emphasis of dialogue as the 'nucleus' of co-creation and Tynan et al. (2010). The finding further confirms Ballantyne and Varey (2006) assertions and some of the foundation premise proposed by Vargo and Lusch (2004). Therefore, dialoguing with customers during service encounters contributes to customers' co-creation experiences and provides opportunity for mutual learning and trust building. When customers are involved in deep level of interactive engagement with the service employees, customers learn of the service processes and systems of the service firm and are willing to commit to the firm and recommend it to others. The implication of this finding suggests the need for pension service providers to facilitate value co-creating activities with customers by providing platform such as corporate blogs, discussion forum and social media for customers to share, learn, communicate and interactively dialogue with service employees and extract value. For example, IBTC pensions incentivize its customers to participate in interactive dialogue and co-create value through its on-line social media platforms. In addition, pension service firms can facilitate the creation of on-line communities around their service brand, such on-line communities require the participation of providers to mitigate and control interactive contents and risks capable of arising from such communities.

In a similar vein, customers' wants access to pension service providers' tools and information to co-create value. This is evident in the significant relationship between access and customer loyalty. This finding corroborates earlier findings by Jakkola and Alexander (2014) and Suh and Lee (2005) who argued that access to providers' system and processes increases customers competencies in solving problems and completing task; Also findings by Fuller (2009) shows that tool support (access) are very important for customers to experience enjoyable and rewarding virtual environments. As resource integrators, customers need access to providers' resources and these resources needs to be integrated and applied through exchange processes to co-create value. The findings also lend support to the theoretically assertion by Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004) that firms which provide deep access to the company's resources and processes enables a range of experiences for the customer thereby making such customers involved in the co-creation of value. The implication of this finding is that enabling customers' access to information and tools such as pension providers' web environment, corporate bog, social media, financial reports etc will increase customers active engagement with the firm, provide a sense of belonging in the process of service provision and value exchange which enhances customer loyalty.

Baquer (2006) find that customers are willing to purchase a co-produced product when the risk of co-production is known to them. This contradicts our findings which indicate that risk assessment does not have any significant effect on customer loyalty. A plausible explanation





for the non-significant effect of risk assessment is that customers are risk averse when it comes to financial decisions especially with regard to pension fund which ought to provide financial and social security during retirement. Customers would rather pension firms disclose information about pensions services and process but may not be willing to make risk-benefit tradeoff. They would rather leave it for the expert. Nevertheless, risk assessment contributes simultaneously with dialogue, access and transparency to customer loyalty and will require consideration in the build up to customer value co-creation. This implies that informing customers of pension savings and investment risks may not be a worthwhile strategy for value co-creation and sustainable advantage.

Transparency was also found to positively predict customer loyalty. This finding contradicts Baqer (2006) but supports Terho et al. (2012) who argue that transparency builds trust and increases customers' commitment. In addition, the finding supports Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004) assertion, which states that information transparency builds trust between firms and customers. The finding suggests that when pension firms are open, providing offers truthfully, transparently and fully disclosing every information the customers need to make informed decisions and co-create value, the customers will be committed to the firm and will be willing to recommend the firm to others. Customers want pension firms to be forthcoming with information on pension investments and returns, its systems and processes, fees and costs and information on their ratings and performance to extract value during service encounters. It is when firms provide symmetry information that they can enjoy competitive advantage such as customer loyalty

## CONCLUSIONS

The dialogue building block has more predictive effect on customer loyalty than access, transparency and risk assessment. Also, enabling customers' access to firms' resources leads to customer loyalty. Customers' want access to information exclusive to the service provider, they also want access to tools such as a virtual environment and other operant resources from the service provider to enable them engage in co-creation of service and share knowledge. Transparency in dealings with customers builds trust and influences customer loyalty. Thus, customers expect service firms to deal transparently in all transactions, willingly offer assistance to customers and provide prompt services. Finally, in as much as customers co-create value with pension service firms, they are not willing to suffer harm that might arise from co-creation activities. However, they want access to information about business risks including financial, personal and societal risks.

## LIMITATION AND SUGGESTION FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The study has several limitations. First, the method for item generation is not robust. However, the scales were sufficiently validated and reliable. Future studies may use a robust method to generate measurement items. Furthermore, the scale may need to be tested using different service context or product. Second, only the customers' view of value co-creation was investigated. Since co-creation is joint activity facilitated by the firm, future studies may incorporate both consumers and service providers to gain a more comprehensive and robust understanding of the applicability of the model in various industries. Other members of the



value chain such as regulators and intermediaries may be also incorporated into further studies. Third, this study is limited to the effect of co-creation on loyalty. Its effect on satisfaction was not studied which could mediate the effect on loyalty as such future studies should incorporate satisfaction as a mediator to customer loyalty. Finally, care must be taken in adopting the findings of this study due to the weak explanatory power of the predictors. Thus, future studies should increase include more items on the variables and test the various combinations of the DART dimensions on marketing outcome.

## REFERENCES

- Abbas, H.A., & Hamdy, H.I. (2015). Determinants of continuance intention factor in Kuwait communication market: Case study of Zain-Kuwait. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 49, 648-657.
- Alves, H., Fernandes, C., & Raposo, M. (2016). Value co-creation: Concept and contexts of application and study. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(5), 1626–1633. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2015.10.029>
- Anderson, E. W. & Mittal, V. (2000). Strengthening the Satisfaction-Profit Chain. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(November), 107-120.
- Anderson, E.W., Fornell, C. & Mazvancheryl, S. K. (2004). ‘Customer Satisfaction and Shareholder Value. *Journal of Marketing*, 68 (October), 172-185.
- Arnould, E. (2005). Animating the big middle. *Journal of Retailing*, 81(2), 89–96. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jretai.2005.03.001>.
- Auh, S., Bell, S.J., McLeod, C.S. & Shih, E. (2007). Co-production and Customer Loyalty in Financial Services. *Journal of Retailing*, 83(3), 359–70.
- Ballantyne, D., & Varey, R. J. (2006). Creating value-in-use through marketing interaction: The exchange logic of relating, communicating and knowing. *Marketing Theory*, 6(3), 335–348. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593106066795>
- Baqer, S. M. (2006). The value of customer co-production in developing new products, (December). Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/304905865?accountid=51189>
- Baumann, J., & Le Meunier-FitzHugh, K. (2015). Making value co-creation a reality – exploring the co-creative value processes in customer–salesperson interaction. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 31(3–4), 289–316. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2014.956137>
- Bendapudi, N., & Leone, R. P. (2003). Psychological implications of customer participation in co-production. *Journal of Marketing*, 67(1), 14–28
- Cova, B., & Dallı, D. (2009). Working consumers: The next step in marketing theory? *Marketing Theory*, 9(3), 315–339. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593109338144>
- Cova, B., Dallı, D., & Zwick, D. (2011). Critical perspectives on consumers’ role as “producers”: Broadening the debate on value co-creation in marketing processes. *Marketing Theory*, 11(3), 231–241. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593111408171>
- Dong, B., Evans, K. R., & Zou, S. (2008). The effects of customer participation in co-created service recovery. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 36(1), 123–137. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11747-007-0059-8>
- Etgar, M. (2006). Co-Production of Services,” in the Service- Dominant Logic of Marketing: Dialog, Debate, and Directions, Robert F. Lusch and Stephen L. Vargo, eds., Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 128–138.



- Flores, J., & Vasquez-Parraga, A. Z. (2015). The impact of choice on co-produced customer value creation and satisfaction. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 32(1), 15–25. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JCM-04-2014-0931>
- Fuller, J., Muhlbacher, H., Matzler, K. & Jawecki, G. (2009). Consumer empowerment through internet-based co-creation. *Journal of Management Information Systems*, 26(3), 71-102.
- Galvagno, M., & Dalli, D. (2014). Theory of value co-creation: A systematic literature review. *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, 24(6), 643–683. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/MSQ-09-2013-0187>
- Gronroos, C. (1994). From Marketing Mix to Relationship Marketing: Towards a Paradigm Shift in Marketing. *Asia-Australian Marketing Journal*, 2 (1), 9-29
- Gronroos, C. (2000). Service Management and Marketing: A Customer Relationship Management Approach. West Sussex, UK: Wiley.
- Grönroos, C. (2011b). Value co-creation in service logic: A critical analysis. *Marketing Theory*, 11(3), 279–301. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593111408177>
- Grönroos, C., & Voima, P. (2013). Critical service logic: Making sense of value creation and co-creation. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 41(2), 133–150. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11747-012-0308-3>
- Gummerus, J. (2013). Value creation processes and value outcomes in marketing theory strangers or siblings?, *Marketing Theory* 13(1), 19-46.
- Gupta, S. & Zeithaml, V. (2006). Customer metrics and their impact for financial performance. *Marketing science*, 25(6), 7-18.
- Heinonen, K., & Strandvik, T. (2015). Customer-dominant logic: foundations and implications. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 29(6/7), 472–484. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSM-02-2015-0096>
- Heinonen, S., & Ruotsalainen, J. (2012). Toward the Age of Neo-Entrepreneurs. *World Futures Review*, 4(2), 123–133. <https://doi.org/10.1177/194675671200400216>
- Jaakkola, E., & Alexander, M. (2014). The Role of Customer Engagement Behavior in Value Co-Creation: A Service System Perspective. *Journal of Service Research*, 17(3), 247–261. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094670514529187>
- Luo, N., Zhang, M., & Liu, W. (2015). The effects of value co-creation practices on building harmonious brand community and achieving brand loyalty on social media in China. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 48, 492–499. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2015.02.020>
- Lusch, R. F., & Vargo, S. L. (2006). Service-dominant logic: Reactions, reflections and refinements. *Marketing Theory*, 6(3), 281–288. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593106066781>
- Neghina, C., Caniëls, M. C. J., Bloemer, J. M. M., & van Birgelen, M. J. H. (2015). Value cocreation in service interactions: Dimensions and antecedents. *Marketing Theory*, 15(2), 221–242. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593114552580>
- Nunnally, J. C., & Bernstein, I. (1994). Psychometric theory (3rd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill
- Ojiaku, C.O., Olise, M.C., & Nwankwo, P.A. (2015) Customer expectation and service performance in pension fund administration (PFA) in Southeast Nigeria. *Business and Economic Research*, 5(2), 191- 206
- Oliver, R. L. (1999). Whence consumer loyalty? *Journal of Marketing*, 63(4), 33–44.
- Osei-Frimpong, K., & Osei-Frimpong, K. (2016). Examining the effects of patient characteristics and prior value needs on the patient-doctor encounter process in



- healthcare service delivery. *International Journal of Pharmaceutical and Healthcare Marketing* 10(2), 192-213
- Payne, A. F., Storbacka, K., & Frow, P. (2008). Managing the co-creation of value. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 36(1), 83–96. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11747-007-0070-0>
- Prahalad, C. K., & Ramaswamy, V. (2004a). Co-creation experiences: The next practice in value creation. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 18(3), 5–14. <https://doi.org/10.1002/dir.20015>
- Prahalad, C. K., & Ramaswamy, V. (2004b). Co-creating unique value with customers. *Strategy & Leadership*, 32(3), 4–9. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10878570410699249>
- Ramírez, R. (1999). Value co-production: Intellectual origins and implications for practice and research. *Strategic Management Journal*, 20(1), 49–65. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1097-0266\(199901\)20:1<49::AID-SMJ20>3.0.CO;2-2](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1097-0266(199901)20:1<49::AID-SMJ20>3.0.CO;2-2)
- Randall, W.S., Gravier, M.J. and Prybutok, V.R. (2011). Connection, Trust, and Commitment: Dimensions of Co-creation. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 19(1), 3–24.
- Ranjan, K. R., & Read, S. (2016). Value co-creation: concept and measurement. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 44(3), 290–315. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11747-014-0397-2>
- Roser, T., Samson, A., Cruz-Valdivieso, E., & Humphreys, P. (2009). Co-creation : New pathways to value An overview. *Promise Corporation*, 22. Retrieved from [http://personal.lse.ac.uk/samsona/cocreation\\_report.pdf](http://personal.lse.ac.uk/samsona/cocreation_report.pdf)
- Saarijärvi, H. (2012). The mechanisms of value co-creation. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 20(5), 381–391. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0965254X.2012.671339>
- Shaw, C. & Ivens, J. (2002). Building great customer experiences. London: Palgrave.
- Sohby, M., Winklhofer, H. & Hibbert, S. (2009). Managing customer participation through customer education. The 2009 Naples Forum on Services: service-dominant logic, service science, and network theory, Capri, June 16–19.
- Suh, K.-S. & Lee, Y. E. (2005). The effects of virtual reality on consumer learning: An empirical investigation. *MIS Quarterly*, 29(4), 673-697.
- Terho, H., Haas, A., Eggert, A. & Ulaga, W. (2012). It's almost like taking the sales out of selling'-towards a conceptualization of value-based selling in business markets. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 41(1), 174-185.
- Tynan, C., McKechnie, S., & Chhuon, C. (2010). Co-creating value for luxury brands. *Journal of Business Research*, 63(11), 1156–1163. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2009.10.012>
- Vargo, S. L., & Lusch, R. F. (2004). The Four Service Marketing Myths: Remnants of a Goods-Based, Manufacturing Model. *Journal of Service Research*, 6(4), 324–335. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094670503262946>
- Vargo, S. L., Maglio, P. P., & Akaka, M. A. (2008). On value and value co-creation: A service systems and service logic perspective. *European Management Journal*, 26(3), 145–152. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emj.2008.04.003>
- Yi, Y., & Gong, T. (2013). Customer value co-creation behavior: Scale development and validation. *Journal of Business Research*, 66(9), 1279–1284. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2012.02.026>